

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2023/0273

Development description: Listed Building consent for construction of timber orangery and first floor belvedere to west elevation

Site address: 11 Main Road, Aislaby

Parish: Aislaby

Case officer: Miss Lucy Gibson

Applicant: Dr A Stevenson
Park Hall, 11 Main Road, Aislaby, Whitby, YO21 1SW

Agent: Vale Garden Houses
fao: Miss Alicia Harman, Belton Park, Londonthorpe Road, Grantham, NG31 9SJ

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following:

Condition(s)

Condition number	Condition code	Condition text												
1	TM02	The works authorised by this consent shall begin not later than three years from the date of this consent.												
2	PL01	<p>The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Document Description</th> <th>Document/Drawing No.</th> <th>Date Received</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Amended location plan</td> <td>AIQ 14005-1 (P3)</td> <td>11 May 2023</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Amended elevation plans</td> <td>AIQ 14005-1 (P2i) A</td> <td>18 July 2023</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Amended floor plans</td> <td>AIQ 14005-1 (P2ii) A</td> <td>18 July 2023</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Document Description	Document/Drawing No.	Date Received	Amended location plan	AIQ 14005-1 (P3)	11 May 2023	Amended elevation plans	AIQ 14005-1 (P2i) A	18 July 2023	Amended floor plans	AIQ 14005-1 (P2ii) A	18 July 2023
Document Description	Document/Drawing No.	Date Received												
Amended location plan	AIQ 14005-1 (P3)	11 May 2023												
Amended elevation plans	AIQ 14005-1 (P2i) A	18 July 2023												
Amended floor plans	AIQ 14005-1 (P2ii) A	18 July 2023												
3	BCMT09	No work shall commence on the installation of any fenestration element in the orangery or belvedere hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details and external appearance of all external elements, including frames and glazing, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such plans should indicate the overall fenestration design on a scale of not more than 1:20, the longitudinal and cross-sectional detailing including means of opening at a scale of not more than 1:5, and moulding details (i.e., frame, glazing bar) at a scale of not more than 1:2. All fenestration elements shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.												
4	GPMT11	All new window frames and glazing bars shall be of timber construction and no other materials shall be used.												
5	GPMT12	No work shall commence to stain/paint the orangery or belvedere in the development hereby approved until details of the paint colour/finish of the structures has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall not be carried out otherwise than in accordance with the approved details, completed within six months of the date of installation and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.												

6	GPMT20	Trickle vents shall not be incorporated into any new windows hereby approved and shall not be installed thereafter.
7	MC00	All new stonework used in the development hereby permitted shall match that of the existing building including the colour and texture of the stone and the method of coursing and pointing unless otherwise agreed with the Local Planning Authority.
8	GPMT26	All rainwater and foul water goods utilised in the development hereby permitted shall be coloured black and shall thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity.

Reason(s) for condition(s)

Reason number	Reason code	Reason text
1	RSN TM02	To ensure compliance with Sections 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended.
2	RSN PL01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the National Park.
3	RSN GPMT02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
4	RSN GPMT01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
5-6	RSN GPMT02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

7	RSN GPMT01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
8	RSN GPMT02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

Consultation responses

Parish

No objections

Highways

No comments received.

Third party responses

None received.

Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date: 08 June 2023



This photograph shows the approach to the dwelling known as Park Hall, 11 Main Road and the western elevation.



This photograph is taken looking towards the north and the entrance to the dwelling, it shows the west elevation and the proposed location for the orangery and belvedere above the entrance door.

Background

Park Hall, 11 Main Road is a Grade II Listed Building located within the village of Aislaby and the Aislaby Conservation Area, which is protected by an Article 4(2) Direction. The building is believed to date from the early 19th Century with some historic extensions and alterations and is constructed from stone with a slate roof. Also Listed in their own right are the surrounding walls, gate piers and gates to the north and east of Park Hall, Characterful features include the large bay windows, sash windows and attractive surrounding curtilage with long views towards the south over the Esk Valley.

