

North York Moors National Park Authority

Delegated decision report

Application reference number: NYM/2023/0345

Development description: Listed Building consent for partial rebuilding and conversion of barn to form two holiday letting cottages

Site address: Manor House Farm, Troutsdale

Parish: Broxa-Cum-Troutsdale

Case officer: Mrs Hilary Saunders

Applicant: Mr John Guthrie
Little Hilla Green, Troutsdale, Hackness, YO13 0BS

Agent: Alan Campbell Architects
fao: Mr Alan Campbell, 7 Cliff Bridge Terrace, Scarborough, YO11 2HA

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following:

Condition(s)

Condition number	Condition code	Condition text																		
1	TM02	The works authorised by this consent shall begin not later than three years from the date of this consent.																		
2	PL01	The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: <table border="1"><thead><tr><th>Document Description</th><th>Drawing No</th><th>Date Received</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Location plan</td><td>1711/01A</td><td>30/05/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Ground floor layout as proposed</td><td>1711/07D</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>First floor layout as proposed</td><td>1711/08C</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Elevations as proposed 1</td><td>1711/09B</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr><tr><td>Elevations as proposed 2</td><td>1711/10B</td><td>5/10/2023</td></tr></tbody></table>	Document Description	Drawing No	Date Received	Location plan	1711/01A	30/05/2023	Ground floor layout as proposed	1711/07D	5/10/2023	First floor layout as proposed	1711/08C	5/10/2023	Elevations as proposed 1	1711/09B	5/10/2023	Elevations as proposed 2	1711/10B	5/10/2023
Document Description	Drawing No	Date Received																		
Location plan	1711/01A	30/05/2023																		
Ground floor layout as proposed	1711/07D	5/10/2023																		
First floor layout as proposed	1711/08C	5/10/2023																		
Elevations as proposed 1	1711/09B	5/10/2023																		
Elevations as proposed 2	1711/10B	5/10/2023																		
3	GPMT01	No work shall commence on the construction of the walls of the development hereby permitted until details of the external																		

Document title

		materials, colour, texture and finish, including samples if so required by the Local Planning Authority, to be used for the external surfaces of the development including for walling and dressings have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The stone used shall accord with the approved details and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
4	GPMT02	No work shall commence on the construction of the walls hereby approved until a sample of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces shall have been prepared on site for inspection and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. A sample panel showing the construction materials shall be at least 1 metre x 1 metre and show the proposed material, coursing, jointing, method of tooling (if necessary), bond, mortar, pointing technique. A palette of other materials to be used in the development (including roofing, water tabling, new lintels and cills, cladding and render if necessary) shall also be made available. The development shall be constructed in accordance with the approved sample(s), which shall not be removed from the site until completion of the development.
5	GPMT03	All new external materials used in the development hereby permitted shall match that of the existing building including the colour and texture and finish and where these include stone and/or brick, the method of coursing and pointing in the local tradition.
6	BC04	No work shall commence on the development hereby approved until full details of all existing and proposed wall, ceiling, and floor constructions, including materials, method of construction and if required by the Local Planning Authority a sectional detail of not more than 1:5, e.g., plaster, insulation, panelling, floor construction, any applied substances and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall not be carried out otherwise than in accordance with the approved details.
7	BC05	No work shall commence on site to demolish and reconstruct the parts of the building as specified in the survey prepared by T M Hunt Chartered Building Engineer MCABE dated 14 July 2023, until a statement detailing the method of dismantling and reconstructing the building has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The statement shall provide for the reuse of the existing materials, safeguarding of materials, details and position of any new

		materials and shall include annotated drawings of the existing and proposed elevations of the building. The work shall not be carried out otherwise than in accordance with the details so approved.
8	BC07	No work shall commence on the installation of any external fixtures to the building to which this permission/consent relates until details of all external fixtures have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details should include for provision for any exterior lighting, heat pumps, meter boxes, signage, wall or roof flues, television antennae and satellite dishes that may be proposed to be installed. The external fixtures shall be installed wholly in accordance with the approved details.
9	BCMT05A	Any pointing in the development hereby permitted should be based on a typical mix of a non-hydraulic quicklime mortar mixed at a ratio of 1:3 (dry non-hydraulic quicklime: sand). Joints in stonework should be carefully raked out utilising hand tools narrower than the width of the joint to a minimum depth of 1½ times the width of the joint or until sound mortar is reached. Power tools including drills, grinders must not be used. The pointing shall thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
10	BCMT06	No joints shall be raked out until a sample area which shall be at least 1m x 1m in size has been prepared on site for inspection and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Joints in stonework should be carefully raked out utilising hand tools narrower than the width of the joint to a minimum depth of 1½ times the width of the joint or until sound mortar is reached. Power tools including drills, grinders must not be used. The work shall continue in accordance with the approved sample.
11	BCMT07	All new or replacement plasterwork/render (excluding to modern stud walls) in the development hereby permitted shall accord with a specification approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The mix proposed should be of a traditional lime mix based on a typical mix of a non-hydraulic quicklime mortar mixed at a ratio of 1:3 (dry non-hydraulic quicklime: sand) and include the method of application and finish. A sample area may also be required by the Local Planning Authority. The plaster/render shall thereafter be so maintained.
12	BCMT08	The exposed surfaces of any new stonework or newly cut stone faces to the building to which this permission relates will be

