

Sent: 01 October 2018 13:28

To: Harriet Frank

Subject: RE: Horseshoe Cottage, Cloughton NYM/2018/0400/FL

Hi Harriet

My initial comments still stand as the applicant has only looked to change the style and size of the new glazing in the east elevation. The applicant has yet to provide “*clear and convincing justification*” for harm to the significance of the heritage asset as a result of these proposals, as per the NPPF paragraph 194.

Whilst I am pleased to see that in these amended plans the two large floor-to-ceiling glazed units in the east elevation have been omitted, a new large horizontal glazing unit has now been proposed. Again, this would be very visible from the road and, notably, horizontal fenestration is not part of the historical lexicon of Court Green as a range of outbuildings. This contrasting character and visibility may still draw the eye to Horseshoe Cottage in a way in which is undesirable. The insertion of new openings in otherwise blank elevations or where there is no physical evidence of previous openings should, where possible be avoided – particularly where they are visible from public vantage points such as footpaths and roads (Design Guide Part 4 2011, 19). New openings in the east elevation should be very strongly resisted.

-
In this instance it is possible to avoid any new openings in Horseshoe Cottage and I strongly suggest that the applicant converts the existing kennel door openings in the south elevation into windows, with deep reveals.

However, if you are minded to approve the application based on these amended drawings, we could consider a very deep recess, dark frames and smoky glazing for this horizontal window. But, that said, it is the proposal to make new openings in the east elevation which is still very problematic in terms of harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset (the Conservation Area), and the applicant should look to follow the recommendation above.

We would also request that the nib of the dividing wall of the kennels remains visible within the proposed lounge.

I am very pleased to see that the wood-burning stove and flue has been omitted from these amended drawings. This is a positive change which accords with the NPPF paragraph 190.

If you are minded to approve the application, please include the conditions as previously, but omit MATS74 now that this element of the proposals has been omitted.

Thanks
Suzanne

From: Harriet Frank
Sent: 28 September 2018 11:38
To: Suzanne Lilley
Subject: FW: Horseshoe Cottage, Cloughton NYM/2018/0400/FL

Hi Suzanne

We have received amended plans for Horseshoe Cottage; I don't think you will like them but I would appreciate your thoughts.

I said I would get back to Mick next week.

Thanks

Harriet

From: Mick Paxton
Sent: 28 September 2018 10:57
To: Harriet Frank
Subject: Horseshoe Cottage, Cloughton NYM/2018/0400/FL

hi harriet -adrian sent me the note from suzzane regarding the proposed extension at the cottage and the reason for demolition originally was because to get the degree of accommodation required and requested by adrian. I have had another look and if we raise the eaves level up to match the existing cottage - or we could vary that slightly - and fit the new roof at the raised level - which is about 500mm higher and at the same pitch as the existing. to accommodate this lift the new section of wall on the east elevation could be a fully glazed window infill as shown to identify this change

would be grateful for your thoughts Harriet and think you said Suzzane is back next week - and thanks for your help with this and south beck house - regards mick

From:
To: [Planning](#)
Subject: Comments on NYM/2018/0400/FL
Date: 02 October 2018 15:33:53

**Erect single storey side extension at Horseshoe Cottage, Newlands Lane,
Cloughton**

The above application has been considered by Cloughton Parish Council and no objections are offered.

--

J Marley (Mrs)
Clerk to Cloughton Parish Council
Annan,
41 Scalby Road,
Burniston,
Scarborough
YO13 0HN

From:
To: [Planning](#)
Cc:
Subject: Bat Informatives
Date: 27 September 2018 17:18:26

Hello

The following applications could involve work to roofs, similar structures or demolition. If any are approved, please can a bat informative be issued with the consent.

NYM/2018/0578 Eustace House, Raw
NYM/2018/0546 2 Mowbray Terr, Ampleforth
NYM/2018/0553 Providence Heath, Cloughton (a reminder)
NYM/2018/0569 Whitby Holiday Park, Saltwick Bay
NYM/2018/0400 Horseshoe Cottage, Newlands Lane, Cloughton.

Thanks, Rona

Rona Charles
Ecological Adviser

Conservation Department
North York Moors National Park Authority
The Old Vicarage, Bondgate
Helmsley, York YO62 5BP
Tel: 01439 772700

Please note: Thursday is my normal working day

Horseshoe Cottage, Cloughton

Occupying a prominent roadside position and situated within the Cloughton Conservation Area, Horseshoe Cottage comprises a small single-storey stone-built residential unit with pantile roof. Formerly part of a larger outbuilding range associated with Court Green, the property is attached to a small stone-built dog kennels and runs. As part of a group of buildings, Horseshoe Cottage makes an exceptional contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area (Cloughton Conservation Area Appraisal 2011, 11), and is a building of local historical interest. It is an unusual surviving example of an outbuilding with attached purpose-built kennels and runs. The desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of Conservation Areas is enshrined in Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act), and reflected in the NPPF.

