

JMS

Wendy Strangeway

From: Beth Davies
Sent: 30 November 2016 16:31
To: Planning
Subject: FW: NYM/2016/0696/FL: Strong Objection



NYM/2016/0696/FL: The Manse, Thorpe Lane, Fylingthorpe

Strong Objection

The Manse is a substantial historic building situated at the heart of Fylingthorpe Conservation Area on one of the principal routes through the settlement. The name 'Manse' suggests an historic association with a local church or chapel and this association would explain the high status of the original building which is evident in the slate roof (an imported material that cost more than more readily available pantiles), finely tooled stonework and imposing façade. The plans show a chimney at one gable end and the other within the body of the house, probably providing the staircase wall. The lack of any indication of the stacks on plan makes interpretation difficult although two flues to each chimney pot indicate heated rooms to ground and first floors with the attics probably unheated. The overall plan suggests the potential presence of servants' bedrooms on the top floor which reinforces the high status of the building within the settlement.

In both architectural and historic terms the application site contributes significantly towards the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. Unsympathetic alterations have been carried out, however, which detract from the streetscape. These include the replacement of the historic windows and addition of a projecting satellite dish on the front elevation, the construction of 2 poorly detailed roof lights on the main roof which stand proud of the roof line, a poorly detailed and positioned dormer window to the rear elevation which sits at the edge of the historic extension and further low quality extensions to the rear. These alterations might explain why, despite the high status and quality of the original structure, it has not been designated as a listed building.

A significant number of dormers and roof lights exist within Fylingthorpe but in the vast majority of cases these detract from the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and serve as an example of the visual harm that can be caused by this type of development. Conversely the photograph below demonstrates how an original roof-scape devoid of visual clutter enhances the Conservation Area.



The proposed plans demonstrate that dormer windows would totally undermine the original roof slope by introducing two lower pitch rooves which appear almost as 'wings' in profile. It is considered that any dormer window on The Manse would detract from the original architectural intention of the building and undermine its historic character. Combined with the existing rooflights the dormers would also add further

visual clutter to the roofscape. By undermining the architectural and historic character of a principal building at the centre of the settlement the proposed scheme would, in turn, undermine the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Similarly the proposed continuous rear roof line undermines the architectural character and legibility of the historic building. The separation between the main roof slope and brick extension should be retained and therefore the guttering along the main roof. Removal of the existing as well as the proposed rear dormer is recommended. The existing gable plans are inaccurate and show the chimney incorporated within/sitting behind the existing dormer. This is misleading and fails to highlight that the proposed linear dormer will wrap around and therefore conceal the base of the attractive rear chimney.

Finally the proposed lobby extension is very poorly designed and detailed adding visual clutter to the rear elevation whilst adding to the sprawling mass of extensions which pays no respect to the architectural character of the existing building or the wider Conservation Area. The flue will be visible from Thorpe Lane adding further visual clutter and detracting from views through the Conservation Area to the wooded valley bottom beyond. This carbuncle should be omitted from the proposed plans.

The only element of the application considered to be acceptable is the proposed replacement of the glazed roof to the modern, rear extension with slate. The applicant should ensure that the existing wall structure is capable of carrying the weight without external modification. Slate should be of a geology to match the original roof as this will be visible from Thorpe Lane.

Beth Davies
Building Conservation Officer

Please note my normal working days are Tuesday to Thursday

North York Moors National Park Authority

The Old Vicarage
Bondgate
Helmsley
York
YO62 5BP

01439 772 700

www.northyorkmoors.org.uk

