

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2021/0824/LB

Development description: Listed Building consent for renovation of 2 no. sash windows to first floor together with installation of replacement timber double glazed windows

Site address: Brow Hill Cottage, Susanna Hill, Browside, Ravenscar

Parish: LCPs of Fylingdales and Hawsker-cum-Stainsacre

Parish: Fylingdales

Case officer: Miss Lucy Gibson

Applicant: Mr & Mrs Ballin

Brow Hill Cottage, Susanna Hill, Browside, Ravenscar, YO13 0NH

Agent: ERW Joinery Ltd

fao: Mr Lawrence Wall, Renovation House, Skippers Lane, Skippers Lane Industrial Estate, Middlesbrough, TS6 6HA,

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following:

Condition(s)

Condition number	Condition code	Condition text																		
1	TIME02	<p>Standard Three Year Commencement Date - Listed Building</p> <p>The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.</p>																		
2	PLAN01	<p>Strict Accordance With the Documentation Submitted or Minor Variations - Document No.s Specified</p> <p>The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Document Description</th> <th>Document No.</th> <th>Date Received</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Amended plans</td> <td>D21213- 4</td> <td>11 January 2022</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>D21213 - 2 Rev A</td> <td>20 January 2022</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>D21213 - 3 Rev A</td> <td>20 January 2022</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>D21213 - 6 Rev A</td> <td>20 January 2022</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Email from agent to case officer</td> <td></td> <td>19 January 2022</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.</p>	Document Description	Document No.	Date Received	Amended plans	D21213- 4	11 January 2022		D21213 - 2 Rev A	20 January 2022		D21213 - 3 Rev A	20 January 2022		D21213 - 6 Rev A	20 January 2022	Email from agent to case officer		19 January 2022
Document Description	Document No.	Date Received																		
Amended plans	D21213- 4	11 January 2022																		
	D21213 - 2 Rev A	20 January 2022																		
	D21213 - 3 Rev A	20 January 2022																		
	D21213 - 6 Rev A	20 January 2022																		
Email from agent to case officer		19 January 2022																		
3	MATS54	<p>Trickle Vents Shall Not be incorporated into Windows</p> <p>Trickle vents shall not be incorporated into any new windows hereby approved and shall not be installed thereafter unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.</p>																		

Reason(s) for condition(s)

Reason number	Reason code	Reason text
1	TIME02	To ensure compliance with Sections 18(1) of the Planning

		(Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended.
2	PLAN01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
3	MATS02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Strategic Policy A and NYM Strategic Policy C which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

Informative(s)

Informative number	Informative code	Informative text
1	MISCINF01	<p>Bats</p> <p>All bats and their roosts are fully protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended by the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000) and are further protected under Regulation 39(1) of the Conservation (Natural Habitats etc.) Regulations 1994. Should any bats or evidence of bats be found prior to or during development, work must stop immediately and Natural England contacted on 0300 060 3900 for further advice. This is a legal requirement under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended) and applies to whoever carries out the work. All contractors on site should be made aware of this requirement and given information to contact Natural England or the Bat Conservation Trust national helpline on 0845 1300 228.</p>

Consultation responses

Parish

No objections.

Third party responses

None

Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date- 16 November 2021



Photograph showing the front (west) elevation of Brow Hill Cottage, Ravenscar

Background

Brow Hill Cottage is a semi-detached Grade II Listed building constructed of lightly tooled, coursed sandstone under a pantile roof. The cottage is believed to date from the Eighteenth Century and is attached to the former farmhouse. The cottage occupies a remote location close to the cliff edge, and is accessed off a single track road between Ravenscar Beacon and Stoupe Brow. It forms a cluster of three properties below the road level.

In 2004 Listed Building Consent was granted to replace the single glazed units with 16mm slim line double glazed units in existing modern casement frames, excluding the two historic vertical sash windows on the upper floor front elevation and the historic window to the upper side elevation. In 2015 planning permission and Listed Building Consent was approved for internal alterations and the construction of a single storey extension on the side elevation, following the demolition of the conservatory and WC.

This application seeks Listed Building Consent for the replacement of 9 windows to the property's front, side and rear elevations, and the repair of two historic windows to the front elevation.

Aside from the 3 historic windows, the existing windows are white painted timber casement windows with 16mm slim line glazing units. The windows to the front elevation have structural glazing bars, however the windows to the rear are modern casements.

Originally the replacement windows proposed were timber casement standard double glazed units with applied glazing bars. These would be considered harmful to the designated asset due to the bulky units and applied glazing bars, which are considered to be a poor architectural feature.

Following correspondence with the agent, amended plans were submitted consisting of timber casement windows with slim line units and structural glazing bars.

Main issues

Statutory Duties

Section 16, paragraph 199 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Section 16, paragraph 200 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 goes on to state that any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.

The Authority has a statutory duty to protect Listed Buildings within the Park as they form part of the significance of the built and cultural heritage of the North York Moors. These buildings represent a significant part of the history and culture of the National Park and their considerable importance, once lost, cannot be replaced.

The Authority has a general duty in respect of listed buildings in its exercising of planning functions as set out in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

NYMNPA Policies

The most relevant policy contained within the North York Moors Local Plan to consider in relation to this application is Strategic Policy I (Historic Environment) and Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage).

Strategic Policy I states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

Policy ENV11 seeks to resist development that results in loss of or harm to the significance of designated and other heritage assets of national importance. In order to accept any loss or harm proposals will be required to present clear and compelling justification for the development, including the public benefits which will arise from the proposal.

Material considerations

As slim line glazing has previously been approved for the non-historic windows at Brow Hill Cottage, it is considered the proposals for casement windows with slim line units and 33mm structural glazing bars will conserve the character of the building. This amended design would also help to achieve a homogenous fenestration.

It is regrettable that the replacement windows are not of a more traditional style, such as Yorkshire sliding sashes or vertical sashes, however the amended plans would not constitute harm to the significance of the designated asset. The proposed windows would be casement windows, traditionally detailed with 33mm structural glazing bars.

Another amendment was received on request to omit the projecting sill elements of the windows.

The windows will be putty pointed to the rear and side elevation and putty beaded on the front (west) elevation. The Authority's Building Conservation Team have commented that it would be preferable if all elevations are putty pointed, however the use of a bead which replicates a putty fillet would be considered an enhancement of the existing square bead.

The Authority's Building Conservation team have confirmed that the proposals for the replacement windows align with the Historic England's guidance and provided their support for the application. They are also supportive of the repair to the two historic sliding sash windows on the first floor of the front (west) elevation as this will conserve the historic fabric of the asset.

Therefore this application is considered to accord with NYM Strategic Policy I, Policy ENV11 and Section 16 of the NPPF. For the reasons outlined above, this application is recommended for approval.

Pre-commencement conditions

None

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including slim line glazing units and structural glazing bars for the replacement windows, so as to deliver sustainable development.