

North York Moors National Park Authority

District/Borough: Scarborough Borough Council
Parish: Eskdaleside-Cum-Ugglebarnby

Application No. NYM/2019/0157/FL

Proposal: construction 1 no. local occupancy letting dwelling with associated access, parking and amenity space

Location: 6 The Cliff, Iburndale

Decision Date: 28 May 2019

Extended to:

Consultations

Parish - Object with the following comments:

Overdevelopment and inappropriate development in the front garden of No 6
Construction materials not in keeping with rest of area

Highways – In assessing the submitted proposals and reaching its recommendation the Local Highway Authority has taken into account the following matters:

The design shows a location for parking associated with the proposed dwelling but it does not show how this space will be accessed. If the access to this parking area is via the existing private drive, the LHA would have no objections if this application is conditioned to remain ancillary to the main residence. Alternatively, if the access is to be gained directly from The Cliff, a new access will be required to be constructed. In addition to constructing the access, the existing fence will be blocking the required visibility splay for drivers exiting this access and will therefore be required to be adjusted.

Consequently the Local Highway Authority recommends that if approved, conditions relating to the above are attached.

Yorkshire Water -

Environmental Health Officer – 5/04/2019 -I hereby confirm that I have no objections on environmental health or housing grounds.

Site Notice/Advertisement Expiry Date – 17 May 2019

Others –

Robert Crosbie, 4 The Cliff, Iburndale.

The above application has been drawn to my attention and I would like to make the following observations.

1. The site area hatched red on the application location plan does not accord with the detailed plans showing the house footprint and this is misleading as it misrepresents the size of the site.
2. The house is too large for the site by way of siting, mass and prominence. In its current form this will severely detract from the village appearance and scale and significantly damage the visual amenity of the area and increase the risk of injury collisions (vehicles and pedestrians).
3. The house proposed is of poor aesthetic design given the surroundings and requirement previously insisted upon by the Planning Authority in connection with other development in the area.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0157/FL

4. Visibility splays are inadequate for any intensification of use of this access. Traffic speeds and visibility both ways cannot be improved to accord with recognised highway requirements in the manual for streets, particularly in view of the traffic approaching down the hill.

5. Car parking indicated on the supplied plan is both not possible (front) as the size indicated is wholly inadequate, and car parking to the rear is not included in the indicated application area and could not be included in the permission.

6. There is no available on street parking as available parking is occupied by a local resident. Parking elsewhere on the highway would further exacerbate difficult traffic conditions in the village in this position.

7. The proposal does not have sufficient amenity to be suitable for continuous use as a residence by a local resident.

I do not feel that the proposal as submitted has sufficient quality to be approved and would be obliged if you would take these points into consideration.

Karen Noble, 4A the Cliff, Iburndale

I write to object to this application. I live in the cottage next door and believe a development of this nature contravenes the principles of the design guide and would have a significant impact on the lovely hamlet of Iburndale.

Design and appearance of the development

The proposal is different in form to the prominent form of the characterful buildings nearby. Iburndale is made up of predominantly locally quarried stands alone farmhouses and cottages, whereas this proposed building is not. What is proposed is a modern, rendered block property with large modern windows and doors and a design that is far from anything in the National Park. Nearby buildings are generally rows of 3-4 cottages or farmhouses, not individual detached, single fronted houses.

Property size and Positioning

The position in which this property is placed will invade the privacy, overlooking and overshadowing properties on both sides.

I don't believe that the site proposed would allow enough space for sufficient car parking and storage of refuse waste. The existing property on the site already uses the space proposed for parking for vehicles. I believe that proposed position if the building is too close to the road and would be better placed closer to the existing property and made to look like an annexe to the main house or as a detached garage.

Architectural detail

The development does not fit into its surroundings. There are no buildings on Iburndale with wood cladding and no buildings on the roadside with a rendered block finish. It would be more appropriate to have a locally quarried sandstone finish. The roof should be either slate or pantiles.

