From:	<u>Building</u>
To:	Hilary Saunders; Planning
Subject:	NYM/2020/0140/FL - Grove Cottage
Date:	08 April 2020 09:58:50

Thank you for forwarding the additional information requested regarding the appearance and condition of the brick elevation at Grove Cottage.

From the information provided it is clear that the brick is historic and from their dimensions are likely to be late 18th to early 19th century in date. It is considered that the use of brick conveys the history of the building and contribute to its architectural character and that of the wider Conservation Area. It is suspected that the front façade was constructed in brick so as to contrast the secondary stone elevations, as at this time brick was considered to be a superior material. This is a vernacular building of great charm and the stone, brick and pantile are vernacular materials. As such the use of brick is totally appropriate for this area and the exposed bricks appear to be in good condition with no indication of any structural failure in the elevation. As such their loss would be harmful to the character of this building and the wider Conservation Area, and in accordance with para.194 of the NPPF I see no justification for their loss.

Replacing the historic building materials of historic buildings is incompatible with preserving significance of heritage assets. Historic England's principles of repair: "A conservative approach is fundamental to good conservation - so retaining as much of the significant historic fabric and keeping changes to a minimum are of key importance when carrying out repair work to historic buildings. The unnecessary replacement of historic fabric, no matter how carefully the work is carried out, can in most situations have an adverse effect on character and significance."

Whilst the harm would be less than substantial (para.196) any harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use. The building is in sound condition and is occupied and as such I do not see any wider public benefit as a result of this application.

The removal of the paint to expose the brick would be an enhancement but should only be done using non-abrasive methods (Dof/Torc or poultice with test area). Sandblasting would cause catastrophic damage to the brick and should not be a technique used in this instance. Any bricks which are of poor condition should be replaced on a like for like basis. ACS

From:	<u>Planning</u>
To:	<u>Planning</u>
Subject:	Comments on NYM/2020/0140/FL - Case Officer Mrs H Saunders - Received from Building Conservation at The Old Vicarage, Bondgate, Helmsley, York, YO62 5BP,
Date:	24 March 2020 14:52:17

The draft Fylingthorpe Conservation Area Appraisal provides a good account of the historic and architectural character of the Fylingthorpe Conservation Area. It states that the majority of buildings in the Conservation Area are not listed but appear to be 18th and 19th century in date and face the street front. Most are constructed of well-dressed honey coloured sandstone, much of it with herringbone tooling, although there are a few brick buildings. There are some painted facades and pebble dash but these are not characteristic. As such, the removal of the painted finish to the walls is supported however the use of brick is considered to be appropriate in this location and is a detail which contributes to the character of the Conservation Area.

Under s.72 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act, in exercising its planning functions the Authority shall pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the Area.

As stated previously, Grove Cottage is a good example of a traditional multi-phased building within the Fylingthorpe Conservation Area. The mixture of stonework and brick provides evidence of the evolution of the site and the ability to read the development of this building. Such details/features can often be historic and the loss of this evidence can harm the historic character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

As expressed in para.193 of the NPPF any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (the Conservation Area) should require clear and convincing justification.

From the information put forward, I am not convinced that sufficient justification has been put forward, other than the brick is in a poor state of repair, however no evidence has been provided of this. The surrounding brick buildings and boundary wall are constructed of a good quality, historic handmade brick and therefore while it is likely that the façade of the property was re-faced using the same materials it is difficult to assess the age, quality or condition of the brickwork because of its painted finish. Therefore would it be possible to see an area of paintwork removed so that an assessment of the brick underneath could be made? Once a clearer understanding of the quality and age of the brick can be made, we can then fully understand its significance. This should be carried out and re-consulted on before any decision is made on this application.

Comments made by Building Conservation of The Old Vicarage Bondgate Helmsley York YO62 5BP

Preferred Method of Contact is: Post

Comment Type is Request Additional Information Letter ID: 540295

NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL BUSINESS and ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES

LOCAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY CONSIDERATIONS and RECOMMENDATION

Application	No:			NYM20/0140/FL
Proposed Development:		variation of condition 2 (material amendment) of planning approval NYM/2019/0347/FL to allow replacement stonework to front wall of the dwelling (resubmission following refusal of NYM/2019/0700/FL)		
Location:		Grove Cottage, Thorpe Bank, Fylingthorpe		
Applicant:		Mrs Alison Calvert		
CH Ref:			Case Office	r: Ged Lyth
Area Ref:		4/29/691A	Tel:	01609 780780
County Road	d No:		E-mail:	k
То:	North York Mo Authority The Old Vicar Bondgate Helmsley YO62 5BP	oors National Park age	Date:	24 March 2020
FAO:	Hilary Saunde	ers	Copies to:	

On the clear understanding that condition 10 of NYM/2019/0347/FL regarding the visibility splay is still achievable, there are **no local highway authority objections** to this variation.

Signed:	Issued by:
Ged Lyth	Whitby Highways Office Discovery Way Whitby North Yorkshire YO22 4PZ
For Corporate Director for Business and Environmental Services	e-mail: A

LOCAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY CONSIDERATIONS and RECOMMENDATION

Continuation sheet:

Application No:

Page 2 of 2 NYM20/0140/FL



From:To:PlanningSubject:Fylingdales Parish CouncilDate:19 March 2020 12:00:55

Good Morning,

NYM/2020/0140/FL The Parish Council object to this planning application. As previously stated this property is in a conservation area and the Council feel strongly that each property's individuality should be respected. The application would change the street view. Kind regards, Steph Glasby

Clerk to Fylingdales Parish Council