From:

Subject: Comments on NYM/2021/0835/LB - Case Officer Mrs Hilary Saunders - Received from Building Conservation

at The Old Vicarage, Bondgate, Helmsley, York, YO62 5BP,

Date: 16 December 2021 11:52:24

The scheme is one of the better barn conversion schemes we have seen here at the NYM for some years. In general we are supportive of the careful approach as it seeks to retain many of the features, (stalls, forge, threshing floors, troughs, hayracks etc) that give this set of barns special interest. Any scheme which proposed the removal of some of these features would likely cause harm to the significance of the building and as a result would be unlikely receive support.

Floors

There is a need to understand the existing floor make up before agreeing to floors or lowering of floors. But provided the walls will not be destabilised, any historic surfaces are retained/re-laid and the floor make up is compatible with Traditional masonry I raise no objection, please condition.

Masonry walls

60mm of insulated non-hydraulic lime plaster is considered appropriate and will allow the building to breathe. As is repointing in a non-hydraulic hot lime mortar and the removal of any cementitious materials, please condition

Internal partition walls

The design of the internal partition walls will complement the character of the building and is supported. Agricultural features

Existing timber troughs, boskins, forges, rudsters and hayracks to be recorded, pieces numbered, carefully dismantled and reinstate in original positions following any necessary repairs to rotten areas and the installation of the new wall insulation and floor finish is supported.

Roof

We agree that a modest raising of the roof to allow for the existing roof structure to be maintained and insulation added is acceptable. The approach to repair and limewash is also supported

SVP and vents

Hiding these behind gutters and eaves level is supported. The introduction of three flues for the log burners are an intrusion but as they are so minimal and centrally placed to reduce the length of protrusion and therefore we raise no objection. Please condition the flues to be matt finished.

The use of barns 3 and 4 for parking and bin storage will reduce the visual clutter of the site and reduce the domesticating impact this development will undoubtedly have.

Given the quality of the existing plans, and heritage statement and most importantly the sensitivity of the scheme I do not consider that any historic building recording (HBR) is necessary for the site. However, should any subsequent, acceptable proposal be submitted then the need for HBR might be triggered.

The principle of the proposed window and door details is acceptable but further information is required before approval of these elements. Can you please condition these?

On a whole the barns represent a challenge for conversion due to the high levels of surviving historic fabric which contribute to the special interest of the site. The architect has designed a careful scheme that still achieves the requirements of a domestic property. Traditional and breathable materials are proposed throughout which should help the building function efficiently and prevent damp. As such I am happy to support this scheme subject to some conditions. Please come back to me for conditions.

Comments made by Building Conservation of The Old Vicarage Bondgate Helmsley York YO62 5BP

Preferred Method of Contact is: Post

Comment Type is Support with comments Letter ID: 576942

From: Elspeth Ingleby

Sent: 24 November 2021 11:39

To: Hilary Saunders

Subject: RE: New application post - NYM/2021/0832/FL & 0835/LB - Red Farm Barns, Egton - Ecology

Hi Hilary

No a scoping survey which identifies bat roost potential (including high potential in one building) supported by one late season activity survey cannot be used to justify reserving further surveys under condition. To justify our position, I would cite from official government guidance "Protected species and development: advice for local planning authorities" (see here; Protected species and development: advice for local planning authorities - GOV.UK (www.gov.uk))

Planning conditions

You should not usually attach planning conditions that ask for surveys. This is because you need to consider the full impact of the proposal on protected species before you can grant planning permission. You can add an 'informative' note to the planning permission to make it clear that a licence is needed.

In exceptional cases, you may need to attach a planning condition for additional surveys. For instance, to support detailed mitigation proposals or if there will be a delay between granting planning permission and the start of development. In these cases a planning condition should be used to provide additional or updated ecological surveys to make sure that the mitigation is still appropriate. This is important for outline applications or multi-phased developments.

