

# North York Moors National Park Authority

---

Parish: Hinderwell

App No: NYM/2021/0132/FL

---

**Proposal:** erection of 2 no. 3 metre high ANPR camera and CCTV mounting posts (part retrospective)

**Location:** Staithes Lane Pay and Display Car Park, Staithes

**Applicant:** I Park Smart  
c/o Agent

**Agent:** Christopher Kendall  
61 Langdale Road, Market Weighton, YO43 3DG,

**Date for Decision:** 22/04/2021

**Extended to:**

---

## Director of Planning's Recommendation

**Refusal** for the following reason(s):

1. The proposed two 3 metre high poles with attached ANPR and CCTV equipment would by reason of their siting, design and height, add to the visual clutter in the locality, and detract from the appearance of this part of the National Park contrary to Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to conserve and enhance the landscape and ensure that the development does not have an adverse visual impact upon the character and amenities of the locality.

## Consultations

**Parish** – 15 March 2021 - This unplanned camera system has created negative visitor perceptions of our area some of whom have been wrongly fined. This is created by the short time delay allowed for visitors to access the parking meter upon their arrival. It is exacerbated when the area is busy and there are long queues. This system creates additional work and stress for both Hinderwell's Parish Clerk and those visitors who are unfairly fined. The neighbouring car park operated by Scarborough Borough Council, does not use high poles, signage or ANPR Cameras, so why does this car park require them. They are unsightly and should be removed.

**Highways** – 15 March 2021 – No objections

**Site Notice/Advertisement Expiry Date** – 6 April 2021

---

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---

**Others –**

**Mrs J Cooper, 192 Burden Road, Beverley, East Yorkshire - 4/3/2021 – Object -** To apply for planning after the cameras were installed shows total disregard for the community. The negative impact on the village will be massive. There is no need for them, they don't want it and neither do we as guests to the area. A normal parking system is preferred by all. Also this parking/payment system requires Internet to pay but there is No signal. They are also a blight to the area and spoil the visitors view of the area.

**Mr M Johnson, 3 Queenswood Close, LS6 3LZ - 4/3/2021 – Object -** The ANPR cameras have been erected without planning permission and it is impossible to pay within a 10 minute time limit that is not advertised anywhere near the pay machines. I was sent a PCN despite having paid for my parking as soon as I could. After months of campaigning involving the local MP, the charge was dropped by the IPC. The whole experience put me off ever visiting Staithes again.

**Ms L Eagan, 6 Paddington Bank, Warrington - 4/3/2021 - Object** as the ANPR cameras on poles are ugly and a totally unnecessary blight to the skyline in a beauty spot such as Staithes. They are unnecessary as proven by the council run car park on the adjoining site. If the local authority can operate without the use of ANPR systems then so can Park Smart Ltd. Put the reputation of your lovely village above the greed of this parking operator.

**Mr Neil Potentier , 45 Byron Street, Ilkeston, Derbyshire - 5/3/2021 – Object - Whilst your** primary concerns are a) aesthetic and b) potential danger to the public, you should exercise a social conscious in this instance as approval would discourage large number of tourists from visiting Staithes to the detriment of the local economy.

**Miss J Waite, 6 Cottingham Court, Darlington - 9/3/2021 – Object** on the grounds that they are unnecessary. There is a council carpark next door to it which has operated successfully for years without the need for cameras. I also feel the 3 metre poles are unsightly and quite frankly an unwelcoming addition to the village. This could be off putting to potential visitors and no doubt much needed revenue.

**Mr C. Barnes, 45 Wilton Rise, Holgate, York - 25/3/2021 - Object.** The area is of a place of beauty and natural interest and should not be spoilt by ugly high mounted cameras. They have resulted in presenting a bad vibe for Staithes and putting people off from visiting. A different method of managing the area should be adopted and not by the use of intimidating and unsightly cameras.

**Dr J Tyzack , Clifford House, North Street, Hundon, Sudbury, Suffolk - 20/3/2021 – Object.** Firstly they look aggressive and are completely out of keeping with the beautiful village of Staithes, creating completely the wrong first impression for visitors; and secondly they are being used in a manner which is completely detrimental to the values of the National Park, and present a severe reputational risk to the National Park.

There are direct and obvious conflicts with the NYMNP Management Plan. The ANPR cameras are being used to manage the car park without care and concern for visitors to Staithes; they are an eyesore and are completely out of place with the village of Staithes and

---

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---

the surrounding area and they look aggressive and intimidating. The cameras will drive away visitors restricting access to the amenities in the village of Staithes. Their presence is severely detrimental to the well-being of visitors to Staithes and are entirely unwelcoming and will drive away visitors, restricting access to the wonderful recreational opportunities and experiences on offer in Staithes.

The cameras completely spoil the views on the site. They in no way preserve or enhance view into and out of the site, and completely detract from the character and quality of the location.

Policy CO3 – Car Parks - CO3 It has not been demonstrated that there is even a problem with users avoiding payment at the car park, or a problem with crime to justify such an aggressive and disproportionate solution. The cameras are detrimental to the needs of communities and visitors to the National Park.

The look of the ANPR cameras is reason enough to reject the planning application. However, the manner in which they are being used is also relevant to the objection. To claim benefits which are tenuous at best such as crime reduction and safety but not consider the negative impact of the presence of these ANPR cameras is wholly inconsistent.

