

North York Moors National Park Authority

District/Borough: Scarborough Borough Council
(North)
Parish: Fylingdales

Application No. NYM/2019/0803/LB

Proposal: Listed Building Consent for installation of replacement window and rear door together with internal alterations

Location: Kent House, 9 Bloomswell, Robin Hoods Bay

Decision Date: 23 April 2020

Extended to:

Consultations

Parish - No objections. Would prefer the door to be repaired rather than replaced.

Site Notice/Advertisement Expiry Date – 06 April 2020

Others -

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following condition(s):

1. Standard Three Year Commencement Date - Listed Building
The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
2. Strict Accordance With the Documentation Submitted or Minor Variations – Document No.s Specified The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:

Document Description	Document No.	Date Received	Application
Form	20 November 2019	20 November 2019	Location Plan
12 February 2020			
Plan Views		12 February 2020	
Existing Stud Wall		12 February 2020	
Design and Access Statement		12 February 2020	
Yorkshire Sliding Sash		21 March 2020	
Kent House Vestibule		21 March 2020	

- or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority
3. No work shall commence on the installation of the internal porch door until details of the door mouldings have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall not be carried out otherwise than in accordance with the details so approved.
 4. Trickle Vents Shall Not be incorporated into Windows
Trickle vents shall not be incorporated into any new windows hereby approved and shall not be installed thereafter unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
 5. Windows - Timber and Specify Details of Colour
All new window frames and glazing bars shall be of timber construction and coloured white within six months of the date of installation and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.

Reason(s) for Condition(s)

- 1 To ensure compliance with Sections 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended.
- 2 For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
- 3 In order to comply with NYM Development Policy 5 which seeks to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have an unacceptable impact on their special historic or architectural interest.
- 4 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 5 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB



Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB



Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB

Background

9 Bloomswell is the end property in a terrace of 9 no. Grade II listed dwellings. The property dates to the early to mid- Nineteenth Century and is constructed of brick beneath an incised render with a pantile roof. The property lies within the Robin Hood's Bay Conservation Area which is protected by an Article 4 (2) Direction. The building is of national significance as a designated asset and the wider Conservation Area also forms a designated heritage asset.

The property has undergone some alteration with the addition of Victorian 2 pane sash windows to the ground and first floor, probably replacing original windows of 16-pane sashes. Whilst these windows are not original to the building, they are high quality sashes which contribute to the history and significance of the building. The door is the original 3 fancy panel door as stated in the list description with its original door surround/canopy.

There is no planning history for the site.

This application seeks Listed Building Consent for external works including the replacement of the third floor window on the front of the elevation of the property and the replacement of the rear door. This application also seeks Listed Building Consent for internal works comprising the creation of a storage space on the ground floor through the erection of a stud wall and new doorway, alterations to the staircase on the first floor by removing the stud wall and inserting a wooden banister and the re-introduction of an internal porch on the ground floor.

Main Issues**Statutory Duties**

Section 16, paragraph 193 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance. Section 16, paragraph 194 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 goes on to state that any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.

The Authority has a statutory duty to protect Listed Buildings within the Park as they form part of the significance of the built and cultural heritage of the North York Moors. These buildings represent a significant part of the history and culture of the National Park and their considerable importance, once lost, cannot be replaced.

The Authority has a general duty in respect of listed buildings in its exercising of planning functions as set out in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB

NYMNPA Policies

The relevant policies contained within the North York Moors Core Strategy and Development Policy Document to consider in relation to this application are Development Policy 5 (Listed Buildings) and Development Policy 19 (Householder Development).

Development Policy 5 states that proposals for the alteration, extension or change of use of a Listed Building will only be permitted where they will not have an unacceptable impact on the special historic or architectural interest of the building.

Development Policy 19 supports proposals for development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings where among other things the form, position and design of the development does not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape.

