

# North York Moors National Park Authority

---

District/Borough: Scarborough Borough Council  
(South)  
Parish: Cloughton

Application No. NYM/2018/0400/FL

---

**Proposal:** construction of single storey side extension

**Location:** Horseshoe Cottage, Newlands Lane, Cloughton

**Decision Date:** 23 October 2018

**Extended to:**

---

## Consultations

**Parish** – No objections

**Highways** – No objections

**Advertisement Expiry Date** – 11 October 2018

**Others** -

## Director of Planning's Recommendation

---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

**Approval** subject to the following conditions:

- 1     **Standard Three Year Commencement Date**  
The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2     **Strict Accordance With the Documentation Submitted or Minor Variations - Document No.s Specified**  
The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:  

Document Description	Document No.	Date Received
Proposed – layout and elevations		19 October 2018

or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3     **Stone and Tiles to be Approved**  
No work shall commence on the construction of the walls and roof of the development hereby permitted until details of the stone and tiles, including samples if so required by the Local Planning Authority, to be used for the external surfaces of the development (including dressings) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The materials used shall accord with the approved details and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed with the Local Planning Authority.
- 4     **Pointing - New Development - Standard Mix**  
All pointing in the development hereby permitted shall accord with the following specification - a lime mortar mix of 1:21/2 (lime; sand (sand mix of 50% sieved sharp sand and 50% builders sand)) with a slightly recessed bagged finish.
- 5     **Detailed Plans of Window Frames Required**  
No work shall commence on the installation of any replacement or new windows (and glazing if included) in the development hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details of all window frames to be used in the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such plans should indicate, on a scale of not less than 1:20, the longitudinal and cross sectional detailing including means of opening. The window frames shall be installed in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
- 6     **Windows - Submit Details of Colour/Finish**  
No work shall commence to paint the windows in the development hereby approved until details of the paint colour of the windows has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The work shall not be carried out otherwise than in accordance with the approved details, completed within six months of the date of installation and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
- 7     **Trickle Vents Shall Not be incorporated into Windows**  
Trickle vents shall not be incorporated into any new windows hereby approved and shall not be installed thereafter unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

- 8 Flues to be Coloured Matt Black  
All flues associated with the proposed development shall be coloured matt black and maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
- 9 Schedule of Materials to be Reused  
No work shall commence on the demolition of any part of the building to which this permission relates until a schedule has been agreed with the Local Planning Authority of those materials forming part of the building to be demolished which are worthy of reuse on the site. The schedule shall detail where the materials will be used in the redevelopment of the site. The building shall be carefully dismantled and the materials contained in the schedule shall be stored for later reuse in the proposed development of the site in the manner indicated in the schedule.

**Informative**

1	<p><b>Bats</b> All bats and their roosts are fully protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended by the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000) and are further protected under Regulation 39(1) of the Conservation (Natural Habitats etc.) Regulations 1994. Should any bats or evidence of bats be found prior to or during development, work must stop immediately and Natural England contacted on 0300 060 3900 for further advice. This is a legal requirement under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended) and applies to whoever carries out the work. All contractors on site should be made aware of this requirement and given information to contact Natural England or the Bat Conservation Trust national helpline on 0845 1300 228.</p>
---	---

**Reason(s) for Condition(s)**

- 1 To ensure compliance with Sections 91 to 94 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended.
- 2 For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
- 3 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 4 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 5 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

- 6 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 7 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 8 For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
- 9 In order to ensure that the development is carried out in a manner which safeguards the historic fabric of the building and to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy G, which seeks to ensure that alterations to Listed Buildings do not have an unacceptable impact on the special historic or architectural interest of the building.



---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

**Background**

Horseshoe Cottage forms part of an attractive, linear range of traditional converted outbuildings and originally was approved as a one bedroom annexe, attached to the Coach House. The unit was subsequently separated from the main dwelling and permission was granted in December 2000 for independent residential use. The whole site falls within Cloughton Conservation Area which is covered by an Article 4 (2) Direction and in accordance with good conservation practice, the buildings have retained much of their original rural character through a sensitive conversion scheme.

