

Wendy Strangeway

From: Planning
Sent: 06 October 2016 14:17
To: Planning
Subject: Comments on NYM/2016/0692/FL - Case Officer Mrs C Ward - Received from Building Conservation at The Old Vicarage, Bondgate, Helmsley, York, YO62 5BP, Via Email: building@northyorkmoors.org.uk

There is no objection to the proposed rear alterations and the replacement, timber garage doors are welcomed. There are, however, concerns that the proposed alterations to the front and side elevation will detract from the character of the Conservation Area. The side extension is too high for its width and as such appears disproportionately vertical. The projection of the first floor plan is anon-vernacular details which creates a top heavy appearance. This is exacerbated by the timber cladding which contrasts with the ground floor stone work and there are concerns that the first floor addition will resemble a shed perched on top of the ground floor extension. This imbalance in massing is exacerbated by the tall dormer which is unjustified and impractical given that the toilet will be located inside it. The alternating dormer heights contained within the rest of the front elevation are also inappropriate. Whilst a modern interpretation of the local vernacular is acceptable this can be achieved through materials and detailing. By bisecting the eaves level and making the first floor windows taller than the ground floor windows the scheme totally inverts the local vernacular creating displeasing proportions which undermine the sense of place. This effect is contrary to the local vernacular which is cited as inspiration for the building within the Design and Access Statement. It is also anticipated that due to the tall opening window that leads onto the porch roof Building Control will require the porch to have a guard rail fitted which would not be a welcome amendment. As stated in the D&A Statement slate roofs were traditionally used on higher status buildings and architectural elements and as such the use of slate on the lower status extension is inappropriate. The building would be better enhanced if the machine made pantiles were replaced with hand-made clay pantiles and these were used throughout the scheme. Finally the D&A Statement highlights that the fascia boards detract from the building yet these are retained within the scheme. A cleaner, less confused approach to the fenestration should be adopted on the front elevation and dormers should not bisect eaves. The proportions and cladding of the first floor side elevation should be re-visited. If these cannot be improved and an ensuite is essential for the third bedroom then consideration should be given to converting the ground floor study and shower room into an ensuite facility instead. Alternatively the second bedroom could be utilised and a direct access created into a Jack and Jill bathroom. If the Authority is minded to approve the scheme please re-consult the team with regards suggested conditions. BD

Comments made by Building Conservation of The Old Vicarage Bondgate Helmsley York YO62 5BP

Via Email: building@northyorkmoors.org.uk

Phone: 01439 772700

Fax: 01439 770691

EEmail: Building@northyorkmoors.org.uk

Preferred Method of Contact is: Post

Comment Type is Object with comments
Letter ID: 466729

