

North York Moors National Park Authority

Scarborough Borough Council (South) Parish: Staintondale	App No. NYM/2018/0368/FL
---	---------------------------------

Proposal: demolition of existing dwelling and outbuildings and construction of replacement local occupancy letting dwelling

Location: Hill View Barn, Downdale Road, Staintondale

Applicant: Mr T Outhart, 15 East Park Road, Scalby, YO13 0PZ

Agent: BHD Partnership, fao: Mr Neil Duffield, Airy Hill Manor, Waterstead Lane, Whitby, YO21 1QB

Date for Decision: 30 July 2018

Grid Ref: SE498974 498705

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following conditions:

1.	TIME01	Standard Three Year Commencement Date
2.	PLAN01	Strict Accordance With the Documentation Submitted or Minor Variations – Document No's Specified
3.	WPDR01	Withdrawal of all PD Parts 1 & 2 and 14 Classes A to I
4.	RSUO13	Occupancy in Accordance with NYM Core Policy J
5.	RSUO03	Domestic Outbuildings – No Conversion to Accommodation – Outside Villages
6.	GACS07	External Lighting – Submit Details
7.	GACS00	The development hereby approved shall not be occupied until the outbuildings shown on the approved plans to be demolished have been demolished and all materials removed from the site.
8.	MATS19	Roof Colouring (dark grey/black)
9.	MATS26	Timber Cladding (dwelling)(vertical timber boarding)
10.	MATS27	External Timber Cladding to be Stained Dark Brown
11.	MATS28	Timber Cladding Samples
12.	MATS00	All new window frames, glazing bars, external doors and door frames shall be of timber construction and stained dark brown, and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
13.	MATS72	Black Coloured Rainwater Goods
14.	MATS74	Flues to be Coloured Matt Black
15.	LNDS03	Trees/Hedging to be Retained (along the boundaries)

Informative

1.	Bats
----	------



North York Moors National Park
Authority
The Old Vicarage
Bondgate
Helmsley YO62 5BP
01439 772700

Application Number: NYM/2018/0368/FL

Scale: 1:1250





Application No: NYM/2018/0368/FL

Consultations**Parish – Object**

The original property was a late 1940's built, one bedroom timber bungalow known as Whitegates Bungalow and the current dwelling was built as a replacement to this following planning permission in 2009. This allowed a replacement two bedroom timber bungalow with the original chimney stack, with the footprint only increased a little. The visible walls of the replacement bungalow were timber.

The replacement dwelling now proposed is further away from the road - presumably to allow the design of the property to take advantage of the falling ground levels by facilitating the creation of a glazed north east elevation with far-reaching sea views. The proposed footprint size is approximately 75% more than the bungalow it replaces and no trace of the original building remains - the chimney has gone.

The outside walls of the two previous bungalows were horizontal timber clad - the proposal is for outside walls to be 3 foot of reclaimed brick topped by 3 foot of vertical timber cladding. Councillors struggled to think of another building in the parish which had outside walls of a similar construction and appearance.

The north east elevation is almost completely glazed which is considered to be totally alien to anything currently or previously seen on the application site or indeed in Staintondale itself.

The proposed roof will be pantiles. While pantiles may be the vernacular for Staintondale and Ravenscar, they are not for this particular site or the previous bungalows on site.

Council takes the view that replacing the existing property with one of a significantly different size, scale and design would have an adverse and detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the local area and does not accord with:

- Development Policy 21-2 by virtue of the fact the applicant has failed to demonstrate that the building is in an unsatisfactory state of repair or lacks basic amenities which cannot be provided within the existing building and its replacement would enable an unsatisfactory dwelling which is incongruous in the landscape to be replaced by one which makes a positive contribution to the landscape and character of the National Park.
- Development Policy 21-3 by virtue of the fact the replacement dwelling is not in the same position and of a similar floor area, volume and scale, and with a similar curtilage as the existing dwelling. Additionally, the applicant has failed to demonstrate that the alternative position is more suitable in landscape terms.

Highways – No objections

Environmental Health – No objections

Forestry Commission – Standing advice in relation to sites on or near Ancient Woodland.

Site Notice Expiry Date – 9 July 2018

Application No: NYM/2018/0368/FL

Background

Hill View Barn is located within the loosely scattered settlement of Staintondale, surrounded by fields and visible from the main road that leads to Ravenscar. Currently the development on the site comprises the two bed single storey timber clad dwelling, a single garage, a timber clad barn and a derelict timber building. The site slopes steeply down from the road and the buildings are at a significantly lower level than the road, but all are visible in the immediate landscape.

The current dwelling on the site was constructed in 2009 as a replacement, following the demolition of the previous property known as Whitegates Bungalow, which comprised an unattractive and run-down one bed timber clad bungalow.

The existing site is prominent in the immediate landscape and isolated from other development. Whilst the existing property is of poor quality; it is very low in height, single storey and sits relatively quietly on the hillside.

In accordance with the National Park's replacement dwelling policies, a local occupancy restriction was attached to that approval, although a planning application was subsequently approved to also permit holiday letting.

The replacement dwelling has been occupied but it has never been entirely completed, with the approved dark grey profile sheet roofing not being installed. The property became vacant and in 2017 the local occupancy restriction was varied to allow the addition of holiday letting. Whilst not wholly in accordance with the replacement dwelling policy, this was considered appropriate in this instance due to the small scale and general poor quality of the dwelling which made it more appropriate for short term lets.