Listed Building Consent and Planning approval were granted in 2016 for internal and external alterations, the construction of an orangery extension following the demolition of the existing greenhouse together with the erection of stone balustrading to create a balcony following demolition of the first floor sun room. It is evident that the greenhouse and first floor sun room were removed however the approved orangery and balcony were not implemented.

This application seeks Listed Building Consent for the construction of a timber orangery and first floor belvedere to the west elevation.

There is an accompanying application for planning permission under the reference NYM/2023/0270.

Main issues

Local Plan

Statutory Duties

Section 16, paragraph 199 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

Section 16, paragraph 200 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 goes on to state that any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification.

The Authority has a statutory duty to protect Listed Buildings within the Park as they form part of the significance of the built and cultural heritage of the North York Moors. These buildings represent a significant part of the history and culture of the National Park and their considerable importance, once lost, cannot be replaced.

The Authority has a general duty in respect of listed buildings in its exercising of planning functions as set out in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

NYMNPA Policies

The most relevant policy contained within the North York Moors Local Plan to consider in relation to this application is Strategic Policy I (Historic Environment) and Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage).

Strategic Policy I states that all developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park through the conservation and, where appropriate enhancement of the historic environment.

Policy ENV11 seeks to resist development that results in loss of or harm to the significance of designated and other heritage assets of national importance. In order to accept any loss or harm proposals will be required to present clear and compelling justification for the development, including the public benefits which will arise from the proposal.

Discussion

It would appear that there have been minimal alterations to the building since the 19th century. The original larger glasshouse was replaced by a smaller lean to conservatory between 1952-1968. The original belvedere/glazed sun room was also replaced at a later date. Both the conservatory and sun room/belvedere have now been removed as part of the 2016 approvals.

Glazed sun room/belvedere

The original lean to belvedere on the 1st floor of the west elevation was an unusual and rare feature and as such, would have contributed greatly to the original character and special architectural significance of the Grade II Listed Building. The replacement belvedere, as originally proposed, had a flat roof and detailed window pane design to match the fenestration of the building. However, following negotiations, amended plans were received which propose a timber belvedere to reflect the design and appearance of the original structure, with a lean to roof and a simple fenestration design. The appearance of the original belvedere is evidenced by a historic photograph provided with the supporting information.

As such, it is considered that the construction of a belvedere to reflect the original feature would be a welcomed enhancement to the significance and character of the Listed Building.

Orangery

The historic, original glasshouse located on the south elevation behind the garage wall was a simple, albeit large lean to structure which extended along the whole length of the wall. The approved replacement orangery in 2016 had a hipped roof with a large roof lantern and would have sat well within the corner between the garage wall and the west elevation. The orangery, as originally proposed as part of this application, was considered to be too elaborate in its design and was of a scale that would dominate the west elevation and south elevation. This would in turn, detract from the character and significance of the building.

Following negotiations, amended plans were received that reduced the height of the proposed orangery and simplified the design, to introduce a more vertical emphasis to the fenestration, to complement and reflect the character of the host dwelling. The orangery would have a low sitting roof lantern and a timber construction.

Whilst it would have been desirable for the length of the orangery to be reduced further to reflect the scale of the orangery approved in 2016, it is recognised that the original glasshouse extended along the whole of the rear elevation of the garage wall, as evidenced by scarring on the wall and the historic photograph submitted. As such, it is considered that the proposed orangery would have a neutral impact on the significance of the designated asset and the wider Conservation Area.

The Authority's Building Conservation team also have no objections to the proposed works.

In view of the above, it is considered that the proposed works would be in line with the Authority's Adopted Policies and Section 16 of the NPPF. As such, approval is recommended.

Public Sector Equality Duty imposed by section 149 of the Equality Act 2010

The proposal is not considered to unduly affect any people with protected characteristics.

Pre-commencement conditions

N/A

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including a reduction in the scale of the orangery and an amended design for the proposed belvedere to reflect the appearance of the historic feature, so as to deliver sustainable development.