		hand-tooled to match the existing stonework.
13	BCMT09	No work shall commence on the installation of any fenestration element in the development hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details and external appearance of all external elements, including frames and glazing, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such plans should indicate the overall fenestration design on a scale of not more than 1:20, the longitudinal and cross-sectional detailing including means of opening at a scale of not more than 1:5, and moulding details (i.e., frame, glazing bar) at a scale of not more than 1:2. All fenestration elements shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
14	BCMT10	The details (including tooling if necessary) of any new lintels and cills of all new windows hereby approved, together with any replacement lintels and cills, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall accord with the details hereby approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
15	BCMT02	The roof of the development hereby permitted shall be clad with traditional, handmade natural red clay pantiles the details of which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
16	AC20	No external lighting shall be installed in the development hereby permitted until details of lighting have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The lighting shall be Dark Skies compliant, and no other lighting shall be installed on the site. The lighting shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity.
17	MC00	Prior to the development hereby approved being first brought into use, details of the provision of bat boxes within the site, as well as other measures such as swift boxes/swallow cups/sparrow terraces etc shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details shall also demonstrate how areas that will be used by nocturnal wildlife will not be illuminated. The works shall be implemented in accordance with the

		approved details and shall be maintained in that manner in perpetuity.
18	MC00	Notwithstanding the details shown on the approved plans, no works shall commence to install a boundary treatment between the rear terraces until details of that boundary treatment have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The site boundary treatment works shall then be implemented in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained in perpetuity.
19	MISC00	This permission/consent has been granted in accordance with the details specified in the survey prepared by T M Hunt Chartered Building Engineer MCABE dated 14 July 2023. More extensive works of demolition, alteration or rebuilding that does not accord with these details will render the permission invalid and will require a further grant of planning permission and/or Listed Building consent from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason(s) for condition(s)

Reason number	Reason code	Reason text
1	RSN TM01	To ensure compliance with Sections 91 to 94 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended.
2	RSN PL01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the National Park.
3-5	RSN GPMT01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
6&7	RSN BC02	In order to ensure that the development is carried out in a manner which safeguards the existing fabric of the building and to minimise the risk of any unforeseen collapse [delete if necessary] of the building and to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 which seek to ensure that alterations do not have an unacceptable impact on the special historic or architectural interest of the building.

8	RSN BC04	In order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 this seek to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have an unacceptable impact on the buildings special historic or architectural interest.
9-12&15	RSN BCMT01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
13 & 14	RSN BCMT02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policies A and C of the North York Moors Local Plan which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
16	RSN AC01	In order to enable the Local Planning Authority to retain control over future alterations to the property in the interests of safeguarding the existing form and character of the building in line with North York Moors Local Plan Strategic Policies A and C, which seek to enhance and conserve the special qualities of the National Park and secure high quality design for new development that does not detract from the quality of life of local residents; in accordance with Policy ENV4 which seeks to protect dark night skies.
17	RSN MISC04	To enhance Protected and Priority Species/habitats and allow the Local Planning Authority to discharge its duties under the s40 of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 (Priority habitats & species).
18	RSN BC04	In order to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 this seek to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have an unacceptable impact on the buildings special historic or architectural interest.
19	BC02	In order to ensure that the development is carried out in a manner which safeguards the existing fabric of the building and to minimise the risk of any unforeseen collapse of the building and to comply with the provisions of Strategic Policy I and Development Policy ENV11 which seek to ensure that alterations do not have an unacceptable impact on the special

		historic or architectural interest of the building.
--	--	---

Informative(s)

Informative number	Informative code	Informative text
1	MC INF03	The applicant is advised that this permission cannot be implemented until the associated planning permission has been approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Consultation responses

Parish

No objections are offered. Please ensure that any external lighting is dark skies compliant.

Historic England

We suggest that you seek the views of your specialist conservation and archaeological advisers

Third party responses

None received.

Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date – 26 July 2023

Building now after roof



collapse

Building as it was in 2009



Background

Manor House Farm, Troutdale comprises an original dwelling and a range of stone and pantile outbuildings, which together form a courtyard. The farmhouse, outbuildings and barn (now partially collapsed) are all individually listed.

Planning permission and listed building consent were granted in 2016 for the conversion of the single storey range of outbuildings, located between the main farmhouse and what was the more substantial outbuilding.

The large two storey barn suffered a roof collapse earlier this year and this application seeks permission to reconstruct this building and change the use to form two holiday lets.

The proposals would provide two 3 bed holiday cottages, with kitchen and living space, bathroom and one bedroom at ground floor and 2 bedrooms at first floor along with an open gallery landing over the living room.

Each unit would have a terrace area at the rear and then parking would be in the rear yard area.

Main issues

Manor House Farm is a collection of 3 grade 2 listed buildings being: Manor Farmhouse, The Smithy (listed as; Outbuildings to East of Manor Farmhouse) and Stable with Attached barn north of Manor Farm House (of which this application relates).

Subsequently, this application has been determined in accordance with Section 16 the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990. Chapter 16 of the NPPF paragraphs 189, 195, 200 and 202, as well as relevant policies in the North York Moors National Park Authority Local Plan.

Local Plan

Strategic Policy C (Design) seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park, and states that development will only be supported where it is of a high quality design; incorporates good quality construction materials and design details that reflect architectural character and form of the original building or the local vernacular; the siting, orientation, layout and density complement existing buildings; the scale, height, massing and form are compatible with surrounding buildings and not have an adverse impact upon the amenities of adjoining occupiers; sustainable design and construction techniques are incorporated; there is a good quality landscaping and planting scheme; local wildlife and biodiversity is enhanced; provision is made for adequate storage, cycling facilities and car parking are provided and the proposal ensures the creation of an accessible, safe and secure environment for all potential users.

Strategic Policy I (The Historic Environment) seeks to ensure that developments affecting the historic environment should make a positive contribution to the cultural heritage and local distinctiveness of the National Park and that development should conserve heritage assets and their setting in a manner appropriate to their significance, especially those assets which contribute most to the distinctive character of the area.

Policy ENV11 (Historic Settlements and Built Heritage) This policy seeks to resist development that results in loss of or harm to the significance of designated and other heritage assets of national importance. In order to accept any loss or harm proposals will be required to present clear and compelling justification for the development, including the public benefits which will arise from the proposal. This includes assets which are recognised through formal designation such as Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas which benefit from statutory protection, but also non-designated assets of local or regional significance that contribute to the special qualities of the National Park.

Policy CO12 (Conversion of Existing Buildings in Open Countryside) seeks to permit such development only where the building is of architectural or historic interest and makes a positive contribution to the landscape and special qualities of the National Park; is structurally sound and capable of conversion without substantial rebuilding, is appropriately sized for its intended use without the need for significant alterations, extensions or other new buildings; has reasonable access to necessary infrastructure, services and facilities; is of a high quality design retaining existing external features which contribute significantly to the character of the building including original openings and roofing materials; does not lead to changes in the building's curtilage or in relation to any new vehicular access or parking area that would adversely affect the character and appearance of the building or the surrounding landscape; is located within an existing group of buildings that have a close physical and visual relationship to each other; and the proposed use is compatible in nature, scale and level of activity with the surrounding locality and any neighbouring buildings.

Material Considerations

In this instance, the building is in a poor state of repair having partially collapsed, with the roof and gables requiring re-building and if not listed, might not be considered to be suitable for re-build and conversion into holiday accommodation.

However, in this instance the building is listed in its own right and it is part of a group of listed buildings, and therefore it is considered important for the integrity of the group to re-build the building and find a suitable long term use. This is considered to be in accordance with Strategic Policy I and Policy ENV11. In terms of Policy CO12, the building is of historic importance and whilst the submitted structural survey indicates some gable end re-build as well as the roof, the majority of the walls are still in place and it is considered important to rebuild, due to its listed status.

In terms of design, the scheme has been amended to better reflect the openings that were originally in the building and the scheme has been amended in accordance with the requests made by the Building Conservation Officer who now has no objection to the proposals. It is considered to be in accordance with Strategic Policy C.

In terms of the protection of Dark Skies, it is recommended that a condition is attached to ensure dark sky compliant lighting.

Conclusion

The proposal will result in the repair and suitable future use for this partially collapsed listed building and is considered to be in accordance with the Policies outlined above, consequently approval is recommended.

Public Sector Equality Duty imposed by section 149 of the Equality Act 2010

The proposal is not considered to unduly affect any people with protected characteristics.

Pre-commencement conditions

N/A

Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including changes to the design, so as to deliver sustainable development.