This application seeks full planning permission to demolish this recent replacement dwelling and all the outbuildings, and construct a single replacement dwelling with integral garage. The proposed replacement would be sited in a similar position to the existing dwelling but would be set approximately 2m further down the slope of the land. The footprint would be significantly greater than the existing bungalow, but would extend over the footprint of the existing garage and 2m into the footprint of the existing timber barn which is to be demolished. It would not extend over the footprint of the remainder of that barn or the dilapidated barn which is also to be demolished.

The proposed dwelling would measure a total of 19.7m long (including roof overhangs) x a maximum width of 9.5m. The height of the main part of the dwelling would be the same as the existing dwelling, of 4.8m, but then steps down with the slope of the land. The lower part of the building would measure 0.8m above the ridge of the barn to be demolished.

Internally, the dwelling would comprise three bedrooms, two bathrooms, an open plan kitchen/dining area with a living room provided in a mezzanine floor above the kitchen.

The details of the proposed bungalow have been amended, in relation to the proposed materials, with the elevations being entirely clad in vertical timber boarding, with a profiled dark grey/black sheet roof. Windows would be dark brown timber, with the north east facing gable (which looks seaward) being substantially glazed, but set back under an overhanging roof.

The materials used are similar to the original building.

The applicants have requested that the use of the building remains as existing, allowing the option of either local occupancy letting or short term holiday lets.

Application No: NYM/2018/0368/FL

Main Issues**Policy Context**

Core Policy CPJ of the NYM Local Development Plan seeks to ensure the provision of a mixture of housing types and tenure to maintain the vitality of local communities, consolidate support for services and facilities and support the delivery of more affordable housing. This is to be achieved through locating all open market housing, including new build and converted units to the Local Service Centre of Helmsley and the Service Villages, as well as other measures including restricting new housing development in the Open Countryside to that which is proven as essential for farming, forestry or other essential land management activities, replacement dwellings and conversion of traditional rural buildings for residential letting and local needs.

Development Policy 21 of the NYM Core Strategy and Development Policies states that the replacement of existing dwellings outside the main built up area will only be permitted where residential use has not been abandoned, the building is in an unsatisfactory state of repair or lacks basic amenities and its replacement would enable an unsatisfactory dwelling which is incongruous in the landscape to be replaced by one which makes a positive contribution to the character of the area, and where the replacement dwelling is in the same position and of similar floor area, volume and scale. All replacement dwellings will be restricted to local occupancy as defined in Core Policy J.

Development Policy 14 seeks to ensure that new tourism development and the expansion or diversification of existing tourism businesses will be supported where the proposal will provide opportunities for visitors to increase their understanding, awareness and enjoyment of the special qualities of the National Park; where the development can be satisfactorily accessed from the road network (by classified roads) or by other sustainable modes of transport including public transport, walking, cycling or horse riding; where the development will not generate an increased level of activity; and where it will make use of existing buildings.

Material Considerations**Impact on Character of Area**

The existing building, albeit a replacement dwelling itself, has been poorly built and is incomplete; and in conjunction with the array of outbuildings, detracts from the character of the area. The proposed replacement dwelling would have a similar overall footprint as the existing array of buildings, but would be more compact and better designed, whilst still reflecting the character of this scattered settlement which has a number of small scale timber bungalows amongst the stone and pantile properties.

The Parish Council have expressed concerns regarding the glazed gable end. However, this is on the elevation away from the road, and furthermore, the glazing would be deeply set back under the roof overhang to avoid glare. There are other examples of similar development in the locality, including one which was allowed on appeal.

Application No: NYM/2018/0368/FL

Proposed Use

The existing building has permission to be occupied as either a local occupancy dwelling or a short term holiday letting unit. Permission was granted for the existing dwelling to also be used as a holiday letting unit because the building was vacant and small in scale, making it seemingly more appropriate for a short term holiday letting use, particularly due to the apparent light weight build quality and incomplete nature of the development.

Development Policy 21 restricts replacement dwellings to local occupancy use. The applicant is proposing to continue this mixed use including holiday use. However, whilst it was considered appropriate to allow a holiday use for the existing small poor quality building, it is considered that as the replacement dwelling now proposed would have much better space standards and better quality accommodation, it would be entirely suitable for permanent occupation and there is now considered to be no justification to allow development contrary to Development Policy 21.

Whilst a larger dwelling than the one it replaces, it is considered that the replacement of the existing building would result in a significant landscape improvement, particularly with the loss of the outbuildings but furthermore, it would result in a much more suitable local occupancy letting unit.

It is considered that on balance, due to the landscape improvements that would result, the current permitted use of the building, and the benefits that a better quality local occupancy letting unit would provide, the proposal is acceptable and in the spirit of Development Policy 21.

Access and Parking

The property benefits from ample parking and ample amenity space and the proposal will not have any impact on the amenity of the area through vehicular movements.

Conclusion

In view of the above it is considered that the proposal would comply with both Core Policy J and Development Policy 21 of the Core Strategy and Local Development Framework, and consequently, approval is recommended.

Contribution to Management Plan Objectives

Approval is considered likely to help meet Policy C10 which seek to ensure high quality development.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Authority's Officers have appraised the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and recommended changes to the proposal including amendments to external materials so as to deliver sustainable development.