

North York Moors National Park Authority

Parish: Hinderwell

App No: NYM/2020/0597/LB

Proposal: Listed Building Consent for installation of 7 no. replacement windows and 1 no. replacement door to front elevation

Location: Greylands Farm, 5 High Street, Hinderwell

Applicant: Mr John Barker
Greylands Farm , 5 High Street, Hinderwell, Saltburn-By-The-Sea, TS13 5JX

Date for Decision: 13 October 2020

Extended to: 01 March 2021

Consultations

Parish – Strongly supports. Optimising insulation and energy efficiency levels should preserve the character and long term function of a heritage asset. The proposed improvements will guarantee the longer term conservation of the property and improve the living standards of the occupants. The dampness and mould need to be prevented to safeguard the structure of the building.

Site Notice/Advertisement Expiry Date – 23 September 2020

Others –

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following condition(s):

1. Standard Three Year Commencement Date - Listed Building
The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
2. Strict Accordance With the Documentation Submitted or Minor Variations - Document No.s

The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:

Document Description	Document No.	Date Received
Application Form		18 August 2020
Location Plan		18 August 2020
Amended Plans		07 February 2021
Confirmation of Horn detail		01 March 2021

or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

3. Pointing - New Development - Standard Mix
All pointing in the development hereby permitted shall accord with the following specification - a lime mortar mix of 1:3 (dry non-hydraulic quicklime: sand) (sand mix of 50% sieved sharp sand and 50% builders sand).

4. Window Frames in Reveals to Match Existing
The external face of the frame to all new windows shall be set in reveals to match those of the existing windows and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
5. Windows - Specify Details of Finish
All new window frames in the development hereby approved shall be hand painted within six months of the date of installation and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Informative(s)

1. Bats
All bats and their roosts are fully protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended by the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000) and are further protected under Regulation 39(1) of the Conservation (Natural Habitats etc.) Regulations 1994. Should any bats or evidence of bats be found prior to or during development, work must stop immediately and Natural England contacted on 0300 060 3900 for further advice. This is a legal requirement under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended) and applies to whoever carries out the work. All contractors on site should be made aware of this requirement and given information to contact Natural England or the Bat Conservation Trust national helpline on 0845 1300 228.

Reason(s) for Condition(s)

1. To ensure compliance with Sections 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended.
2. For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
3. For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
4. For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
5. For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

Application Number: NYM/2020/0597/LB



Application Number: NYM/2020/0597/LB

Background

Greylands Farm is a Grade II Listed vernacular farmhouse constructed in the early to mid-Nineteenth Century of coursed stone with a Welsh slate roof. The property sits within an elevated position to the west of Hinderwell village and fronts onto the highway to the south of the property. The property is of symmetrical proportions with traditional single glazed, timber vertically sliding slash windows within the front elevation of the property with a white painted four panel timber door in the centre.

Planning permission and Listed Building Consent were granted in April 2015 for the conversion and rebuilding of the barn to the rear of Greylands Farm to form 1 no. local occupancy dwelling to let with associated parking and amenity space.

This application seeks Listed Building Consent for the replacement of all 7 no. windows in the front elevation of the farmhouse with double glazed timber vertically sliding sash windows.

The existing windows are of varying ages, with the upper right hand windows appearing to be of more modern appearance as they have less deterioration and less detailing with simpler mouldings to the frames and more standard style horns. The Heritage Statement submitted in support of this application states that the more modern windows date to the 1970s but that 5 no. windows are at least one hundred years old and the Authority's Building Conservation Officer has confirmed that the majority of the windows within the front elevation appear to be historic and are considered to contribute significantly to the architectural and historic character of the listed building.

Main Issues**Statutory Duties**

Section 16, paragraph 193 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Section 16, paragraph 194 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 goes on to state that any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.

The Authority has a statutory duty to protect Listed Buildings within the Park as they form part of the significance of the built and cultural heritage of the North York Moors. These buildings represent a significant part of the history and culture of the National Park and their considerable importance, once lost, cannot be replaced.

