North York Moors National Park Authority

District/Borough: Scarborough Borough Council

(North)

Parish: Fylingdales

Application No. NYM/2018/0091/LB

Proposal: Listed Building consent for internal alterations including removal of

sections of wall, installation of 2 no. staircases, damp proofing and replastering works together with alterations to basement door

Location: Kings Head Cottage

New Road

Robin Hoods Bay

Decision Date: 12 April 2018

Consultations

Parish - No comments.

Site Notice Expiry Date - 4 April 2018

Others -

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Reason(s) for Refusal:

In the view of the Local Planning Authority, the proposed internal alterations, including removal of sections of wall, installation of 2 no. staircases and damp-proofing, would be detrimental to the architectural and historic character of the building due to the loss of the cellular form and loss of historic fabric of the building. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Development Policy 5 of the Core Strategy and Development Policies Document and Paragraph 132 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

	1		
Signature:		Date:	6/6/18

Page 2 List Number DOP

Application Number: NYM/2018/0091/LB

Background

Kings Head Cottage is a grade II listed building located on New Road, Robin Hood's Bay which has late seventeenth or early eighteenth century origins. The property is currently split into two maisonettes, but would have formerly been used as a single house.

Its current character is that of early eighteenth and nineteenth century, hence the property is believed to have a residual fabric encompassing architectural features from different time periods. The title of the property also suggests it was previously used as an inn, and it is this former use along with the unique layout and design which make it worthy of preservation.

This application seeks listed building consent for the internal alterations including the removal of sections of wall, installation of 2 no. staircases, damp proofing and replastering works together with alterations to the basement door.

Main Issues

The key planning policy relevant to this proposal is Development Policy 5 of the Core Strategy and Development Policies Development which only permits extensions or changes of use of a Listed Building, or the construction of any structure within its curtilage where such development will not have an unacceptable impact on the special historic or architectural interest, or the setting of the listed building.

Our internal Building Conservation Officer has been consulted in relation to this proposal and a number of concerns have been raised. Firstly, the sections of wall proposed for removal are believed to be detrimental to the architectural and historic character of the building due to the loss of its cellular plan form. The current layout possibly retains fabric of original divisions and certainly the legibility of historic arrangements as the two ground floor rooms largely retain their evident historic cellular forms. The smaller room occupies the full-height "outshut" referred to in the English Heritage listed building description and has therefore always been a separate room. Due to the evidence of the historic layout and lack of historic building appraisal clarifying historic arrangements, there is insufficient information available with this application to understand the full impact of the proposals with certainty.

Secondly, concerns were raised in connection with the treatment of the basement as the conversion of this space is believed to fundamentally alter its character by necessitating the construction of a damp-proofed and insulated box within the existing cells, wholly obscuring the evidence of multiple building phases visible within the exposed masonry walls. Furthermore, there are fears that the damp-proofing works proposed would not be effective due to the damp subterranean conditions, and could actually worsen the problem.

In light of these concerns, the applicant agreed to remove all works to the basement from the application. It was then agreed that the stub wall around the kitchen could be removed, but not the original wall between the two front rooms on 17 April 2018. Amended plans were requested reflecting the above, as well as the reinstatement of the old panel door, however the drawings weren't forthcoming. An extension of time was granted until 31 May 2018 and a

Signature:	Date:		
		6/6/18	

Application Number: NYM/2018/0091/LB

letter was sent to the agent on 22 May 2018 requesting amended plans to be submitted no later than 30 May 2018; however revised drawings were not received.

Without the necessary amendments to the application and additional supporting information from a building archaeologist being submitted, it is believed the works would result in the detrimental loss of the historic fabric of the building. The proposal would therefore be incompatible with Development Policy 5 of the Core Strategy and Development Policies Document and Paragraph 132 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Local Planning Authority has acted positively and proactively in determining this application by identifying matters of concern with the proposal and allowing the Applicant the opportunity to consider the harm caused and whether or not to amend the application to address these concerns, whilst clearly setting out the reasons for refusal.

Signature:	Date: 6/6/18