

NYMNPA

14/02/2019

14<sup>th</sup> February 2019  
DUR/01/17/NYM

Mr Andrew Muir  
North Yorkshire Moors NPA  
The Old Vicarage  
Bondgate  
Helmsley  
YORK  
YO62 5BP

Dear Andrew,

**PROPOSED CONVERSION OF REDUNDANT AGRICULTURAL BUILDINGS TO THREE  
NO. HOLIDAY COTTAGES AT THIRLEY COTES FARM, HARWOOD DALE**

Further to the previous granting of planning permission (NYM/2018/0247/FUL) and Listed Building Consent (NYM/2018/0499/LB), subsequent correspondence and our meeting at your offices, please now find enclosed our fresh applications for a new planning permission and Listed Building Consent.

I feel obliged to repeat our earlier position that the Listed Building Consent application is made *entirely without prejudice to our stated position that the buildings which are the subject of this proposal are not listed buildings and should not be treated as part of the listed building, Thirley Cotes Farmhouse*. I know that we disagree on this matter, but no matter. Reasonably, I feel that I can rely on the previous legal advice we received.

You may very well be aware that a draft of a revised and updated Historic Building Record has been sent from NAA Heritage Consultants to Maria Calderon on 31<sup>st</sup> January. I had hoped to have been able to provide an agreed submission with these applications as part of this submission.

Timescales, however, are such that I am now lodging these applications now and trust the scope and content of the HBR can be agreed over the next few weeks. The real pressure in terms of time stems from the current Bat Licence. We need to create the relevant roof space voids and provide the new bat habitats before the end of April. This being the case, I sincerely hope that these applications can be dealt with in an expeditious way to provide us with enough to undertake the immediately necessary work in good time.

I look forward to working with you towards a mutually acceptable solution. I believe that the revised plans from David R Bamford reflect our discussions and the issues we discussed on 15<sup>th</sup> January.

*Please* just call me if anything isn't clear or there is anything you need to discuss.

Yours truly,

Andy Rollinson

cc P Durbin  
D Bamford  
P Middleton

NYMNP

14/02/2019

## **DESIGN, HERITAGE AND ACCESS STATEMENT**

**1 FEBRUARY 2019**

### **PROPOSED BARN CONVERSION TO HOLIDAY COTTAGES**

#### **THIRLEY COTES FARM, HARWOOD DALE, NORTH YORKSHIRE**

#### **FOR P&G DURBIN PROPERTIES LTD**

##### Background to Thirley Cotes Farm

Thirley Cotes Farm is an early 19<sup>th</sup> century farm house and farm buildings, it is thought that this was developed by a local estate and it is also thought that this estate was also responsible for the development of a similar farm in the locality. The farmhouse is of a simple design which would have been intended for a yeoman tenant farmer which would have been appropriate to the farmers standing in the community but without excessive ornament. The farm buildings built round a courtyard are also of a similar period. The lack of development over 200 years suggests that the owning estate had little appetite for developing the buildings.

No doubt at some time, probably after the first world war, with the effect of death duties etc the large estates tended to be broken up and sold off. The 2009 Google earth of Thirley Cotes shows the existing buildings in their current form but there are two additional framed barns to the north of the main barn, these have subsequently been demolished.

The previous owners of Thirley Cotes Farm secured planning approval to convert the outbuildings and barns into holiday cottages and part of these approvals were built out with the conversion of the main barn into Holly, Sycamore, Oak and Willow cottages. Although these cottages received a five star rating from the tourist authority they never traded successfully and the development was purchased in March 2017 by P&G Durbin Properties with a view to incorporating the development into their existing portfolio of holiday cottages. P&G Durbin have many years experience with holiday cottages having developed a national cottage letting company which has subsequently been sold to a multinational tourism company. Thirley Cotes was identified as an exceptionally good location for this type of development.

Thirley Cotes Farmhouse is a Grade II listed building having been first listed in November 1985. The listing advises 'Farmhouse. Early 19<sup>th</sup> Century. Coursed, squared, grey sandstone. Slate roof. Central hallways plan, two rooms deep. Two – storey, symmetrical 3 – window front. Glazed, lean to porch to centre door. Sixteen – pane sashes with plain lintols throughout. Stone coped gable walls and plain kneelers. End stacks'. The listing does not mention the farm buildings but clearly appropriate consideration has to be given to the listed building.

