

North York Moors National Park Authority

Scarborough Borough Council Parish: Grosmont	App Num. NYM/2010/0870/FL
---	----------------------------------

Proposal: Construction of a two storey extension to rear

Location: The Haven, Eskdaleside, Grosmont

Applicant: Mr & Mrs Kay, Mayfield, Cross Lane, Calver, S32 3XS

Agent: BHD Partnership, Airy Hill Manor, Waterstead Lane, Whitby, North Yorkshire, YO21 1QB

Date for Decision: 27 December 2010

Grid Ref: NZ 483530 505599

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Recommendation at Meeting

Consultations

Parish -

Site Notice Expiry Date - 1 December 2010.

Others - Mr P and Revd C Hemmingway, Wayside Cottage, Eskdaleside - We are very concerned with several points and have discussed some of our concerns with the applicants. Because of the close proximity, The Haven overshadows our garden. Extra height and length would further restrict light to our cottage, creating a dark, possibly damp corridor between dwellings and an oppressive high blank wall approximately 6 feet away. This could potentially create a tunnel effect. Our gable end wall would be in permanent shade all year round.

The proposed design is quite suburban with some inappropriate features such as a balcony, false windows and door.

The proposal virtually doubles the original dwelling (which was built as two small cottages), creating a 'superhome' on a very small plot. The properties in the area were mostly built in the 1880's and in some cases have been modernised, or minimally extended, but in the main visually in keeping.

We have also noticed a misleading omission on the plans of the existing dwelling: The north elevation gives the impression that the dilapidated outbuilding to the right of The Haven's timber shed is on the applicants land. It does, in fact, belong to Eskdale House.

The proposal states that this is a two storey extension but is clearly built higher to accommodate three storeys. We would have no such worries had the extension been a single storey with no usable roof space.

Application No: NYM/2010/0870/FL

Background

The Haven is situated approximately 0.5 kilometres east of Grosmont village on the southern valley slope of the Esk Valley. The dwelling is positioned within a close knit cluster of development which is set down from the main public highway at a much lower level due to the sloping land levels.

The dwelling (formerly two cottages) is gable fronted onto the road and is made up of two identical adjoining elements with the northern section set at a lower level due to the falling land levels. The property to the east (Wayside) runs at right angles to the application site with its front building line approximately in line with the existing rear gable of The Haven. Similarly to the west the neighbouring property adjoins the application site and runs on the opposite east/west axis. The area beyond the dwelling projecting in a northerly direction is included within the red line and appears to be used as a large domestic curtilage.

The property itself is constructed in a traditional manner and finished using a mix of natural stone and render for the walls and grey concrete slate on the roof. The white uPVC windows installed previously are to be removed and replaced with timber windows together with the replacement of the concrete tiles with a natural slate roof and form part of the on-going alterations to upgrade the property.

Planning permission is sought for alterations and L-shaped extensions to the property involving the demolition of the existing single storey extension on the north of the house and its replacement with a part two and a half storey, part two storeys and part one and half storey dormer combined extension. The accommodation proposes a substantial kitchen/family room required to serve the large family with a first floor bedroom and en-suite.

The extension accommodating three floors is to be attached to the existing northern gable to create a third stepped element to the host building. The extension has been set in from the east boundary to preserve the gap with the neighbouring property Wayside.

The main northern gable incorporates a traditional fenestration pattern utilising traditional windows and the central section of the north elevation incorporates a more modern element of glazing in the form of French windows and glazed opening screens.

The south elevation (road facing) proposes traditional openings with a lean-to style porch added to the central section.

During pre-application discussions Officers recommend revisions to significantly reduce the overall massing and reduce the harm currently proposed to the levels of amenity of neighbouring properties. It is anticipated that further discussions will take place to secure amended plans and that these will be received in time to report at the Meeting.

Main Issues

Development Policy 3 of the NYM Local Development Framework states that in order to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park, development will only be permitted amongst other things where a high standard of design detailing is used whether traditional or contemporary, which reflects or complements that of the local vernacular.

Development Policy 19 of the NYM Local Development Framework covers householder development and is relevant for consideration of this case.

Application No: NYM/2010/0870/FL

Main Issues (continued)

The policy states that proposals for development within the domestic curtilage of a dwelling will need to take full account of the special qualities of the Park's nine landscape character areas and architectural character of settlements and will only be supported where the scale, height, form, position and design of new development does not detract from the character and form of the original dwelling or its setting in the landscape. Furthermore, the development will not adversely affect the residential amenity of neighbouring occupiers or result in inadequate levels of amenity for the existing dwelling.

The Authority's Design Guide states that the key to a successful extension(s) lies in the respect shown to the original building so that it remains the dominant form. Irrespective of size, all buildings have a threshold point beyond which its further extension is not possible without jeopardising and possibly destroying the integrity of its original character.

The position of an extension on the property is also important and respect should be given to existing building lines, the pattern of buildings and the spacing between them and whilst the Authority acknowledges the desire to extend existing dwellings, cumulative extensions and incremental growth of a property can lead to an overdevelopment of sites. Rarely will it be acceptable to extend onto an existing extension or link existing extensions so that the form and scale of the original building are 'swamped'

In the interest of 'good neighbour' relations, care should be taken to ensure that extensions do not harm the levels of amenity that neighbouring properties might reasonably expect to enjoy.

The Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document forms part of the Local Development Framework and therefore has statutory weight and is a material consideration in the determination of planning applications.

The main issues are considered to be whether the proposal will significantly detract from the character and form of the host building and wider setting and whether the development would have an unacceptable adverse impact on neighbouring residential amenity.

Character and Appearance

The key considerations relate to the extension incorporating three floors and whether the overall length can be reduced in order that it does not exceed the length of the existing stepped sections (approximately 4.85 metres) and whether a reduction to the eaves and ridge height can be achieved such that the resulting overbearing and overshadowing impacts to the neighbouring property Wayside can be reduced to a reasonable and acceptable level.

Further amendments are sought to the east/west extension(s) as it is considered that the scale and height of the two storey and one and a half storey proposal is significant enough to detract from the original building and the overall cumulative impact of this and the extension proposed for the north gable is likely to impact on the neighbouring properties to the east and west in view of the close proximity. The suggested revisions seek to ensure the scheme will be more in line with the Authority's design approach to become subservient in terms of scale, height, form, position and design and in context with the host building and wider setting.

Application No: NYM/2010/0870/FL

Neighbour Impact

The neighbours concerns relate mainly to the extension which covers three floors proposed for the northern gable together with issues of overbearing impact, loss of light and scale. These are noted and have reinforced Officers views that improvements are necessary to ensure the impact of the development can be reduced to an acceptable level.

Officers also acknowledge that the plans do attempt to incorporate design measures to off-set the building line on the east boundary with the neighbouring boundary however it is felt that further measures are necessary to improve the residential amenity particularly for the residents at Wayside.

Planning Balance

Providing satisfactory revised plans are received which demonstrate that the proposed development can be accommodated without detracting from the character and form of the host building and without causing an adverse impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties, it is likely that the Officers will be recommending approval.