In this case, because insufficient survey information has been provided to fully understand the characteristics of the roost or to rule out roosting from other buildings (see the best practice guidance regarding the usual number of surveys required for buildings of low, medium and high suitability on the BCT website Conservation Trust), we do not fully understand the impact of these proposals on protected species and therefore it is not appropriate to secure these surveys under condition. Historic surveys are helpful, but cannot be used to confirm absence of bats, and as noted below are also late season and therefore may well not detect use by bats earlier in the season. I don't believe the exceptional circumstances mentioned above apply in this case as we don't have sufficient valid, recent information to begin with.

Best wishes

Elspeth

Elspeth Ingleby MA_{Cantab} ACIEEM Ecologist

From: To:

Subject: RE: NYM/2021/0835/LB Date: 17 November 2021 12:23:00

Good morning

The council had concerns with the extent of the proposed works as it is a listed building in a conservation area. They were concerns that it may not meet the national living standards. There were also concerns raised with the change of use and with them becoming holiday homes.

Kind Regards

CA Harrison – Clerk to Egton Parish Council

From:

Sent: 27 October 2021 11:27

To:

Subject: NYM/2021/0835/LB

Importance: High

Reference: NYM/2021/0835/LB.

The North York Moors National Park Authority Planning Service welcomes public engagement in all aspects of its work. You have received this email in relation to a current planning matter. The attached correspondence contains important information which you are advised to retain for your records. If you have any gueries, please do not hesitate to contact us. When replying it's best to quote our reference number, which is included in the attached letter.

The Authority is following Government advice concerning Covid-19 as such our working arrangements may change. We will ensure our letters and website are updated as and when required in order to provide our customers with the most up to date information.

Kind regards

Chris France

Chris France Director of Planning North York Moors National Park Authority The Old Vicarage **Bondgate** Helmsley, York YO62 5BP

Tel: 01439 772700

www.northyorkmoors.org.uk

From: To: Cc: Subject:

NYM/2021/0832/FL & 0835/LB - Red Farm Barns, Egton

Date: 19 November 2021 14:28:00

Dear Megan

These applications to convert the farm buildings into residential properties is supported by a Bat, Breeding Bird and Barn Owl survey by MAB Ecology dated October 2021. This included a scoping survey and activity survey undertaken at the property on 23 September 2021, and also refers to findings of two previous surveys by other consultancies. Copies of these previous surveys is not provided, but from the detail referenced in the report provided, the surveys undertaken are dated as 27 and 31 August 2017, 27 September 2017, and 27 September 2019. No bats were recorded as emerging from the buildings in the historic surveys and activity was generally quite low, however it must be noted that all of these surveys were undertaken late in the survey season (May to September) and further information regarding weather conditions and timing has not been provided. In addition the first of these surveys were undertaken much less than 2 weeks apart, which is the advised interval between surveys to enable characterisation across the season to be assessed.

During the 2021 scoping assessment, one of the buildings was identified as being of high suitability, three of moderate suitability and two of low suitability as found in 2019. Following best practice guidelines, we would therefore expect at least three, two and one activity surveys respectively of the different buildings. Furthermore, whilst the survey season extends from mi-May in to September, maternity bat roosts are likely to disband from early to mid-August onwards, and therefore surveys solely carried out late in the season, particularly in September, will not be likely to detect whether maternity roosts may be present. For this reason, high suitability sites should be supported by at least 2 activity surveys conducted in mid-May to August and 1 other survey between mid-May and September, moderate suitability sites supported by at least 1 activity survey conducted in mid-May to August and 1 other survey between mid-May and September, and low suitability sites supported by at least 1 activity survey conducted in mid-May to August.

The survey undertaken this year, whilst in mild conditions, is from the end of September, and involved a single survey with 3 surveyors present. One bat emergence was recorded, from the high suitability barn in which scattered droppings of probably two different species was recorded. Given the positioning of the surveyors it was clearly not possible for all elevations of the 6 buildings present to be covered, although focus does appear to have been given to the high and moderate suitability buildings. I also note that the scoping survey did not include any photographs of the inside of building B and C to support the determination of suitability as is normally provided in reports by this consultancy.

