

From: [Edward Freedman](#)
To: [Hilary Saunders](#)
Cc: [Planning](#); [Clair Shields](#)
Subject: Thirley Cotes NYM/2018/0247/FL
Date: 18 June 2018 18:50:37

Dear Hilary

(Please clarify: I can't see an accompanying LBC application, has this been submitted? My comments are based on the impact on the listed building.)

Thirley Cotes farmhouse is listed as an early 19th century farmhouse, characteristic of plain but 'polite' architecture which replaced the local vernacular building forms during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The farm was comprehensively redeveloped at this time, with a formal four-sided courtyard complex of farm buildings constructed contemporaneously to provide barn, stables, byres and ancillary buildings. The group testifies to a prosperous farming economy in the period, and the farm buildings reinforce the historical and aesthetic heritage values of the farmhouse and exemplify the historical and architectural legibility of the site. The 1852 O/S map shows the ranges to north, east, west and south extant; the 1893 map shows the existing cart shed (proposed Rowan Cottage) in situ and a number of extensions including the extant lean-to to the western range and a small structure against the southern building which has recently supported a greenhouse.

The farm buildings largely retain their historic design externally and in terms of cellular plan form, although original fixtures such as doors, windows and ironmongery have been lost.

The farm buildings are intimately associated with the farmhouse in historical and architectural terms and ancillary in purpose. Consequently they are "part of" the listed building in terms of the 1990 Planning Act. The Act requires that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or exercise of any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

The proposed scheme of conversion would be highly detrimental to the heritage values of the listed building as a result of the degree of alteration proposed and the design of new interventions. In particular:

- * the demolition of the cellular plan form of the buildings resulting in loss of historic fabric and the legibility of the buildings and their historic function
- * the removal of substantial external walls to incorporate the later extensions which would be partially reconstructed, resulting in the loss of historic fabric and the original envelope of the earliest buildings
- * the design of the new 'greenhouse' extension which is excessively large and domestic in character
- * the treatment of openings which would erode the agricultural character of the farmyard and farm buildings
- * the unnecessary loss of fabric such as roof structures which illustrate the historic roof forms

The treatment of Rowan Cottage is acceptable, except for the glazing of the openings where I would recommend further recessing the screens to the depth of the brick pillars. In relation to the other two units I would advise the following:

- * omission of the southern range from the scheme of conversion and retention of it as communal storage for associated equipment such as bicycles and play equipment
- * omission of the 'greenhouse' extension
- * conversion of the western range as one unit, retaining historic cell divisions to accommodate the new use
- * retention of the lean-to extension to the western elevation as an open-ended covered space to provide an attractive external but sheltered dining/sitting area

* repair of the historic roof structures with exposed trusses retained internally

* consideration of the NYM Design Guide for treatment of openings, with stable doors and vent windows retained where appropriate and undivided modern glazed doors deeply recessed to the back of the opening reveals

As currently presented I would object to the application and recommend refusal.

thanks

Edward Freedman
Senior Building Conservation Officer

North York Moors National Park Authority
The Old Vicarage
Bondgate
Helmsley
YO62 5BP

*: 01439 772700

*: www.northyorkmoors.org.uk<<http://www.northyorkmoors.org.uk/>>

Please note: my usual working days are Monday to Wednesday