Since purchase in April 2017 P&G Durbin Properties have set about making the development viable. The Farmhouse has been converted into a holiday let and the narrow service building to the rear of the Farmhouse has been refurbished to provide office, service and laundry facilities. Planning / Listed Building Approval

has also been obtained for additional landscape / access work which is being bought about in January – March 2018. Letting of the Farmhouse has proved a great success and the other cottages are also improving.

A meeting was held on the 2<sup>nd</sup> June 2017 at the Helmsley Planning Office with Hilary Saunders the area Planning Officer, Andy Rollinson Planning Consultant, Peter Durbin Owner and David Bamford Architect to talk through proposals for development at Thirley Cotes Farm. This included the use of the Farmhouse as a holiday let and the alterations to the landscape and access referred to above. It also considered the conversion of the remaining barns for holiday lets. In principle the Planning Authority advised that they were supportive of conversion of the redundant buildings, two of which have had previous approvals (now lapsed), providing of course the detailing of the conversions is sympathetic and appropriate.

A planning application for this cottage development was submitted and validated on the 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2018. Following negotiations, the application was approved on 17<sup>th</sup> October 2018. It was decided in early October to make a limited start on site to peripheral work excluding the buildings and bearing in mind the ecology window of opportunity. Unfortunately, a problem arose with the Archaeology survey which had been submitted in September 2018 which prevented the Archaeology condition in the approval being discharged. In view of this the Planning Authority requested a new application. The matter was made worse by the Contractor on site who had proceeded much further than intended. A meeting was held with the Planning Authority to agree a way forward.

### Object of the Application

The object of this application is to convert the remaining traditional barns at Thirley Cotes Farm into short break holiday cottages. It is intended that these holiday cottages will be professionally managed and of the highest standard. This will enhance the provision of this type of accommodation in the National Park and will therefore encourage tourism with a consequential benefit to the local economy. It will also provide the buildings with a sustainable future and generally enhance the landscape of the National Park.

### Heritage Statement

As referred to previously Thirley Cotes Farmhouse is a Grade II Listed Building constructed in coursed local stone with plain stone sills and heads, the roof is in blue slate with stone gable cappings and plain stone chimneys at the head of the roof to each gable. The lean to porch to the front entrance has been removed and there are some simple stone steps giving access to the front door. The rear of the property is almost a mirror image of the front with a central back door.

Windows to the front and rear are sixteen pane vertical sliding sash windows with single glazing. On both gables to the loft area there is a horizontal timber sliding sash window with single glazing which is typical of the area.

Thirley Cotes Farm has a substantial walled garden to the front (south) and extending to the west. This is currently largely grassed although the Google earth photograph of 2009 shows a mature hedge enclosing just

the front garden very much in line with the gable and the remaining walled garden shows some regimented trees indicating an orchard and possibly a kitchen garden. The outbuilding to the north side of this garden clearly also had a lean to greenhouse arrangement. This all suggests that this large garden was intended to provide a generous kitchen garden facility to the farmhouse which would have been appropriate.

The farm buildings which are not referred to in the listing are generally of a fairly uniform construction indicating that they are of a similar age and probably date back to the same period as the Farmhouse itself. In general they are constructed in coursed local stone under a pantile roof with cut stone gable cappings. Openings are generally plain and there is no ornament.

The group of buildings generally make a positive contribution within the North Yorkshire Moors National Park.

Buildings generally need to find a sustainable use that will allow them to be maintained for the future. Otherwise they clearly begin to fail and become derelict in a relatively short space of time. It is clearly important at Thirley Cotes Farm that all the traditional buildings should be given a sustainable use to maintain the buildings and their contribution in the landscape for the future.