Replacement Window

The Building Conservation team have advised that given the modern top opening construction of the existing second floor window, it is not considered to contribute to the special architectural or historic interest of the building and therefore its replacement with a traditional window would be supported. Such an approach is in line with Historic England guidance "Traditional Windows, Their Care, Repair and Upgrading" revised in 2017 which represents the most up to date guidance endorsed by the Government on the subject of window replacement in buildings with heritage interest. The Building Conservation Officer states that whilst the proposed two pane Victorian sash window would match the remainder of the property, it was considered that the opening would be better suited to a horizontal sliding sash. Whilst the neighbouring property (no.8) has a multipane sash in the same window, this opening has been raised which has altered its proportions. Furthermore, the list description indicates the use of Yorkshire lights to the second floors of this terrace and as such their use in no.9 would be considered to be appropriate. In response to the Building Conservation Officer's comments, the design of the window was amended to a 6 by 6 pane timber Yorkshire Sliding Sash window, which the Building Conservation Officer had no objections to.

Ground floor cupboard

The Authority's Building Conservation Officer has advised that the partitioning off of the small area to the side of the staircase is considered acceptable as at present the floor plan is not historic. The Building Conservation Officer recommended that the partition be constructed of vertical timber boards in order to replicate the historic form of room subdivision. This can then be painted or wallpapered to match the décor of the room.

The applicant has confirmed that the new wall will be a timber stud wall with tongue and groove panelling on both sides.

Bannister

The Building Conservation Officer has stated that from the site inspection it was clear that the current boarding is modern (hollow in the middle with modern bannister) and as such its replacement with spindles to match the historic spindles elsewhere in the property would not be considered harmful to the significance of the building in this instance.

Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB

The applicant has provided an image of the proposed bannister, to which no objections have been raised.

Internal Porch

The Building Conservation Officer expressed support for the reinstatement of the internal porch as these are a traditional feature of the terrace and are also found in many other properties in Robin Hoods Bay. The Officer stated that it would appear that the original internal porch was removed some time ago and possibly prior to the property being listed.

The applicant has provided drawings of the proposed internal porch, to which the Building Conservation Officer had no objections other than to request that details of the moulding to the proposed internal door be provided.

Rear Door

The Building Conservation Officer concluded that the existing rear door however is a more modern insertion, evidenced by the use of regular narrow boards in a frame. It was therefore considered that the replacement of the rear door on a like for like basis would be acceptable.

The applicant had originally also sought to replace the front door of the property, however following discussions with Officers on site and the Building Conservation Officer's recommendations that the door was historic, and very likely original to the property, this proposal was removed from the application.

Conclusion

The significance of Kent House derives from its traditional construction, modest form and traditional detailing and its architectural style when read with the remainder of the terrace. 9 Bloomswell also has aesthetic value for its layout and sense of proportion of the internal rooms where they follow the original floor plan. As such the property retains its special architectural and historic interest and makes a positive contribution to the wider Conservation Area.

The proposals contained within this application utilise traditional materials and architectural styles in accordance with Development Policy 19. The reintroduction of traditional features such as the Yorkshire Sliding Sash window, the ground floor cupboard, a more traditional bannister style, and the internal porch are all considered to enhance the significance of the Listed Building. As such this application accords with Development Policy 5 and Section 16, paragraph 193 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019.

For the reasons outlined above this application is recommended for approval.

Draft Local Plan

Strategic Policy I within the Draft Local Plan states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

CO17 within the Draft Local Plan states that development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings should take full account of the character of the local area, the special qualities of

Application Number: NYM/2019/0803/LB

the National Park and will be permitted where among other things, the form position and design of the new development does not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape.

The Draft Local Plan has not yet been adopted and so the policies referenced above may be subject to change.

Pre-commencement Conditions

Condition 3 is a pre-commencement condition and has been agreed in writing with the applicant/agent.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including the insertion of a Yorkshire Sliding Sash Window, so as to deliver sustainable development.