This application seeks planning permission for the construction of a single storey side extension. The extension will be constructed in stone with a pantile roof and timber windows.

Originally the scheme comprised an extension which introduced several new openings on the west and east elevation. However the Authority's Building Conservation Officer objected to this as it was recognised that Horseshoe Cottage is constructed using coursed stone with small window apertures and it was considered that the large panels of glazing would be very out of context with the external appearance of the building. In addition, it was considered that glazing on the east elevation would be visible from the road and should therefore be avoided.

In light of this, amended drawings were submitted with varied patterns of openings and the version with no openings on the east elevation of the proposed extension was considered to be appropriate as it was thought to respect the character of the original dwelling.

**Main Issues**

The key planning policies of consideration in this planning application are Development Policy 4 (Conservation Areas), Development Policy 19 (Householder Development) and Core Policy G.

Development Policy 4 of the Local Development Framework seeks to ensure that development within or immediately adjacent to a Conservation Area either preserves or enhances the character and appearance or setting of the area and that the scale, proportions, design and materials respect the existing architectural and historic context with particular reference to traditional buildings, street patterns, the relationship between buildings and spaces and views into and out of the area.

Development Policy 19 is supportive of development within the domestic curtilage of dwellings which takes into account the special qualities of the National Park and architectural character of settlements. Amongst other things, development will only be supported where the scale, height, form, position and design does not detract from the character of the original dwelling and its setting.

Core Policy G of the Local Development Framework seeks to ensure that the landscape, historic assets and cultural heritage of the National Park are conserved and enhanced, with particular protection being given to those elements which contribute to the character and setting of Conservation Areas.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

The comments received from the Authority's Building Conservation Officer in relation to the initial scheme are shown below.

Whilst the principle of converting the roofed portion of the kennel building into residential accommodation is accepted, the detail of the proposals raises concerns. Although not explicitly stated by the applicant, it is assumed from the wording submitted in their Heritage Statement document that they intend to demolish the existing stone-built kennels and rebuild in stone, with a pantile roof, at a new ridge height of 3.9m. Although only a small building, its survival in this context is unusual and it has value as part of the building group of Court Green as well as making a positive contribution to the Conservation Area.

The applicant has not provided evidence as to why demolition, rather than conversion, of the existing building is necessary. Traditional outbuildings should be retained, repaired and re-used wherever possible and their demolition resisted. Retention of the extant kennels would be preferable and a lower ridge height than 3.9m would be favourable.

Concern is also raised regarding the addition of two large floor-to-ceiling glazed units in the east elevation of the proposed lounge. Horseshoe Cottage is constructed using coursed stone with small window apertures; in contrast, large panels of glazing would be very out of context with the external appearance of the building. In addition, glazing on this elevation would be very visible from the road. This contrasting character and visibility may draw the eye to Horseshoe Cottage in a way in which is undesirable as this part of the outbuilding was not intended to be dominant in the building group of Court Green. The introduction of these two glazed units would amount to harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset. The insertion of new openings in otherwise blank elevations or where there is no physical evidence of previous openings should, where possible be avoided – particularly where they are visible from public vantage points such as footpaths and roads. A more sympathetic solution to lighting the proposed lounge would be to convert the existing kennel door openings in the south elevation into windows, with deep reveals. New openings in the east elevation should be strongly resisted. We would also request that the nib of the dividing wall within the kennel remains visible within the lounge.

It is considered that the revised scheme addresses the above concerns as the footprint of the existing kennels will be utilised and the two large vertical windows on the east elevation have been removed. Even though an increase to the ridge height is proposed, the ridge height of the extension will remain lower than the main building. As such, the Building Conservation team have raised no objections to the amended scheme.

The Parish Council and Highways Authority have been consulted on this planning application and have raised no objections.

In light of this, the scheme is considered to be in accordance with Development Policy 4, Development 19 and Core Policy G and planning approval is recommended.

---

**Application Number: NYM/2018/0400/FL**

---

**Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent**

The Local Planning Authority has acted positively in determining this application by assessing the scheme against the Development Plan and other material considerations and subsequently granting planning permission in accordance with the presumption in favour of sustainable development, as set out within the National Planning Policy Framework.