The existing lights are present for safety, to help visibility for car park users, particularly where the car park floor is rough and uneven. The cameras offer no safety benefit.



---

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---



Existing ANPR camera to be re-located into main car park



Existing ANPR camera and Scarborough Borough Council Lighting

## **Background**

The application site is comprises the westernmost of two adjoining public car parks at Staithes Bank Top. The car park closest to the bank top roundabout is operated by Scarborough Borough Council and this car park to the rear is run by a private operator. These two car parks provide public parking for those visiting Staithes and are heavily used as visitors are unable to park at the bottom of Staithes.

In recent years planning permission was granted for the North York Moors National Park to site a lobster sculpture on the roundabout closed to the site, through funding obtained in order to provide a stimulating and attractive entrance to the village providing a strong sense of identity with Staithes and its close links with the sea.

In 2018, the National Park Authority determined to object to a Prior Notification for an 8.3m high telecommunication mast required to provide improved transmission links to safeguard the operational integrity of the airwave emergency services network. The objection was due to the detrimental impact the proposal would have on the character of the locality.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---

The applicant has erected (without the benefit of planning permission) two metal columns to support Automatic Number Plate Recognition and Closed Circuit Television Cameras. This application seeks permission to retain one post and to relocate the other from the overflow car park which has been sold and reduce its height to 3 metres.

In support of the application, the applicant's agent states that:-

All operators have systems of monitoring car parks to ensure that visitors pay. There are different methods such as payment on exit, staff patrolling car parks and monitoring pre-paid tickets, or automatic number plate recognition cameras which can correlate the time of entry with the time of departure and the fee paid.

ANPR cameras need to be in an elevated position so high enough to avoid being vandalised and so it will read the number plate correctly. The applicants have installed two metal posts which each support a CCTV camera and an ANPR camera. They are currently approximately 5m high, but this application effectively seeks to reduce them to 3m. One post is to be removed from the current location and relocated into the body of the car park. One of the posts is already in position. The other is in what has been an adjoining overflow car park. There does not appear to be any planning permission for this additional car park. The land has been sold and is no longer being used by the applicants. The post will be removed and relocated in the existing, lawful, car park.

The posts comes within what is normally regarded as street furniture, those everyday objects, which are visible but to many people, invisible, which guide, control, protect everyday lives, along with other items such as electricity and telephone poles. There are many items of street furniture in the village of Staithes, including in the Conservation Area. In this case the posts support two cameras which are necessary to facilitate the operation of the car park. The ANPR cameras to ensure that users of the car park pay for so doing and the CCTV cameras are necessary for crime prevention and general safety.

It is noted that in the adjacent car park, operated by Scarborough Borough Council there are lighting columns. The columns support lighting units which exist to illuminate the car park in darkness, in the interests of safety and security. These lighting columns are higher and more prominent than the columns proposed by the applicants.

The applicants consider that the camera columns, particularly when reduced to 3m (as applied for) would not have any harmful effect on the appearance of the area. They do, however, have benefits in terms of crime prevention and safety.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---

**Main Issues****Local Plan**

**Strategic Policy A – National Park Purposes** – seeks to take a positive approach to new development, in line with the presumption in favour of sustainable development and where decisions are consistent with National Park statutory purposes to conserve and enhance the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park and to promote opportunities for the understanding and enjoyment of the special qualities of the National Park by the public.

**Strategic Policy C- Design** - seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park, and states that development will only be supported where, amongst other criteria, it is of a high quality design; the scale, height, massing and form are compatible with surrounding buildings and not have an adverse impact upon the amenities of adjoining occupiers.

**Material Considerations**

The main issue is whether these poles and associated camera equipment has and will have (with the revised location and height of 3m) an adverse impact on the character of the National Park landscape, specifically at this gateway point at the top of Staithes which is the starting point for most visitors to the village.

The important considerations include whether or not the poles and equipment would add to the clutter of the landscape where the National Park Authority is actively trying to improve the character of the area.

The poles and cameras would be sited in an extremely prominent position at this important approach into the Staithes Conservation Area, in a popular tourist location, where proactive work has been undertaken to improve the appearance of this area. Alternative means of providing such equipment have been suggested to the applicant, such as attaching to existing structures or fencing. However amended locations have not been forthcoming.

Whilst there are existing lighting columns in the car park, the proposals introduce additional clutter to the streetscape, to the detriment of the character of the area and this part of the National Park. Furthermore, there is no essential justification for the need for the cameras whereas the lighting has been necessary for pedestrian safety at night. However, it is anticipated that in the long term these lighting columns can be replaced with less intrusive structures with better lighting that would also reduce light pollution, as a continuation of proactive work by the Authority and also due to the Authority's Dark Skies status.

In view of the above considerations, it is recommended that the application be refused.

**Application Number: NYM/2021/0132/FL**

---

**Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent**

**Decision under the Temporary Scheme of Delegation**

**N/A**

**Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent**

**Refusal (Amendments Requested and Declined)**

Negotiations have taken place with the aim of making changes to ensure the proposal complies with the relevant policies of the Development Plan as set out in the National Planning Policy Framework, though unfortunately such changes were not implemented.