

# North York Moors National Park Authority

## Delegated decision report

**Application reference number:** NYM/2023/0343

**Development description:** partial rebuilding and conversion of barn to form two holiday letting cottages with amenity spaces

**Site address:** Manor House Farm, Troutsdale

**Parish:** Broxa-Cum-Troutsdale

**Case officer:** Mrs Hilary Saunders

**Applicant:** Mr John Guthrie  
Little Hiila Green, Troutsdale, Hackness, YO13 0BS

**Agent:** Alan Campbell Architects  
fao: Mr Alan Campbell, 7 Cliff Bridge Terrace, Scarborough, YO11 2HA

## Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following:

### Condition(s)

Condition number	Condition code	Condition text																		
1	TM01	The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than three years from the date of this decision.																		
2	PL01	The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: <table><thead><tr><th>Document Description</th><th>Drawing No</th><th>Date Received</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Location plan</td><td>1711/01A</td><td>30/05/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Ground floor layout as proposed</td><td>1711/07D</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>First floor layout as proposed</td><td>1711/08C</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Elevations as proposed 1</td><td>1711/09B</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Elevations as proposed 2</td><td>1711/10B</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr></tbody></table>	Document Description	Drawing No	Date Received	Location plan	1711/01A	30/05/2023	Ground floor layout as proposed	1711/07D	5/10/2023	First floor layout as proposed	1711/08C	5/10/2023	Elevations as proposed 1	1711/09B	5/10/2023	Elevations as proposed 2	1711/10B	5/10/2023
Document Description	Drawing No	Date Received																		
Location plan	1711/01A	30/05/2023																		
Ground floor layout as proposed	1711/07D	5/10/2023																		
First floor layout as proposed	1711/08C	5/10/2023																		
Elevations as proposed 1	1711/09B	5/10/2023																		
Elevations as proposed 2	1711/10B	5/10/2023																		
3	UOR12	The holiday letting units hereby approved shall not be used for residential purposes other than holiday letting purposes. For the purpose of this condition 'holiday letting' means letting to the same person, group of persons or family for period(s) not exceeding a total of 28 days in any one calendar year.																		

Document title

4	UOR15	The units of holiday letting accommodation hereby permitted shall form and remain part of the current Planning Unit presently known as Manor House Farm as shown edged blue/red on the site location plan dated 8 June 2023. The holiday units shall not be let out or used in any way if the holiday letting units are functionally separated (either Freehold or Leasehold) and shall at all times remain together in the same overall Planning Unit.
5	AC20	No external lighting shall be installed in the development hereby permitted until details of lighting have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The lighting shall be Dark Skies compliant, and no other lighting shall be installed on the site. The lighting shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
6	BCMT05A	Any pointing in the development hereby permitted should be based on a typical mix of a non-hydraulic quicklime mortar mixed at a ratio of 1:3 (dry non-hydraulic quicklime: sand). Joints in stonework should be carefully raked out utilising hand tools narrower than the width of the joint to a minimum depth of 1½ times the width of the joint or until sound mortar is reached. Power tools including drills, grinders must not be used. The pointing shall thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
7	MC00	The exposed surfaces of any new stonework or newly cut stone faces to the building to which this permission relates will be hand-tooled to match the existing stonework.
8	BCMT09	No work shall commence on the installation of any fenestration element in the development hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details and external appearance of all external elements, including frames and glazing, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such plans should indicate the overall fenestration design on a scale of not more than 1:20, the longitudinal and cross-sectional detailing including means of opening at a scale of not more than 1:5, and moulding details (i.e., frame, glazing bar) at a scale of not more than 1:2. All fenestration elements shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.

9	BCMT10	The details (including tooling if necessary) of any new lintels and cills of all new windows hereby approved, together with any replacement lintels and cills, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall accord with the details hereby approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
10	BCMT02	The roof of the development hereby permitted shall be clad with traditional, handmade natural red clay pantiles the details of which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
11	MCOO	<p>The crossing of the highway verge must be constructed in accordance with the Standard Detail number E9A (bituminous) or E20 (concrete) and the following requirements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Any gates or barriers must not be able to swing over the existing or proposed highway.</li> <li>- Provision to prevent surface water from the site/plot discharging onto the existing or proposed highway must be constructed and maintained thereafter to prevent such discharges.</li> <li>- The final surfacing of any private access within 2 metres of the public highway must not contain any loose material that is capable of being drawn on to the existing or proposed public highway.</li> <li>- Measures to enable vehicles to enter and leave the site in a forward gear.</li> </ul> <p>All works must accord with the approved details.</p>
12	MISCOO	<p>Prior to the development hereby approved being first brought into use, details of the provision of bat boxes within the site, as well as other measures such as swift boxes/swallow cups/sparrow terraces etc shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details shall also demonstrate how areas that will be used by nocturnal wildlife will not be illuminated.</p> <p>The works shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained in that manner in perpetuity.</p>

