

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2023/0508

Development description: demolition of fire damaged barn and construction of one site manager's dwelling

Site address: The Grainary, Keasbeck Hill, Harwood Dale,

Parish: Harwood Dale

Case officer: Mrs Hilary Saunders

Applicant: The Grainary Harwood Dale Ltd, The Grainary, Keasbeck Hill, Harwood Dale, YO13 0DT

Agent: Mick Paxton Architects Ltd, fao: Mick Paxton, Studio 302, Woodend Creative Centre, The Crescent, Scarborough, YO11 2HG

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Refusal for the following reason(s)

Reason(s) for refusal

Refusal reason code	Refusal reason text
1	The site is located within the open countryside where there is no agricultural or other essential land management need for a new dwelling. Furthermore, new managers accommodation is only permitted when it is in the form of an extension, and it is demonstrated that it is essential to meet the needs of an existing business. The proposal is contrary to Strategic Policies A, M and Policies CO10 and BL4 as in this case, a substantial detached dwelling is proposed, and the need would only arise due to the loss of existing managers accommodation on site. The proposal would therefore result in unacceptable sporadic development in the open countryside.

Consultation responses

Parish

While there are no objections, expressed concerns as to whether the septic tank could cope with all the extra effluent from this and NYM/2023/0509.

Highways

No objections

Environmental Health

No objections

Third party responses

None received.

Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date – 12 September 2023

Dutch barn – prior to fire damage



Dutch barn after fire damage



Wider site context – associated holiday accommodation to rear and building which currently accommodates managers accommodation



Wider site context – associated holiday accommodation to rear and building which currently accommodates managers accommodation



Background

The Grainary, Keasbeck Hill, comprises a well-established tourism complex located off the main Harwood Dale road. The site previously comprised an established but diversified working farm, which also includes a bed and breakfast accommodation, and tea rooms and detached holiday accommodation, as well as walks around the farm, which are accessible for wheelchair users.

The business has recently been sold and the new owners have been undertaking a programme of refurbishment works to create a boutique hotel, along with modernising the tea room element.

This application seeks full planning permission to replace a fire damaged barn with a detached, 4 bed dwelling to provide managers accommodation, to replace the existing managers accommodation located between the restaurant and staff rooms. There is a separate application to convert the existing managers accommodation into further rooms for the business, as well as an extension to the restaurant and commercial kitchen, in order to add an additional 4 bedrooms and approximately 30 more covers, and additional kitchen preparation space.

In support of the application the applicant has provided the following information: -

Since taking on the property, we have invested a huge amount of time and money into the business. We opened just over a year ago and we now employ over 30 members of staff, all from the surrounding area, we support many local businesses and most importantly we drive a huge number of visitors to the area – showcasing the beauty of the North York Moors. We are now looking at ways to expand to accommodate the demand we face daily.

Not only is the barn conversion imperative to the success of the business, on a personal note, I feel very passionately about it. I am currently sandwiched in the middle of the rooms, restaurant and staff areas and having two young children, this can sometimes prove to be very difficult. The new proposed development would be far more aesthetically pleasing and would be made from a combination of stone and wood and a fibre cement roof, looking very much like an agricultural barn.

Main issues

Local Plan

Strategic Policy A (National Park Purposes) seeks to take a positive approach to new development, in line with the presumption in favour of sustainable development and where decisions are consistent with National Park statutory purposes:

1. To conserve and enhance the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park;

2. To promote opportunities for the understanding and enjoyment of the special qualities of the National Park by the public.

It goes on to state that where there is an irreconcilable conflict between the statutory purposes the Sandford Principle will be applied, and greater weight will be attached to the first purpose of conserving and enhancing the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park.

Strategic Policy M (Housing) seeks to ensure the delivery of new homes to help meet the needs of local communities and be delivered through focusing development within listed settlements, rather than the open countryside. In the open countryside development will only be supported where it helps meet the needs of agricultural, forestry or other essential land management activities.

Policy CO10 (Housing in Open Countryside) seeks to ensure that in order to maintain the quality of the National Park landscape, housing development in Open Countryside will only be permitted where there is an essential need to support established farming, forestry or other essential land management activities, where an existing dwelling is to be replaced; or where a rural building is of architectural or historic interest and is to be converted.

Policy BL4 (Managers and Staff Accommodation) -sets out that the development of staff accommodation to meet the needs of an existing hotel, public house, hostel or permanent tourist facility will only be permitted where it can be demonstrated that it is essential to meet the needs of the existing business; suitable accommodation is not available; and there has been no recent loss of staff accommodation to other uses. Where the above requirements are met, staff accommodation will only be permitted if the proposal is for a small-scale extension to form a self-contained annexe, or a non-permanent, small scale and unobtrusive lodge, chalet or log cabin within the curtilage of the existing business or facility.

Material Considerations

The construction of a substantial dwelling to provide managers accommodation is contrary to both Strategic Policies A, M and Policies CO10 and BL4. A substantial detached dwelling is proposed where there is no agricultural or other essential land management need. Furthermore, the site is visible from across the valley at Reasty Bank and the construction of a substantial dwelling would have a significantly different appearance than the existing agricultural Dutch barn, and would result in unacceptable sporadic development in the open countryside in a protected landscape.

Furthermore, the need put forward is due to the loss of existing on-site managers accommodation. Whilst it is acknowledged that the addition of letting bedrooms would satisfy demand, this does not overcome the unacceptability of the resultant new dwelling that would be required as a result.

Conclusion

The construction of a substantial detached dwelling to provide managers accommodation is contrary to both Strategic Policies A, M and Policies CO10 and BL4 and therefore refusal is recommended.

Public Sector Equality Duty imposed by section 149 of the Equality Act 2010

The proposal is not considered to unduly affect any people with protected characteristics.

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and concluded that the scheme represents a form of development so far removed from the vision of the sustainable development supported in the Development Plan that no changes could be negotiated to render the scheme acceptable and thus no changes were requested.