

From: [Hilary Saunders](#)
To: [Planning](#)
Subject: FW: Land to rear of Brookfield, Maltongate, Thornton Dale: NYM/2019/0628/FL
Date: 24 November 2020 08:50:38
Attachments: [image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)

Please upload - public

Kind regards

Hilary

H. Saunders

Mrs Hilary Saunders MRTPI
Planning Team Leader
Development Management
Tel.no. 01439 772700

Following the Government's announcement of a lockdown through November the offices in Helmsley are closed for public access though the reception will still be staffed to take telephone calls. Whilst the Planning Department will continue to deliver our services remotely, unfortunately during this period we are unable to offer face to face meetings though advice can still be provided by telephone, email or through video meetings (in the case of pre-application advice this will be subject to the normal fees).

From:
Sent: 20 November 2020 10:33
To: h.saunders@northyorkmoors.org.uk
Subject: Land to rear of Brookfield, Maltongate, Thornton Dale: NYM/2019/0628/FL

Good Morning Hilary.

Please see below for comments by Nick Corbett of WSP.

This email may be published on your website.

Regards

Graham

Briggate Barn
Briggate
Nesfield
Ilkley
LS29 0BS
UK

From: Corbett, Nick
Sent: 19 November 2020 16:42
To: g Stocks, Matt
Cc: White, Julie
Subject: RE: Brookfield

Hi Graham

Could Hilary include the following in her committee report as our reply to Maria's observations?:

The applicant's heritage statement was produced by WSP* and the relevant archives within the Historic Environment Record (HER) were consulted, a site assessment was undertaken, and historic maps reviewed, all of which established that the historic use of the site was a market garden going back for at least 170 years, and that the proposed scheme, now much reduced in scale to address the concerns of the planning inspector, would cause no harm to the setting or significance of the grade II listed Brookfield, the pinfold, or neighbouring listed buildings, and it would also preserve the character and appearance of the Thornton-le-Dale Conservation Area.

The application site is not a heritage asset and is of no special significance in itself, but it does affect the setting of heritage assets, and it is understanding what it contributes to the setting of those heritage assets, most crucially Brookfield, that has been assessed. Brookfield is a cottage forming part of a farmstead and it is of architectural and historic significance. What the application site contributes to this significance, is a sense of 'openness' and the proposed scheme has been reduced to a single storey arrangement, set well back from Maltongate behind a hedgerow to retain this sense of 'openness' for the setting of Brookfield, and the pinfold, whilst also making a positive contribution to vernacular design and adding a sense of composition to the existing outbuildings associated with Brookfield.

It is worth noting that there is no special historical relationship between the use of the pinfold and the application site. The stray animals kept securely in a pinfold would be sold if unclaimed, usually after seven days, to provide the keeper of the pinfold with income and as such it would be highly unlikely that the application site would be used for grazing these stray animals, in what would be a much less secure form of enclosure than the pinfold; but even it was used for grazing, this would not give it any special historical significance that would be material to the determination of this planning application. (The difference in height between the level of the pinfold and the site would make it difficult to transfer animals between the two, and historic maps do show market garden use upon the site for at least 170 years and not grazing).

The National Park Authority's conservation officer appears to agree with some of the crucial conclusions of the applicant's heritage statement, as she states in her observations: 'Regarding the design of the buildings. I believe they are suitable in terms of scale and massing for an infill plot within Thornton Dale. Whilst they contain modern elements (rooflights) they do pay sufficient homage in their design to sit within the local vernacular.' Furthermore, when the correct NPPF approach is applied, i.e. considering what the site contributes to the setting and significance of the grade II listed Brookfield, then she has no objection to the provision of one new dwelling (rather than the two proposed), but this does appear to contradict her previous conclusion that the design as proposed is acceptable; it is the design of the amended scheme as proposed that creates the look and feel of a farmstead, whilst keeping a sense of openness around Brookfield and the pinfold, and losing half of the scheme would unbalance the proposed composition.

In conclusion, sufficient research was undertaken to properly assess the impact of the proposed

development upon the architectural and historic significance of Brookfield and neighbouring listed buildings, together with its impact upon the conservation area, and the conclusion of the heritage statement is that no harm would be caused.

*(The heritage assessment was undertaken by Nick Corbett, a full member of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation and Chartered Town Planner, with 25 years' experience of heritage planning, including five years as conservation team leader at Warwick District Council, seven years as Principal Conservation Officer with the Royal Borough of Kensington and Chelsea, and two years covering the Dartmoor National Park).

Kind regards

Nick

Nick Corbett BA Hons Bpl MA MRTPI IHBC

Associate Director – heritage and placemaking

On Monday 4 May WSP | Indigo became WSP. Please note that my email address has now changed to As part of WSP, we will continue to provide our clients with the same personalised service, and access to our wider expertise across the business. To find out more please visit wsp.com/planning-consultancy

Email artwork May 2020



WSP, The Mailbox
Level 2, 100 Wharfside Street, Birmingham
B1 1RT

Confidential

This message, including any document or file attached, is intended only for the addressee and may contain privileged and/or confidential information. Any other person is strictly prohibited from reading, using, disclosing or copying this message. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender and delete the message. Thank you.

WSP UK Limited, a limited company registered in England & Wales with registered number 01383511. Registered office: WSP House, 70 Chancery Lane, London, WC2A 1AF

NOTICE: This communication and any attachments ("this message") may contain information which is privileged, confidential, proprietary or otherwise subject to restricted disclosure under applicable law. This message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). Any unauthorized use, disclosure, viewing, copying, alteration, dissemination or distribution of, or reliance on, this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, or you are not an authorized or intended recipient, please notify the sender immediately by replying to this message, delete this message and all copies from your e-mail system and destroy any printed copies.

-LAEmHhHzdJzBITWfa4Hgs7pbKI