Application Number: NYM/2020/0597/LB

The Authority has a general duty in respect of listed buildings in its exercising of planning functions as set out in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

NYMNPAs Policies

The most relevant policies contained within the North York Moors Local Plan to consider in relation to this application are Strategic Policy C (Design of the Development), Strategic Policy I (The Historic Environment) and Policy CO17 (Householder Development).

Strategic Policy C seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park by requiring that developments are of a high quality design and incorporate good quality materials that reflect and complement the architectural character and form of the original building. SPC also supports the use of sustainable design and construction techniques which minimise waste and energy use.

Strategic Policy I states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

Policy CO17 states that development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings should take full account of the character of the local area, the special qualities of the National Park and will be permitted where among other things, the form, position and design of the new development does not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape.

Conclusion

The main issue in considering this application is whether the proposed replacement sashes would conserve or enhance the aesthetic value of the Listed Building.

It is clear from the evidence submitted in support of this application, including a written statement from a qualified joiner, that the existing windows and door are in such poor condition that they could now reasonably be considered to be beyond repair. As such, the need to replace the front door and all 7 no. windows within the front elevation of the property is not disputed.

The proposed replacement door would be similar in design and form to the existing door and therefore no objections have been raised to this element of the application.

Application Number: NYM/2020/0597/LB

The applicant originally proposed to replace the windows with timber vertically sliding sashes containing 14mm Eco-Lite Slim Sealed double glazed units. The Authority's Building Conservation Officer objected to this proposal as it was felt that the proposed replacement windows would not replicate the moulding details of the existing historic windows and that the double glazed units would be significantly thicker than the traditional single glazing within the existing windows.

The Authority's approach to the introduction of slim double glazing into Listed Buildings is based on the 2017 revised guidance by Historic England, 'Traditional Windows, Their Care, Repair and Upgrading' which represents the most up to date guidance endorsed by the Government on the subject of window replacement in buildings with heritage interest. This document advises that the use of slim profile double glazing may be acceptable in instances where historic windows have been replaced with ones whose design does not follow historic patterns and as such are unlikely to contribute to the significance of the Listed Building. In these instances, the introduction of slim profile double glazing is unlikely to cause additional harm as it provides an opportunity to enhance the significance of the building by reinstating a more traditional design of window. Therefore, where non-traditional windows are being replaced with traditionally designed and constructed windows, the Authority would generally support the use of slim double glazing in a Listed Building.

This application was not considered to accord with the above approach as the existing windows are historic and traditional in appearance and construction. As such, their replacement with less finely detailed 14mm double glazed windows was not considered an enhancement to the property, nor would it have conserved the aesthetic value of the Listed Building.

The Parish Council expressed strong support for the application on the grounds that improvements to the energy efficiency of the property would be of benefit to the occupants and the future conservation of the Listed Building. These benefits were noted, however, as the same benefits could be achieved through less harmful means, such as the use of slimmer units, the proposed double glazing units were not considered to be justified.

The Authority's Planning Committee considered the application on 03 December 2020 and agreed that the proposed replacement windows would not conserve or enhance the character and appearance of the Listed Building. Member's voted to defer a decision on the application until amendments to the application could be agreed in the form of slimmer double glazing units and more traditional detailing to the windows.

Subsequently, the applicant agreed to the use of 8mm Fineo glazing units and provided amended sectional drawings illustrating how the replacement windows would replicate the detailing of the existing historic windows. The Authority's Building Conservation Officer confirmed that the amended plans were now considered to be in accordance with SPI and Section 16 of the NPPF.

Application Number: NYM/2020/0597/LB

The replacement windows will replicate the fine detailing of the 2 no. existing historic windows and are therefore considered to conserve the special historic and architectural interest of the Listed Building. Furthermore, the 8mm double glazed units will provide the benefits of triple glazing whilst maintaining the traditional appearance of single glazing. The proposals are therefore considered to accord with SPC, SPI and CO17 as the development would be sympathetic to the character and form of the original dwelling whilst conserving the historic environment.

For the reasons outlined above, this application is recommended for approval.

Pre-commencement Conditions

N/A

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including the use of 8mm glazing units and finer, historic detailing to the windows, so as to deliver sustainable development.