

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2022/0442

Development description: Listed Building consent for installation of replacement double glazed timber windows

Site address: Demesne Farm Holiday Cottages, Fylingdales

Parish: Fylingdales

Case officer: Mr A Muir

Applicant: Mr Alan Bancroft
Demesne Farm, Fylingdales, YO22 4QF

Agent:

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Refusal for the following reason(s) delete as appropriate

Reason(s) for refusal

Refusal reason code	Refusal reason text
1	The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposal would compromise the aesthetic qualities of the remaining traditional windows and doors seen on the main farmhouse and undermine the integrity of this historic building and overall setting. Furthermore, insufficient justification has been provided to indicate that the alterations are necessary to achieve public benefit which would offset the harm caused. The proposal is therefore contrary to paragraphs 199 and 200 of the NPPF; and to the NYMNPALocal Plan 2022 Strategic Policy I which requires that alterations to listed buildings conserve the building and its setting in a manner appropriate to its significance.
2	The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed replacement windows, being of standard double glazing units using float glass and applied glazing bars, fail to replicate the joinery details of the existing multi-paned single glazed windows and consequently would detract from the special architectural and historic character of the listed building contrary to Policy ENV11 of the NYMPALocal Plan 2022.
3	The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed replacement door, being of a framed panel design with standard double glazing unit using float glass and applied glazing bars, fails to replicate the joinery details of the existing multi-paned single glazed doors and consequently would detract from the special architectural and historic character of the listed building contrary to Policy ENV11 of the NYMPALocal Plan 2022.

Consultation responses

Parish

No objections

Third party responses

Mr Chris Bancroft

Properties in lower Robin Hood's Bay which are listed have similar windows including one on Bloomswell. How can you allow for one property but not for another? These should either be allowed, or all properties should be required to remove and install as per your instructions. Common sense needs to be applied.

Publicity expiry

Advertisement expiry date 04 August 2022

Site notice expiry date 12 August 2022



North east court yard elevation



Northern courtyard elevation



North eastern external elevation

Background

Demesne farm is sited in an isolated and prominent location on a hillside more than a kilometre south of Fylingthorpe. The Grade II listed farm comprises a farmhouse and an attractive courtyard of traditional stone and slate farm buildings entered through an arch together with a small detached stone and slate building and a modern sheeted farm building just to the west of the main courtyard.

Planning permission and Listed Building Consent were granted in 1999 for the change of use of the redundant agricultural buildings to provide 4 units of holiday accommodation. This was revised to 5 holiday units in 2002. A further application was submitted in 2021, originally proposed to replace many of the existing windows and doors with timber 24mm double glazed units with applied glazing bars. However, following concerns from the Authority's Building Conservation team regarding the dimensions of the 24mm double glazing and the integrity of the applied glazing bars, amended plans were received to omit the window replacements and the door to Forge Cottage from the application. Listed Building Consent was granted for the installation of replacement double glazed doors with 16mm units in the arched doorways to Bay View Cottage lounge and Dove Cote Cottage lounge on the northern external elevation.

This application is to replace the door and all windows in Forge Cottage and the windows only in Byre Cottage, Bay View Cottage and Dove Cote Cottage. The proposed windows are timber framed single sash with 24mm double glazing and applied timber glazing bars.

Main issues

Section 16, paragraph 199 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Section 16, paragraph 200 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 goes on to state that any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.

The Authority has a statutory duty to protect Listed Buildings within the Park as they form part of the significance of the built and cultural heritage of the North York Moors. These buildings represent a significant part of the history and culture of the National Park and their considerable importance, once lost, cannot be replaced.

The Authority has a general duty in respect of listed buildings in its exercising of planning functions as set out in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and

Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Local Plan

The most relevant policy contained within the North York Moors Local Plan to consider in relation to this application is Strategic Policy I (Historic Environment) and Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage).

Strategic Policy I states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

Policy ENV11 seeks to resist development that results in loss of or harm to the significance of designated and other heritage assets of national importance. In order to accept any loss or harm proposals will be required to present clear and compelling justification for the development, including the public benefits which will arise from the proposal.

The windows and doors were originally approved under the 1999 and 2002 permissions for the change of use of the Listed Building from agriculture to holiday accommodation. These windows were considered to be a good quality traditional style window to reflect the windows within the elevations of the main farmhouse. The windows are constructed from timber with single glazing and structural glazing bars.

The proposed windows are to be constructed of timber with 24mm double glazed units with applied timber glazing bars.

Best practise as set out by English Heritage advises that existing windows and doors should be retained and repaired wherever possible with replacement being a last resort. However in this case the windows are not historical and are more recent additions. English Heritage advises that replacement should only occur where windows of an unsympathetic design are being replaced with windows of a sympathetic historic pattern.

The Authority's Building Conservation Team has advised that the proposed windows lack authenticity and aesthetic proportions. The material, frame sizes, mouldings, glazing bars and glass (including reflective quality) will not replace the existing features, which compromises the aesthetic qualities of the remaining traditional windows seen on the main farmhouse and undermine the integrity of the historic building and overall setting. This form of glazing with applied glazing bars are not a traditional feature of period buildings and are not supported in listed buildings even in cases where the principle of double glazing is accepted. The poor architectural detail will undermine the

quality of craftsmanship shown elsewhere in the property. This is supported by English Heritage's Planning Guidance GPA2 – Managing Significance in Decision Taking, where it refers on page 8 to the cumulative impact of incremental small changes and the deleterious effect these have on the significance of a heritage asset, therefore great weight is given to the heritage assets conservation. This is supported at paragraph 199 and 200 of the NPPF.

The Parish Council has provided a no objection comment. The Authority has received a third party comment relating to the Authority needing to be consistent in its approach to decisions and has raised a general example of similar developments in Robin Hoods Bay and in particular on "Bloomswell". On inspection of the Authority's records in respect of "Bloomswell" no similar applications arose in the search. In terms of its approach, the Authority does take a consistent approach and looks at each application on its merits.

The applicant has not provided any justification that the windows cannot be repaired and no evidence to confirm that the alterations are necessary to achieve a public benefit which would offset the harm caused which is contrary to National Planning Policy contained in the NPPF and guidance as set out in Historic England's Practice Guidance, and Strategic Policy I and Policy ENV11 of the NYMNPA Local Plan.

For the above reasons refusal is recommended.

Pre-commencement conditions

N/A

Contribution to Management Plan objectives

N/A

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and have recommended appropriate amendments to the scheme.