The glazed panels with wood in between wouldn't match the design of neighbouring properties and wood look too modern.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0157/FL

Drainage Capacity

The houses in Iburndale experience regular issues from blocked drains with Yorkshire Water being called out regularly to sort the problem. I am concerned that additional strain on the system without appropriate assessments first would only add to the problem for Iburndale residents.

Please note that there is a history of rejected application in close vicinity of this proposed location and this development, if approved, would set a precedent meaning it could be difficult to reject future proposal of a similar nature, which I believe would have a negative impact of the street scene of Iburndale and the surrounding National Park.

Julie Milnes, Cliff Farm, 8 The Cliff, Iburndale

I am writing to offer my strong objections to the proposed building which is to effectively be built on the very small area which is now the front lawn at 6 The Cliff, Iburndale. The front garden of this property has already been turned into a tarmac car parking area for the residents 3 or four cars, the rest of the garden has been landscaped with coloured stone chipping, leaving the only green area as a small lawn (In effect the proposed building plot). The style of the building is not in any shape or form in keeping with the housing on that building line, which are quaint cottages. This building is stated to be for local letting but there is no room for a large shed or a garage for a permanent resident, and therefore as a two bedroom property, it cannot offer any outside storage to house necessary items for a permanent resident/ family. By allowing planning for this building you will be setting a precedent for anyone else wishing to build on that building line in Iburndale. To allow a property of that sort to be built in that location would ruin the look of this small hamlet. Had the proposed site been tucked away down a driveway it would be a different matter, or had it been designed as a small characterful cottage built in reclaimed stone as the cottage that is attached to Wren Cottage has been, along with a garage to support modern permanent living needs (this cottage is positioned to the right of the proposed development and looks in keeping with surrounding buildings) then this would be a suitable development of the plot. If this house is built, who is going to make sure it has a local person renting it, as in my opinion it is only suitable as a holiday let and I am fully aware that the National Park does not sanction new build holiday let's.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0157/FL

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Reason(s) for Refusal

1	The site, located within Iburndale, is considered to be outside of the any settlement listed in the National Park's Settlement Hierarchy and as such lies within open countryside for new housing purposes. The development of this plot would be considered to be wholly out of keeping with the form and grain of the pattern of development within the locality. If permitted, this tandem form of development would not only result in the loss of an open space, it would urbanise and intensify the density of development in the locality which would be considered to be out of keeping and detrimental to the verdant rural character of the environment and landscape of this part of the North York Moors National Park.
2	Core Policy J seeks to ensure that the limited opportunities for housing development in villages are restricted to proposals supporting the development of local needs housing and requires applicants to demonstrate that the needs of the identified occupant are genuine, that the proposal represents the most practical and sustainable. It has not been demonstrated that there is need for a local occupancy dwelling at this location.
3	The development, by means of its scale, height, massing, materials and design is not considered to preserve or enhance the streetscene or vernacular setting that contribute to the character and quality of the wider environment. As a result, the development would result in the loss of an open space which is considered to contribute to the amenity, character and setting of the wider setting of Iburndale contrary to the provisions of Development Policy 3 of the North York Moors Core Strategy and Development Plan Policies.
4	If approved, the proposal would make it increasingly difficult for the Local Planning Authority to resist future applications for new housing on inappropriate sites which would cumulatively pose a major threat to the character, special qualities and distinctiveness of the more rural settlements of the National Park and therefore have a detrimental impact the wider landscape of the Park, contrary to the aims of Core Policy B of the North York Moors Core Strategy and Development Plan Policies.



Application Number: NYM/2019/0157/FL

Background

6 The Cliff, Iburndale is located to the south of the road leading towards UGGLEBARNBY. The property is set well back off the road frontage. To the north of the property is the access road which slopes down toward the main road through Iburndale and a strip of grass edged by a stone wall which constitutes the garden area and the site to be considered under this application.

The property comprises a modern one and a half storey bungalow with attached garage to the side. The property is located within substantial grounds, the neighbouring properties either side are positioned between the application site and the road.