13	MISCO	Notwithstanding the details shown on the approved plans, no works shall commence to install a boundary treatment between the rear terraces until details of that boundary treatment have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The site boundary treatment works shall then be implemented in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained in perpetuity.
14	BC06	This permission/consent has been granted in accordance with the details specified in the survey prepared by T M Hunt Chartered Building Engineer MCABE dated 14 July 2023. More extensive works of demolition, alteration or rebuilding that does not accord with these details will render the permission invalid and will require a further grant of planning permission and/or Listed Building consent from the Local Planning Authority.

**Reason(s) for condition(s)**

Reason number	Reason code	Reason text
1	RSN TM01	To ensure compliance with Sections 91 to 94 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended.
2	RSN PL01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the National Park.
3	RSN UOR11	The site is in a location where new residential development would be contrary to Strategic Policy M of the North York Moors Local Plan but permission for holiday accommodation has been permitted in accordance with Policy UE4 and to ensure that a traditional rural building is conserved in line with Policy CO12.
4	RSN UOR09	The site is in a location where the occupation of the accommodation hereby permitted as a separate independent dwelling unit would be contrary to Strategic Policy M of the North York Moors Local Plan.
5	RSN AC01	In order to enable the Local Planning Authority to retain control over future alterations to the property in the interests of safeguarding the existing form and character of the building in line with North York Moors Local Plan Strategic Policies A and

		C, which seek to enhance and conserve the special qualities of the National Park and secure high quality design for new development that does not detract from the quality of life of local residents; in accordance with Policy ENV4 which seeks to protect dark night skies.
6, 7 & 10	RSN BCMT01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
8 & 9	RSN BCMT02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
11	RSN MHC- 03	To ensure a satisfactory means of access to the site from the public highway in the interests of highway safety and the convenience of all highway users.
12	MC04	To enhance Protected and Priority Species/habitats and allow the Local Planning Authority to discharge its duties under the s40 of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 (Priority habitats & species).
13	BC04	In order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 this seek to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have an unacceptable impact on the buildings special historic or architectural interest.
14	BC02	In order to ensure that the development is carried out in a manner which safeguards the existing fabric of the building and to minimise the risk of any unforeseen collapse of the building and to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 which seek to ensure that alterations do not have an unacceptable impact on the special historic or architectural interest of the building.

### Informative(s)

Informative number	Informative code	Informative text
1	MC INF03	The applicant is advised that this permission cannot be implemented until the associated Listed Building consent has been approved by the Local Planning Authority.
2	INF MHI-C	Notwithstanding any valid planning permission for works to amend the existing highway, you are advised that a separate licence will be required from North Yorkshire County Council as the Local Highway Authority in order to allow any works in the existing public highway to be carried out. The 'Specification for Housing and Industrial Estate Roads and Private Street Works' published by North Yorkshire County Council as the Local Highway Authority, is available to download from the County Council's website [ <a href="https://www.northyorks.gov.uk/road-adoption">https://www.northyorks.gov.uk/road-adoption</a> ]. The Local Highway Authority will also be pleased to provide the detailed constructional specifications referred to in this condition.
3	MISC	The property is on a private water supply so the applicant should be aware of the need for regular maintenance of the water disinfection system and testing of the water to ensure its wholesomeness.

### Consultation responses

#### Parish

No objections are offered. Please ensure that any external lighting is dark skies compliant.

#### Highways

No objections subject to conditions

The application proposes to convert a disused and dilapidated barn into two holiday cottages. The original design showed design and the application showed that each cottage would have two bedrooms, however amended plans now show three bedrooms.

Some of the existing old farm buildings and the farmhouse itself have also been converted to holiday letting accommodation currently for upto a total of 13 guests. The proposed two three bed units for up to 6 guests each, would increase that to a potential total of 25 guests and their associated vehicles, for this one previous single farmstead.

Troutsdale Road which runs between the buildings of the application site is a twisting single track rural lane with occasional passing places. The potential increased number of vehicles unfamiliar with the route is of concern and the number of bedrooms should be reduced to limit the impact on the local highway network.

The parking arrangement is not shown on the submitted plans however the area to the rear of the buildings could accommodate parking. The access to the proposed rear parking area is currently loosely compacted stone and should be constructed to the LHA's required specification to prevent any further damage to the edge of the carriageway.

### Environmental Health

No objections in principle but am concerned that the plans submitted appear to show the route of escape for sleeping occupants in case of fire to be routed through via a high-risk room, namely the kitchen, and would like to see this amended.

