

# North York Moors National Park Authority

## Delegated decision report

**Application reference number:** NYM/2023/0784

**Development description:** construction of first floor rear extension with balcony (revised scheme following refusal of NYM/2023/0276)

**Site address:** Underhill Cottage, Blue Bank, Sleights

**Parish:** Eskdaleside-Cum-Ugglebarnby

**Case officer:** Miss Megan O'Mara

**Applicant:** Mr A Hodgson

Underhill Cottage, Blue Bank, Sleights, Whitby, North Yorkshire, YO22 5EU

**Agent:** Cheryl Ward Planning

fao: Cheryl Farrow, 24 Westfield Mews, Kirkbymoorside, York, YO62 6BA

## Director of Planning's Recommendation

Refusal for the following reason:

### Reason(s) for refusal

Refusal reason code	Refusal reason text
1	The proposed extension, by reason of scale, height, form, position and design, would detract from the character and form of the original dwelling and the development is therefore considered contrary to Strategic Policy C, Policy CO12 and Policy CO17 of the Authority's Adopted Policies, as set out within the Local Plan.

## Consultation responses

No responses

## Third party responses

No responses

## Publicity expiry

Advertisement/site notice expiry date: 26 December 2023

This photo shows the east elevation of the dwelling, as existing.



This photo shows the south elevation of the rear outshot, to which this application relates.



This photo shows the north elevation of the outshot, as existing.



## Background

Underhill Cottage is a traditional stone and pantile farmhouse accessed via a private track to the east of the A169 and located to the south of Sleights. An attached outbuilding, which is in use as a holiday cottage is located to the south of the main house with a detached stone and slate outbuilding to the east.

An application for the change of use and conversion of the detached outbuilding located to the east of the dwelling into a holiday let was approved in April 2022. A certificate of lawfulness was recently granted for the conversion of the adjoining outbuilding to holiday letting accommodation.

Planning permission was refused for the construction of a first-floor rear extension above the existing rear outshot, with a balcony inset, to provide an additional bedroom in 2023 (NYM/2023/0276). The rear outshot appears to be converted agricultural buildings, evidenced by the design and form of the building and the presence of pig troughs at ground floor on the eastern gable; however, they have been in residential use for some time now.

This application is a revised scheme of the previous refusal (NYM/2023/0276), again seeking planning permission for the construction of a first-floor rear extension above the existing rear outshot, with a balcony inset, to provide an additional bedroom.

## Main issues

### Local Plan

Strategic Policy C relates to the quality and design of development within the National Park. The policy seeks to ensure that proposed development maintains and enhances the distinctive character of the National Park through appropriate siting, orientation, layout and density together with carefully considered scale, height, massing and form. Proposals should incorporate good quality construction materials and design details that reflect and complement the architectural character and form of the original building and/or that of the local vernacular.

Policy CO12 relates specifically to the conversion of existing buildings in the open countryside. The policy states that development will only be permitted where the building is of architectural or historic interest and makes a positive contribution to the landscape and special qualities of the National Park. The building must be structurally sound and capable of conversion without substantial rebuilding and the building must be appropriately sized for its intended use without the need for significant alterations, extensions or other new buildings. The development must be of high-quality design that reflects the form and character of the building and provides for essential functional requirements without unacceptable harm to the fabric of the building or its setting. The design should retain existing external features which contribute significantly to the character of the building including original openings and roofing materials.

Policy CO17 states that development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings should only be permitted where the scale, height, form, position and design of the new development does not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape. The policy also states that the development should reflect the principles outlined in the Authority's Design Guide.

## Discussion

Underhill Cottage follows a traditional linear form and is constructed of stone, which is reflective of the local vernacular. The main dwelling is under slate with the adjoining outbuildings under pantile. To the rear of the dwelling is a stepped outshot that appears to be converted agricultural buildings, with pig troughs still present at ground floor on the east gable of the outshot. The former outbuildings adjoining the dwelling have clearly been in residential use for some time and although windows of a domestic appearance have been introduced, the buildings do retain much of their original character.