I therefore do not think that sufficient information has been provided to enable us to establish the potential impact of the development on the favourable conservation status of bats in the area, or the likely level of mitigation appropriate. Whilst the level of activity on the site has been recorded to be fairly low, all of these surveys were undertaken late in the season when bat maternity roosts will already have been disbanded and most bats will be roosting in transient sites, and no survey effort has been reported from earlier in the season to give an indication as to the number or species of bat present during the breeding season and the likely level of importance of the site to bats.

Planning permission/listed building consent <u>cannot</u> therefore be granted until further activity surveys have been undertaken within the optimum season. Based on the assessed suitability of the site, this should consist of at least two surveys (ideally one dusk and one dawn) between mid-May and August to cover the high suitability building (A) and at least one survey between mid-May and August to cover the moderate and low suitability buildings (B-F). Should this not be undertaken in 2022, then an additional survey between mid-May and September will also be required for high and moderate suitability buildings.

Bird nests and barn owl roosting were both also present and will need to be mitigated for. Information provided in this report is adequate for the present, so unless updated by further evidence from surveys next year, we can draw up appropriate conditions for these when the application can be considered for determination with the submission of further bat activity surveys.

Kind regards

Elspeth

Elspeth Ingleby MA_{Cantab} ACIEEM Ecologist

North York Moors National Park Authority
The Old Vicarage, Bondgate, Helmsley, York YO62 5BP

Tel: 01439 772567

From: To:

Subject: Planning 25/10/21 - 31/10/21 **Date:** 03 November 2021 17:46:50

Hello,

If the following applications are approved, please can a bat informative be included in the decision notice;

NYM/2021/0842/LB - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0839/FL - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0835/LB - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0832/FL - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0837/FL - The Old Vicarage, Toftly View, Newton upon Rawcliffe

NYM/2021/0703/FL - Clover Hill Farm, Mars Lane, Scaling

If the following applications are approved, please can a bird informative be included in the decision notice;

NYM/2021/0842/LB - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0839/FL - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0835/LB - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0832/FL - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0837/FL - The Old Vicarage, Toftly View, Newton upon Rawcliffe

NYM/2021/0703/FL - Clover Hill Farm, Mars Lane, Scaling

If the following applications are approved, please can a swift informative be included in the decision notice;

NYM/2021/0842/LB - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0839/FL - Red House Farm, Cowbar Lane, Cowbar

NYM/2021/0835/LB - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0832/FL - Red Farm Barns, High Street, Egton

NYM/2021/0703/FL - Clover Hill Farm, Mars Lane, Scaling

Many thanks,

Ellie Davison Conservation Trainee

North York Moors National Park Authority The Old Vicarage Bondgate Helmsley York YO62 5BP From: To:

Subject: RE: NYM/2021/0835/LB Date: 27 October 2021 16:39:53

Good afternoon

The next meeting is 16 November and a response will be sent 17 November.

Kind Regards

CA Harrison - Clerk to Egton Parish Council

From

Sent: 27 October 2021 11:27

To:

Subject: NYM/2021/0835/LB

Importance: High

Reference: NYM/2021/0835/LB.

The North York Moors National Park Authority Planning Service welcomes public engagement in all aspects of its work. You have received this email in relation to a current planning matter. The attached correspondence contains important information which you are advised to retain for your records. If you have any queries, please do not hesitate to contact us. When replying it's best to quote our reference number, which is included in the attached letter.

The Authority is following Government advice concerning Covid-19 as such our working arrangements may change. We will ensure our letters and website are updated as and when required in order to provide our customers with the most up to date information.

Kind regards

Chris France

Chris France Director of Planning North York Moors National Park Authority The Old Vicarage Bondgate Helmsley, York YO62 5BP Tel: 01439 772700

www.northyorkmoors.org.uk