In addition, the property is on a private water supply. The applicant should be aware of the need for regular maintenance of the water disinfection system and testing of the water to ensure its wholesomeness.

Revised plans -20/09/2023 - No objections to the proposals on housing grounds.

### Third party responses

None received.

### Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date – 25 October 2023

Building now after roof collapse



## Building as it was in 2009



### Background

Manor House Farm, Troutsdale comprises an original dwelling and a range of stone and pantile outbuildings, which together form a courtyard. The farmhouse, outbuildings and barn (now partially collapsed) are all individually listed.

Planning permission and listed building consent were granted in 2016 for the conversion of the single storey range of outbuildings, located between the main farmhouse and what was the more substantial outbuilding.

The large two storey barn suffered a roof collapse earlier this year and this application seeks permission to reconstruct this building and change the use to form two holiday lets.

The proposals would provide two 3 bed holiday cottages, with kitchen and living space, bathroom and one bedroom at ground floor and 2 bedrooms at first floor along with an open gallery landing over the living room.

Each unit would have a terrace area at the rear and then parking would be in the rear yard area.

### Main issues

#### Local Plan

Strategic Policy C (Design) seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park, and states that development will only be supported where it is of a



high quality design; incorporates good quality construction materials and design details that reflect architectural character and form of the original building or the local vernacular; the siting, orientation, layout and density complement existing buildings; the scale, height, massing and form are compatible with surrounding buildings and not have an adverse impact upon the amenities of adjoining occupiers; sustainable design and construction techniques are incorporated; there is a good quality landscaping and planting scheme; local wildlife and biodiversity is enhanced; provision is made for adequate storage, cycling facilities and car parking are provided and the proposal ensures the creation of an accessible, safe and secure environment for all potential users.

Strategic Policy I (The Historic Environment) seeks to ensure that developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park and that development should conserve heritage assets and their setting in a manner appropriate to their significance, especially those assets which contribute most to the distinctive character of the area.

Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage) This policy seeks to resist development that results in loss of or harm to the significance of designated and other heritage assets of national importance. In order to accept any loss or harm proposals will be required to present clear and compelling justification for the development, including the public benefits which will arise from the proposal. This includes assets which are recognised through formal designation such as Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas which benefit from statutory protection, but also non-designated assets of local or regional significance that contribute to the special qualities of the National Park.

Policy CO12 (Conversion of Existing Buildings in Open Countryside) seeks to permit such development only where the building is of architectural or historic interest and makes a positive contribution to the landscape and special qualities of the National Park; is structurally sound and capable of conversion without substantial rebuilding, is appropriately sized for its intended use without the need for significant alterations, extensions or other new buildings; has reasonable access to necessary infrastructure, services and facilities; is of a high quality design retaining existing external features which contribute significantly to the character of the building including original openings and roofing materials; does not lead to changes in the building's curtilage or in relation to any new vehicular access or parking area that would adversely affect the character and appearance of the building or the surrounding landscape; is located within an existing group of buildings that have a close physical and visual relationship to each other; and the proposed use is compatible in nature, scale and level of activity with the surrounding locality and any neighbouring buildings.

Policy ENV4 (Dark Night Skies) seeks to ensure that the darkness of the night skies above the National Park are maintained and enhanced and requires that all

development will be expected to minimise light spillage through good design and lighting management.

### Material Considerations

In this instance, the building is in a poor state of repair having partially collapsed, with the roof and gables requiring re-building and if not listed, might not be considered to be suitable for re-build and conversion into holiday accommodation.

However, in this instance the building is listed in its own right and it is part of a group of listed buildings, and therefore it is considered important for the integrity of the group to re-build the building and find a suitable long term use. This is considered to be in accordance with Strategic Policy I and Policy ENV11. In terms of Policy CO12, the building is of historic importance and whilst the submitted structural survey indicates some gable end re-build as well as the roof, the majority of the walls are still in place and it is considered important to rebuild, due to its listed status.

In terms of design, the scheme has been amended to better reflect the openings that were originally in the building and the scheme has been amended in accordance with the requests made by the Building Conservation Officer who now has no objection to the proposals. It is considered to be in accordance with Strategic Policy C.

In terms of the protection of Dark Skies, it is recommended that a condition is attached to ensure dark sky compliant lighting.

### Conclusion

The proposal will result in the repair and suitable future use for this partially collapsed listed building and is considered to be in accordance with the Policies outlined above, consequently approval is recommended.

### Public Sector Equality Duty imposed by section 149 of the Equality Act 2010

The proposal is not considered to unduly affect any people with protected characteristics.

### Pre-commencement conditions

N/A

### Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including changes to the design, so as to deliver sustainable development.