Whilst the principle of converting the roofed portion of the kennel building into residential accommodation is accepted, the detail of the proposals raises concerns.

Although not explicitly stated by the applicant, it is assumed from the wording submitted in their Heritage Statement document that they intend to demolish the existing stone-built kennels and rebuild in stone, with a pantile roof, at a new ridge height of 3.9m. Although only a small building, its survival in this context is unusual and it has value as part of the building group of Court Green as well as making a positive contribution to the Conservation Area. The applicant has not provided evidence as to why demolition, rather than conversion, of the existing building is necessary and is contra to the NPPF paragraph 194 which requires clear and convincing justification for harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset (Cloughton Conservation Area). Traditional outbuildings should be retained, repaired and re-used wherever possible and their demolition resisted (Design Guide Part 4 2011, 35). Retention of the extant kennels would be preferable and a ridge height lower than 3.9m would be favourable.

Concern is also raised regarding the addition of two large floor-to-ceiling glazed units in the east elevation of the proposed lounge. Horseshoe Cottage is constructed using coursed stone with small window apertures; in contrast, large panels of glazing would be very out of context with the external appearance of the building. In addition, glazing on this elevation would be very visible from the road. This contrasting character and visibility may draw the eye to Horseshoe Cottage in a way in which is undesirable as this part of the outbuilding was not intended to be dominant in the building group of Court Green. The introduction of these two glazed units would amount to harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset (Conservation Area). The insertion of new openings in otherwise blank elevations or where there is no physical evidence of previous openings should, where possible be avoided – particularly where they are visible from public vantage points such as footpaths and roads (Design Guide Part 4 2011, 19). A more sympathetic solution to lighting the proposed lounge would be to convert the existing kennel door openings in the south elevation into windows, with deep reveals. New openings in the east elevation should be strongly resisted.

We would also request that the nib of the dividing wall within the kennel remains visible within the lounge.

If you are minded to approve the application, please include the following conditions:

MATS02 Stone and Tiles to be Approved

MATS22 Pointing- New Development Standard Mix

MATS40 Details Plans of Window Frames Required

MATS43 Windows- Submit Details of Colour/Finish

MATS54 Trickle Vents Shall Not be incorporated into Windows

MATS74 Flues to be Coloured Matt Black

Please condition a Schedule of Materials to be Reused, wording as follows:

No work shall commence on the demolition of any part of the building to which this permission relates until a schedule has been agreed with the Local Planning Authority of those materials forming part of the building to be demolished which are worthy of reuse on the site. The schedule shall detail where the materials will be used in the redevelopment of the site. The building shall be carefully dismantled and the materials contained in the schedule shall be stored for later reuse in the proposed development of the site in the manner indicated in the schedule.

**NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL
BUSINESS and ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES**



**LOCAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY
CONSIDERATIONS and RECOMMENDATION**

Application No: **NYM18/400/FL**

Proposed Development: construction of single storey side extension

Location: Horseshoe Cottage, Newlands Lane, Cloughton

Applicant: Adrian Bury

CH Ref: **Case Officer:** Kay Aitchison

Area Ref: 4/24/192 **Tel:**

County Road No: **E-mail:**

To: North York Moors National Park
Authority
The Old Vicarage
Bondgate
Helmsley
YO62 5BP **Date:** 20 September 2018

FAO: Harriet Frank **Copies to:**

There are **no local highway authority objections** to the proposed extension as the dwelling has off street parking and an existing access onto the public highway

Signed:

Issued by:

Whitby Highways Office
Discovery Way
Whitby
North Yorkshire
YO22 4PZ

For Corporate Director for Business and Environmental Services

e-mail:

From: [Planning](#)
To: [Planning](#)
Subject: Comments on NYM/2018/0400/FL - Case Officer Miss Harriet Frank - Received from Building Conservation at The Old Vicarage, Bondgate, Helmsley, York, YO62 5BP, via email: building@northyorkmoors.org.uk
Date: 18 September 2018 12:10:39

Please see the email sent to the Planning Officer

Comments made by Building Conservation of The Old Vicarage
Bondgate
Helmsley
York
YO62 5BP

Preferred Method of Contact is: Post

Comment Type is Raise Concerns
Letter ID: 507388