This application is a revised scheme of the previous refusal (NYM/2023/0276) and seeks planning permission for the construction of a first-floor extension above the existing outshot to provide an additional bedroom. Both Strategic Policy C and Policy CO17 are clear that development will only be supported where the proposed development will reflect and complement the architectural character and form of the original building and/or that of the local vernacular. The scale, height, form, position and design of new development should not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape. Policy CO17 also states that any extension should be clearly subservient to the main part of the building and the applicants were advised of this during the pre-application process.

Although the rear outshot has been in residential use for some time now, it does retain its former agricultural character and as such, Policy CO12 has also been applied in the assessment of the proposals. Policy CO12 requires proposed development to be of a high-quality design that reflects the form and character of the building and provides for essential functional requirements without unacceptable harm to the fabric of the building or its setting. The policy is also clear that the Authority will not support significant alterations or extensions to converted buildings within the open countryside. It is noted that the applicants have challenged the application of Policy CO12; the rear outshot was and always will be converted agricultural buildings, this will not change through passage of time. It is accepted that alterations have occurred that have impacted the original character, however this does not justify perpetuation of poor-quality interventions. Nevertheless, whilst Policy CO12 has been applied, the weight predominantly falls on Policy CO17 (Householder Development) and Strategic Policy C (Design) of the Authority's adopted policies.

The plans submitted with this application do not reflect the advice given during the pre-application process, both on site and in letter form. The applicants were advised during the pre-application process that the Authority would not support the raising of the

height of the end section of the existing outshot by an additional floor because the rear projection sits on a split level and the proposed development would therefore result in a three-storey appearance on the gable. A three-storey gable is not a feature that is typically found within the North York Moors National Park, especially on a building of utilitarian character such as Underhill Cottage. It is appreciated that the ridge height of the extension would sit below the ridge of the main house, however when viewed from north, east and south, the overall bulk, scale and height of the development would fail to appear subservient to the modest two-storey host dwelling. The revised scheme has actually slightly raised the height of the first section of the outshot, and slightly lowered the ridge height of the end section. The amendment is so subtle (20cm) it is not considered to have any bearing on the assessment of the development under the previous application (NYM/2023/0276).

In its current form, the dwelling is well proportioned and the outshot compliments the host building and the surrounding setting well. The building sits comfortably and sympathetically within the landscape and although the applicant considers that the proposed development would have very little impact on long distance views of the site, the Authority is of the view that the first-floor extension would have a considerable impact on the appearance and proportions of the dwelling, resulting in harm to the original character and form of Underhill Cottage, dominating the rear elevation.

The design of the proposed extension is also considered to be harmful to the character of the host building by failing to reflect traditional features of the local vernacular, particularly the glazed inset balcony on the gable elevation. The large inset balcony includes extensive glazing, together with a glazed balustrade, neither of which would typically be found on converted buildings with agricultural character, especially at this height; nor would this feature be found on typical farmhouses throughout the National Park. The scale of the openings and the balcony create a top-heavy appearance on the gable elevation, which is considered to be poor design and harmful to the original character of the building and would further emphasise the scale of the development when viewed from ground level.

Overall, the proposed development is considered to be contrary to the Authority's adopted policies. The scale, height, form, position and design, would detract from the character and form of the original dwelling and the proposed development therefore fails to adhere to Strategic Policy C, Policy C012 and Policy C017 of the Authority's Adopted Policies, as set out within the Local Plan. In view of the above, the application is recommended for refusal.

#### **Public Sector Equality Duty imposed by section 149 of the Equality Act 2010**

The proposal is not considered to unduly affect any people with protected characteristics.

### Explanation of how the Authority has worked positively with the applicant/agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and concluded that the scheme represents a form of development so far removed from the vision of the sustainable development supported in the Development Plan that no changes could be negotiated to render the scheme acceptable and thus no changes were requested.