This application seeks approval for the construction of a detached local occupancy dwelling to be retained in the same ownership as the main house and will be rented out although no details of the proposed occupant has been provided.

The proposed dwelling would occupy the area of grass to the north of the access driveway and would have a footprint of 10.8m by 5.6m. The width of the full plot is 7.6m wide and once a flat site has been created a 2m retaining wall will be required to the rear of the property. The proposed property is a tall narrow building, measuring 6.7m high and would be constructed of render and York stone (although the areas of each are not indicated) with timber panelling detailing and a the roof is proposed as either black slate or red pantiles. The ground floor is an open plan kitchen/living space and the two first floor bedrooms and bathroom are served by gable end windows and rooflights.

The property is proposed to be set back 3-4m from the highway at the front of the site and a 1.7m strip is proposed to the rear to provide an external patio/garden space, before a 2m retaining wall to take account of the slope of the site. Space for parking is shown within the strip in front of the house and also within the existing curtilage of the Main property.

Main Issues

Applications for new dwellings whether for sale or rented are considered against Core Policy J of the Local Development Framework. In terms of the design of the proposed unit guidance is offered under Development Policy 3.

Core Policy CPJ of the Local Development Framework seeks to ensure the provision of a mixture of housing types and tenure to maintain the vitality of local communities, consolidate support for services and facilities and support the delivery of more affordable housing. This is to be achieved through locating all open market housing, including new build and converted units to the Local Service Centre of Helmsley and the Service Villages, as well as other measures including supporting the development of local needs housing within the main built up area of the local service villages and other villages, and restricting new housing development in the Open Countryside to that which is proven as essential for farming, forestry or other essential land management activities.

Development Policy 3 seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park by ensuring that the siting, layout and density of development preserves or enhances views into and out of the site; that the scale, height, massing, materials and design are compatible with surrounding buildings; that the standards of design details are high and complements that of the local vernacular; good quality sustainable design and construction techniques are incorporated; that there is satisfactory landscaping and that the

Application Number: NYM/2019/0157/FL

design takes into account the safety, security and access needs for all potential users of the development.

Iburndale is not classed as a settlement in the Authority's Settlement Hierarchy and therefore would be classed as open countryside where housing would only be allowed for rural workers, on acceptable plots, where justification for the need has been provided. In this instance the applicant has stated that they wish to apply for a local occupancy letting dwelling but has not provided any information of who would occupy it. This is therefore contrary to the Policy requirements.

The proposed plot is a small, narrow site located in front is a more modern backland development in Iburndale. The settlement pattern in Iburndale is one of traditional cottages, terraces and farmhouses located around the junction with more modern development along the periphery and in backland locations. The dwelling proposed would be located in a prominent forward location which would be visible as you approach the site from the west. The dwelling would be significantly larger and set further forward than the traditionally proportioned garage which is set in a forward location on the adjacent site.

The boundary of the site with the highway is currently a low traditional stone wall which it is presumed would have to be removed to create the space for off road parking indicated on the plans which is regrettable. The Highway Officer has made two recommendations as it is unclear how the site will be accessed from the proposed plans; however each could be conditioned if the development were consider to be acceptable.

The design of the proposed unit bears no resemblance of the any of the traditional properties in the locality, and would occupy a prominent location on the road frontage. The scale of development is tight on the site with little amenity space surrounding it. The proposed design is very tall and narrow with a distinctly vertical emphasis created by large glazed openings and large rooflights. The use of render in this location is also considered to be inappropriate in this location where surrounding properties are predominantly of traditional stone and pantile construction. The design of the building therefore fails to meet any of the requirements in terms of appropriate design of Development Policy 3.

The proposal is recommended for refusal as the site is not considered to be appropriate for development of a local occupancy dwelling under Core Policy J and the proposed design is considered to be inappropriate for the setting in terms of scale, height, massing, materials and design and is not considered to complement the local vernacular.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and concluded that the scheme represents a form of development so far removed from the vision of the sustainable development supported in the Development Plan that no changes could be negotiated to render the scheme acceptable and thus no changes were requested.