### Design Statement

As can be seen from the attached photographs the remaining unconverted barns at Thirley Cotes Farm are generally in sound condition for their age. The structure of Pear Tree Cottage has been refurbished in recent years with a new roof and the masonry has been pointed. The barns to Walnut have generally not been refurbished but again the masonry is sound and the roofs are relatively true and sound although the roofs are clearly approaching the end of their lives and will require reroofing to provide a sustainable future. The walls to Mulberry are also sound and the roof structure is reasonably true and sound although at some time, probably 30-40 years ago, the roof finish has been replaced with asbestos sheeting which clearly needs to be replaced with an appropriate pantile which will clearly enhance the group of buildings.

The previous owners refurbished the Pear Tree Cottage barn as an open garage for the Farmhouse which is now therefore redundant. The north elevation is open with three brick piers suggesting that it was previously an open byre. It is proposed that these openings are infilled with glazed screens which will provide a light and attractive interior to the cottage. The northerly aspect will have some benefit in that it will receive early morning and evening sunlight which is particularly important in that holiday cottages tend not to be occupied during the day and therefore the early morning and evening is important. The glazed screens will also give access onto an attractive landscaped terrace which will be in sunlight for most of the day due to the low eaves height and pitch of the roof. It is envisaged that the roof space will be left open over the reception and kitchen area maintaining the feel of the traditional barn and maintaining the high level gable window on the east elevation. It is also envisaged that conservation roof windows will be fitted over the kitchen and dining area to bring sunlight into the living space from the south.

Walnut Cottage comprises the existing small barn to the south of the courtyard and a section of the larger barn to the south west of the courtyard. It is envisaged that the buildings will be refurbished to include refinished roofs in a matching clay pantile and repointed masonry; the existing openings are generally to be

retained with simple glazed screens. From the 2009 aerial photograph it is clear that there was a lean-to greenhouse along the south elevation and the plinth to this is existing. It seems likely also from the aerial photograph that the walled garden to the south of Hornbeam was traditionally used as an orchard and kitchen garden and therefore the greenhouse would clearly be appropriate. It is therefore proposed that the greenhouse is reinstated in engineered timber which is then opened up into the barn to provide an attractive and sunny aspect to the cottage. It is then proposed that the greenhouse concept is developed into a link between the barns and a simple glass entrance achieved without significantly affecting the appearance of the courtyard. It is again envisaged throughout Walnut that ceilings will be left open to reflect the traditional barn and expose any appropriate structure.

The approach to Mulberry Cottage is generally similar with the asbestos roof being replaced with a matching terracotta pantile, the existing masonry would be repointed and the existing openings retained. The lean-to on the west elevation has an open gable providing the opportunity for a south facing glazed timber screen to provide strong natural lighting to the dining / reception area, it is envisaged that this will be further enhanced with conservation roof windows facing west. Again it is envisaged that the roof spaces will generally be left open to reflect the historical use of the building.

It is envisaged that the three proposed additional cottages will be heated by underfloor heating using an air source heat pump arrangement which generally works well on the other barn conversions and proves to be reasonably cost effective.

All the cottages will be brought up to a standard of insulation in excess of the current Building Regulations to make them as efficient as possible; this will be achieved by lining the external walls, introducing underslab insulation, insulating the roofs and by the use of energy efficient glazing taking advantage of solar gain. Cottages will be provided with wood burning stoves which will be run using recycled, reconstituted bricketts which maximise efficiency. In reality these stoves tend to be used very occasionally.

### Access

All three cottages have level access from the car parking area throughout the cottage and including terrace areas. Cottages will have internal doors appropriate for wheelchair use and one bathroom or shower room in each cottage will be suitable for wheelchair access. Each cottage will have two designated parking spaces allowing appropriate disabled / wheelchair access.

As referred to above, two designated parking spaces are indicated for each cottage.

Close to the entrance to the development is a large refuse store with a close boarded fence and gates. Cottages are to take refuse to this common storage facility where it is collected by Contractors.

Thirley Cotes Farm is accessed off a public highway with parking and internal access within the development generally to modern standards.

## Landscape

The recent Listed Building and Planning Approval upgraded the parking facilities and site to provide six additional parking spaces for the proposed cottages, in addition it indicated re-landscaping to the access areas and the courtyard.

