

North York Moors National Park Authority

Ward: Scarborough Borough Council (North)
Parish: Fylingdales

App No. NYM/2020/0237/LB

Proposal: Listed Building consent for removal of picket fencing and replacement with cast iron railings

Location: The Old Chapel, Chapel Street, Robin Hoods Bay,

Applicant: The Cove Yorkshire Ltd, 19 Collegiate Crescent, Sheffield, S10 2BA

Agent: Mr David Cottam, 9 Collegiate Crescent, Sheffield, S10 2BA

Date for Decision: 12/06/2020

Extended to: Grid Ref:

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following condition(s):

1.	TIME02	Standard Three Year Commencement Date - Listed Building									
2.	PLAN01	<p>The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:</p> <table border="1"><thead><tr><th>Document Description</th><th>Document No.</th><th>Date Received</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Site Plan</td><td></td><td>16 July 2020</td></tr><tr><td>Cast Iron Railing Details</td><td></td><td>14 July 2020</td></tr></tbody></table> <p>or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.</p>	Document Description	Document No.	Date Received	Site Plan		16 July 2020	Cast Iron Railing Details		14 July 2020
Document Description	Document No.	Date Received									
Site Plan		16 July 2020									
Cast Iron Railing Details		14 July 2020									
3.	MATS00	The railings hereby approved shall be black painted cast iron and thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.									

Informative(s)

1.	MISCINF05	Planning permission has also been granted for this development. You are advised to obtain sight of the notice of planning permission and the approved plans and ensure that the development is carried out strictly in accordance with the approved plans and the terms and conditions of the planning permission.
----	-----------	--

Application Number: NYM/2020/0237/LB

Reason(s) for Condition(s)

1.	TIME02	To ensure compliance with Sections 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended.
2.	PLAN01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
3.	MATS03	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Development Policy 5 which seek to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have any unacceptable impact on the special architectural or historic interest of the building.

Consultations

Parish – No objection

Site Notice/Advertisement Expiry Date – 16 June 2020

Others - Mr Patrick Holdsworth, 3 Thorpe Lane, Robin Hoods Bay – wishes to comment that this historic building is sited in an important conservation area. The iron railings are in keeping with the village, the glass balustrade is totally out of keeping with both the building and the village, more twentieth century.



Application Number: NYM/2020/0237/LB**Background**

This application relates to a former Wesleyan Chapel, one of the earlier ones in the area. Like many non-conformist chapels of the time it is quite plain in design with double height windows to the principal façade. To the rear the fenestration is clearly distinct from other nearby domestic properties, presumably due to floor heights and sloping gallery.

This application seeks to replace the existing picket fence to the upper and lower terraces to the rear of the chapel that site above the sea wall with cast iron railings. Initially a glass balustrade was proposed to the lower café terrace however following concerns expressed by the Building Conservation Officer this has been replaced by cast iron railing to match those proposed to the upper garden terrace. The design of the railings has also been amended and simplified to reflect the location to the rear of a Wesleyan chapel rather than a high status residential property.

There is a companion application for planning permission.

Main Issues

The relevant policies of the Core Strategy and Development Policies Document are considered to be Development Policy 4 (Conservation Areas) and Development Policy 5 (Listed Buildings).

The Building Conservation Officer has expressed concern that cast iron railings are not typical of a Wesleyan chapel and whilst there are examples in the conservation area these are predominately original and associated with buildings that are domestic, 19th century or later, and to the street frontages. The use of such ornamentation on other chapels is known but these tend to be later 19th century developments and only to the principal façade. The current character of the rear of the building that faces the sea is very informal, much akin to

Application Number: NYM/2020/0237/LB

the rest of Robin Hoods Bay. Any formalisation or gentrification of this space with decorative railings could not only harm the character of the listed building but also that of the conservation area by placing an emphasis on the rear which it was never intended to have.

However it is considered that there is a balance to be had between aesthetics, historical significance and the need to adapt and allow new, appropriate treatments, with historical significance taking precedence this being a listed building in the conservation area. The draft Robin Hoods Bay Conservation Area Appraisal recognises that visually permeable boundaries to chapels and school, especially wrought ironwork or picket fences, are elements of significance that should be enhanced and conserved. This acknowledges the need for the public to see through boundary treatments.

The design of the cast iron railings has been simplified to reflect this informal elevation of the chapel and the utilitarian nature of the current picket fencing whilst meeting the necessary safety requirements of a publically used space. Although the concerns of the Building Conservation Officer are appreciated, it is felt that whilst the cast iron railings would introduce a more formal rear boundary treatment, this would not detract from the character or appearance of this Wesleyan chapel or the wider conservation area. The former rear yard is no longer functional but instead is a seating area to the café to be enjoyed and therefore if this new slightly more formal use of the terrace was considered acceptable, then the same could be expected for the boundary treatment. The proposed design of railings is appropriate being very simply detailed to reflect the fairly humble fishing village character of Robin Hoods Bay and as such it is considered that the proposal would accord with Development Policies 3 and 4 and approval is recommended.

Draft Local Plan

For the reasons given above the proposal is considered to comply with emerging Policy ENV11 which seeks to conserve and enhance heritage assets.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Local Planning Authority has acted positively and proactively in determining this application by identifying matters of concern within the application (as originally submitted) and negotiating, with the Applicant, acceptable amendments to the proposal to address those concerns. As a result, the Local Planning Authority has been able to grant planning permission for an acceptable proposal, in accordance with the presumption in favour of sustainable development, as set out within the National Planning Policy Framework.