

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2023/0250

Development description: non material amendment to planning approval NYM/2021/0908/FL to allow a change of roof material to rear buildings from steel sheets to pantiles and to the glazed lobby from timber framed to aluminium framed with glazing together with omission of flue

Site address: Ivy Cottage, High Street, Egton,

Parish: Egton

Case officer: Miss Victoria Flintoff

Applicant: Mr G Withers

Lake Farm, Thornden Lane, Rolvenden Layne, Cranbrook, TN17 4PR

Agent: BHD Design Ltd

fao: Mr Neil Duffield, Airy Hill Manor, Waterstead Lane, Whitby, YO21 1QB, United Kingdom

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following:

Condition(s)

Condition number	Condition code	Condition text						
1	PL03	<p>The development hereby approved shall only be carried out in accordance with the specific amendments to allow alterations to the roofing materials and framing along with the omission of a flue, as shown on the following document:</p> <table><thead><tr><th>Document/Drawing No.</th><th>Rev. No.</th><th>Date Received</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Proposed Section & Floor Plans (D12063-05)</td><td>E</td><td>24 April 2023</td></tr></tbody></table> <p>The development shall otherwise accord completely with the approved plans and imposed conditions and informatives of planning approval NYM/2021/0908/FL.</p>	Document/Drawing No.	Rev. No.	Date Received	Proposed Section & Floor Plans (D12063-05)	E	24 April 2023
Document/Drawing No.	Rev. No.	Date Received						
Proposed Section & Floor Plans (D12063-05)	E	24 April 2023						

Consultation responses

Parish

No comments received

Publicity expiry

N/A

Existing outbuilding at Ivy Cottage, Egton



Background

Ivy Cottage is a traditional dwelling of stone and pantile construction in a prominent location on the main high street of Egton conservation area, where there is an article 4 direction. Adjoining the property is a Grade II listed thatched cottage.

Planning permission was granted under reference NYM/2021/0508/FL for a two-storey side extension, comprising living accommodation on the first floor and an integral garage at ground floor. The application also included a single storey rear extension to replace the conservatory and a replacement porch. Subsequently, applications have been submitted to discharge the conditions surrounding this approval and a variation was approved to allow for an air source heat pump next to the garage.

Besides the work to the main dwelling, application NYM/2021/0908/FL was approved to change the use of the adjacent stone and pantile outbuilding to accommodate a home office including alterations to make it habitable and a modest lean-to extension.

This application is a non-material amendment to application NYM/2021/0908/FL which allows for a change of roof material to the rear buildings from steel sheets to pantiles and to the glazed lobby from timber framed to aluminium framed with glazing together with the omission of a flue.

Main issues

Policy Context

The relevant policies contained within the North York Moors Local Plan to consider in relation to this application are Strategic Policy C (Design), Policy CO17 (Householder Development), Strategic Policy I (The Historic Environment) and Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage).

Strategic Policy C relates to the quality and design of the development within the National Park. The policy seeks to ensure that proposals maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park through appropriate siting, orientation, layout, and density together with carefully considered scale, height, massing, and form. Proposals should incorporate good quality construction materials and design details that reflect and complement the architectural character and form of the original building and/or that of the local vernacular.

Policy CO17 states that development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings should only be permitted where the proposed scale, height, form, position, and design does not detract from and complements the character and form of the original dwelling and its setting in the landscape. The Authority will permit schemes which are sympathetic to existing buildings in terms of scale, massing, form, materials, and colour and which do not cause an unacceptable reduction in amenity either for the existing dwelling, or garden, or for neighbouring properties. All applications for planning permission should demonstrate that the principles in the Authority's Design Guide have been considered.

Strategic Policy I states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

Policy ENV11 relates to historic settlements and reaffirms that development affecting the built heritage of the North York Moors should reinforce the distinctive character by fostering a positive and sympathetic relationship with vernacular architecture, culture, materials, and construction. This includes assets recognised through statutory designation such as Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas, but also non-designated assets of local or regional significance. Protection extends to the whole building, its curtilage, and certain structures within its domain. This policy seeks to resist development that results in the loss or harm to the significance of heritage assets.

Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) considers how proposals may conserve and enhance the historic environment and seeks to ensure any harm is avoided or mitigated. Proposals should include a positive strategy for conservation with the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets through viable uses and by understanding the wider social, cultural, economic, and environmental benefits, considering the character of a place (Paragraph 190) and demonstrating the positive contribution to communities (Paragraph 197). Any harm or loss to the asset should require clear and convincing justification and any substantial harm should be refused unless it can be demonstrated that the public benefits and optimum viable use outweigh the harm to the heritage asset (Paragraph 202).

Material Considerations

Ivy Cottage is a traditional property, and it is considered that both the main dwelling and outbuilding contribute positively towards the surrounding Egton conservation area.

It was considered that the initial proposals for the outbuilding were sympathetic to the host building especially as the modest glazed extension would not be seen from the wider conservation area. It was also considered that the use as a home office would not result in an increase in noise or activity and as such is unlikely to have a harmful impact on any neighbouring amenities.

This application seeks to amend the roofing material of the re-built rear sections of the existing outbuilding from dark grey sheeting to non-interlocking pantiles. Similarly, the roof of the new lean-to extension is proposed to be constructed in aluminium rather than timber due to weight impositions. The porch itself will still be comprised of timber and will be the same dimensions as previously approved so will remain subservient and of a scale, form and materiality appropriate to the existing outbuilding and will not be visible from the highway or conservation area. It is therefore acceptable when considering Strategic Policy C and Policy C017.

The use of pantiles to match the roof of the dominant portion of the existing outbuilding is considered preferable to the grey clad roof as it is more representative of a vernacular style of outbuilding and likely resembles what may have originally covered this section of roof. The use of aluminium to frame the roof on the extension is unlikely to have a harmful impact on the character of the building and will reduce any unnecessary structural bearing on the building. Furthermore, the omission of the flue is considered preferential as it will reduce the interruption of the roofscape and prevent a non-traditional feature. Therefore, the proposal successfully meets the requirements of Strategic Policy I and Policy ENV11 by utilising sympathetic materials which are more traditional to this style of vernacular outbuilding which aids in conserving the high-quality heritage environment and local distinctiveness of the of the National Park.

Conclusion

It is considered that the proposed non-material amendments to application NYM/2021/0908/FL maintain the significance and unique character of the property and conservation area. In view of the above, the proposal adheres to Strategic Policy C, I and Policies CO17 and ENV11 of the Authority's adopted policies set out within the Local Plan and is therefore recommended for approval.

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and confirmed to the applicant/agent that the development is likely to improve the economic, social and environmental conditions of the area.