The landscaping to Pear Tree Cottage has already been carried out as part of the last approvals. It would clearly be sensible to incorporate a pear tree within the new planting area. Additional paving has been shown to the south and west elevation to provide a south facing terrace.

Walnut Cottage is more directly associated with the Listed Building than the other cottages. As referred to previously the Google earth photograph of 2009 indicates that the Farmhouse had a very simple modest lawned garden with a substantial mature hedge which presumably enclosed an orchard and kitchen garden with a greenhouse. It would seem fairly obvious that it would be appropriate to put back a semi-mature hedge to provide a division between the Farmhouse garden and a garden for Walnut Cottage, it would also seem sensible to locate this hedge closer to Walnut Cottage to provide a larger garden area to the Farmhouse as the more dominant building. It is envisaged that the garden for Walnut Cottage would be kept very simple with a central lawned area and shrub border with a terrace area immediately adjoining the rebuilt greenhouse structure. It would also be appropriate to put in a pathway and gate through the existing stone garden wall to provide access to the paddock area beyond which is envisaged as an amenity space for the development, the gate would save about an 140m walk through the courtyard and round the access drive and would keep children away from vehicles. Again it would be appropriate to include a walnut tree into the garden area.

Some private garden area is important for any holiday cottage and it is proposed that a similar garden arrangement is formed to Mulberry Cottage to reflect the approved gardens to the existing cottages which have a 1200mm high stone wall enclosing principally a terrace area for sitting out with some shrub borders. It is proposed that this is returned to the gable of Willow Cottage creating a small lawned area. Again it would be appropriate to incorporate a mulberry tree into the garden design.

The existing courtyard is intended as a quiet simple heart to the development and the owners are keen to discourage noisy games in this location as they could have a detrimental effect to the amenity of the cottages. Guests will therefore be encouraged to use the paddock to the west of the development for amenity space. It is therefore envisaged that the centre of the courtyard will be largely lawned with gravel perimeters adjoining the cottages with planting in old stone troughs and a stone paved pathway round to provide access.

## Drainage

The surface water drainage to the existing buildings is currently drained to a soakaway system which will generally be cleaned out and developed where appropriate.

In terms of foul drainage a new biological treatment system has been installed for the four existing cottages. It is thought however that this does not have significant extra capacity. It is therefore proposed that the existing septic tank arrangement for the Farmhouse is replaced with a full treatment system to pick up the

whole development and the outfall would then be extended through to a soakaway or through to a watercourse on site if required.

Drainage and treatment to the hot tubs has been carefully considered as although the water is 'drinkable' it contains bromine which is a powerful disinfectant that effectively kills bacteria in treatment system preventing useful operation. Advice has been obtained from Kingspan / Klargester which indicates that water from hot tubs should go to a settlement tank where the bromine can evaporate away before running to soakaway.

Thirley Cotes Farm is generally not in a flood zone.

#### Mains Services

The existing electric main into the site (which was installed in 2010) has been investigated and is of sufficient capacity for the extended development.

The mains water service into the site (which was installed in 2010) has been investigated and is of sufficient capacity for the extended development.

#### Ecology

A historic bat survey prepared for the previous holiday cottage conversion by Wold Ecology is attached with an updated survey to assess the current situation. It is proposed that the recommendations put forward by Wolds Ecology are implemented as part of the development together with an appropriate license from Natural England.

#### Archaeology

An Archaeology Survey for the development is attached prepared by Northern Archaeological Associates Ltd.

#### Structural Survey

A Structural Survey is attached by David Bamford, R.I.B.A.



NYMNPA

14/02/2019

## **STRUCTURAL SURVEY**

**(REVISED) 1<sup>st</sup> FEBRUARY 2019**

## **PROPOSED BARN CONVERSION TO HOLIDAY COTTAGES**

## **THIRLEY COTES FARM, HARWOOD DALE, SCARBOROUGH**

## **FOR P&G DURBIN PROPERTIES**

### **BACKGROUND**

The barns at Thirley Cotes Farm round the courtyard would be built with the Farm House in the early 19<sup>th</sup> Century (Georgian). The remaining barn (Rowan) built outside the courtyard may be from a slightly later date.

The farm buildings are traditionally constructed in coursed stone under a clay pantile roof supported by king post trusses, purlins and rafters.

The attached photographs provide all the principle elevations of the buildings and these photographs generally demonstrate that the buildings are in reasonably sound condition with plumb walls and level roofs.

Attached is also drawing S1 which is a measured survey with plans and elevations of the existing buildings.

Thirley Cotes Farm House itself is a grade II listed building so the barns themselves will be considered as curtilage buildings to the listed building and therefore of additional significance in the National Park landscape.

### **PEAR TREE BARN**

Pear Tree Barn is a barn with an open side to the north elevation with brick support piers and formed into four bays. As referred to previously this may be later than the other barns.

Within the last few years this building was refurbished by previous owners as a garage and a store. The roof has been completely replaced with new rafters, purlins and trusses and the walls have been repointed internally and externally. The walls are generally true and do not display any significant movement, the roof also does not display any signs of movement and is in good condition.

A timber division has been formed to one bay to form a secure store.

Clearly this building is in good / sound condition for conversion to a holiday cottage with minimal work required to the structure.

## **MULBERRY BARN**

This is the northern section of the western range of barns to the courtyard.

The external walls and crosswalls are reasonably sound for their age with some lateral movement. They are in need of repointing generally.

The roof is constructed with king post trusses with purlins. These are in reasonably sound condition but may need attention to localised rot where damp penetration has occurred.

The roof finish to Mulberry Barn in the main is asbestos sheet which probably replaced pantiles in the 1960's. This is probably a chrysotile form of asbestos which is not notifiable but clearly it would be sensible to remove it to a registered tip.

There is a lean-to projection to the west of the building which again may not be original. This has a lean-to rafter roof finished in pantiles; the roof is clearly in need of replacement although this is not structurally imminent.

The masonry to Mulberry Barn would benefit, as with most buildings of this type, from lateral ties to prevent lateral thrust from the roof pushing out the wall heads. The roof has no rafters and clearly needs full replacement.

## **WALNUT BARN**

Walnut Barn is formed from the southern section of the western barn range to the courtyard together with a small individual barn on the southern range of the courtyard.

Concerning the small barn on the south range, this is constructed as before in coursed stone under a pantile roof with rafters and purlins. The masonry is generally reasonably sound for its age with some lateral movement due to roof thrust. The roof is reasonably sound but with localised damp ingress causing some rot particularly at rafter ends and to wall plates.

The southern section of the western range is again coursed stone under a pantile roof with trusses, purlins and rafters and again the walls are reasonably sound with no evidence of significant settlement but again some lateral thrust. The roof is also sound for its age but again with localised damp penetration causing rot to the rafter ends and wall plate.

Again these buildings are sound and suitable for conversion to a holiday cottage. It is generally envisaged that the roofs will be fully replaced and finished with matching pantiles to give a sixty-year lifespan. Externally the building should be effectively pointed and a gutter and surface water drainage system should be provided as this reduces water damage to the masonry. Lateral ties should be introduced to prevent roof thrust on the external walls.

## **GENERAL NOTE**

This survey is prepared by David R Bamford (BA Hons Arch, Dip Arch, Leeds, RIBA Chartered Architect) who has been responsible for hundreds of barn conversions over a forty-year career. Relevant professional indemnity insurance is carried for all work.

14/02/2019



1. North elevation of Pear Tree Barn. This building has been re-roofed and refurbished in the last few years.
2. North elevation of Pear Tree Barn.





3. East elevation of Mulberry Barn, an asbestos roof was fitted probably in the 1960's.
4. West elevation of Mulberry Barn with an asbestos roof and a pantiled lean-to.





5. Internal view at the junction between Mulberry Barn and Walnut Barn showing the existing king post trusses which are generally in sound condition although there is evidence of damp penetration.
6. General view across the courtyard to Walnut Barn and Mulberry Barn.





7. View of the eastern elevation of a section of Walnut Barn.
8. View of part of Walnut Barn with the north elevation of the southern range of courtyard buildings.





9. South elevation of Walnut Barn, a greenhouse has been removed in the past leaving a plinth wall.