

North York Moors National Park Authority

Borough: Scarborough Borough Council
Parish: Fylingdales

Application No. NYM/2016/0404/FL

Proposal: alterations and construction of single and one and a half storey extensions and replacement garage together with alterations to highway crossing and boundary wall including erection of metal railings

Location: Hallcliffe, Thorpe Bank, Fylingthorpe

Decision Date: 27 July 2016

Consultations

Parish - No objections.

Amended Plans - A concern was raised by the Parish Council that the south east elevation looking into Kingston Field has two windows in it, they should mirror the present house windows and have eight panes. This is not an objection, but although the windows are to be re-used from elsewhere, they do not match the others facing onto Kingston Field, it might look better to have ones that match.

Highways - Recommend conditions.

Fylingdales Village Trust -

Advertisement Expiry Date - 08 July 2016.

Director of Planning's Recommendation

Approval subject to the following conditions:

1.	TIME01	The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.																								
2.	PLAN01	<p>The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in strict accordance with the following documents:</p> <table border="1"><thead><tr><th>Document Description</th><th>Document No.</th><th>Date Received</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>Location Plan</td><td>N/A</td><td>31 May 2016</td></tr><tr><td>SE & SW Elevations as Proposed</td><td>2304:8 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr><tr><td>NE & NW Elevations as Proposed</td><td>2304:9 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr><tr><td>Ground Floor Plan as Proposed</td><td>2304:6 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr><tr><td>First Floor Plan as Proposed</td><td>2304:7 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr><tr><td>Proposed Replacement Garage Elevations</td><td>2304:11 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr><tr><td>Proposed Replacement Garage Plan</td><td>2304:10 A</td><td>03 November 2016</td></tr></tbody></table> <p>or in accordance with any minor variation thereof that may be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.</p>	Document Description	Document No.	Date Received	Location Plan	N/A	31 May 2016	SE & SW Elevations as Proposed	2304:8 A	03 November 2016	NE & NW Elevations as Proposed	2304:9 A	03 November 2016	Ground Floor Plan as Proposed	2304:6 A	03 November 2016	First Floor Plan as Proposed	2304:7 A	03 November 2016	Proposed Replacement Garage Elevations	2304:11 A	03 November 2016	Proposed Replacement Garage Plan	2304:10 A	03 November 2016
Document Description	Document No.	Date Received																								
Location Plan	N/A	31 May 2016																								
SE & SW Elevations as Proposed	2304:8 A	03 November 2016																								
NE & NW Elevations as Proposed	2304:9 A	03 November 2016																								
Ground Floor Plan as Proposed	2304:6 A	03 November 2016																								
First Floor Plan as Proposed	2304:7 A	03 November 2016																								
Proposed Replacement Garage Elevations	2304:11 A	03 November 2016																								
Proposed Replacement Garage Plan	2304:10 A	03 November 2016																								
3.	MATS06	No work shall commence on the excavation works for the development hereby permitted until a one metre square freestanding panel of stonework showing the type of stone and stonework to be used in the construction of the development hereby permitted has been constructed on site and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. All new stonework shall match that of the approved panel both in terms of the stone used and the coursing, jointing and mortar mix and finish exhibited in the panel unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The stone panel constructed shall be retained on the development site until the development hereby approved has been completed.																								

H. Sainsbury
13 December 2016

 Application Number: NYM/2016/0404/FL

Conditions (continued)...

4.	MATS21	No work shall commence on the construction of the roof of the development hereby permitted until details of the type of slate, including samples if so required by the Local Planning Authority, to be used in the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The roof slate used shall accord with the approved details and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed with the Local Planning Authority.
5.	MATS30	No work shall commence on the installation of any door in the development hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details and external appearance of all external doors and frames (and glazing if included) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. All doors shall be installed in accordance with the details so approved and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
6.	MATS60	All new window frames, glazing bars, external doors and door frames shall be of timber construction and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
7.	MATS40	No work shall commence on the installation of any replacement or new windows (and glazing if included) in the development hereby approved until detailed plans showing the constructional details of all window frames to be used in the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such plans should indicate, on a scale of not less than 1:20, the longitudinal and cross sectional detailing including means of opening. The window frames shall be installed in accordance with the approved details and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
8.	MATS46	The external face of the frame to all new windows shall be set in reveals to match those of the existing windows and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
9.	MATS54	Trickle vents shall not be incorporated into any new windows hereby approved and shall not be installed thereafter unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
10.	MATS70	The guttering to the development hereby permitted shall be directly fixed to the stonework by means of gutter spikes with no fascia boarding being utilised in the development and shall thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
11.	MATS72	The rainwater goods utilised in the development hereby permitted shall be coloured black and shall thereafter be so maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.
12.	MATS26	The external elevations of the garage hereby approved shall, within three months of first being brought into use, be clad in horizontal timber boarding and shall thereafter be so maintained unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
13.	MATS00	The garage doors hereby approved shall be of a vertical boarded, ledged, braced (and framed) timber design and side hung and shall be maintained in that condition in perpetuity unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

H. Samson

13 December 2016

Application Number: NYM/2016/0404/FL

Conditions (continued)...

14.	HWAY07	<p>Unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, there shall be no excavation or other groundworks, except for investigative works, or the depositing of material on the site until the access(es) to the site have been set out and constructed in accordance with the published Specification of the Highway Authority and the following requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The crossing of the highway verge and/or footway shall be constructed in accordance with the approved details and/or Standard Detail number E6W. b. Provision to prevent surface water from the site/plot discharging onto the existing or proposed highway shall be constructed and maintained thereafter to prevent such discharges <p>All works shall accord with the approved details unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.</p>
-----	--------	--

Informatives

1.	<p>MISC INF01 BATS</p> <p>All bats and their roosts are fully protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended by the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000) and are further protected under Regulation 39(1) of the Conservation (Natural Habitats etc.) Regulations 1994. Should any bats or evidence of bats be found prior to or during development, work must stop immediately and Natural England contacted on 0300 060 3900 for further advice. This is a legal requirement under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended) and applies to whoever carries out the work. All contractors on site should be made aware of this requirement and given information to contact Natural England or the Bat Conservation Trust national helpline on 0845 1300 228.</p>
2.	<p>HWAY INF03</p> <p>In relation to condition 14 you are advised that a separate licence will be required from the Highway Authority in order to allow any works in the adopted highway to be carried out. The 'Specification for Housing and Industrial Estate Roads and Private Street Works' published by North Yorkshire County Council, the Highway Authority, is available at the County Council's offices. The local office of the Highway Authority will also be pleased to provide the detailed constructional specification referred to in this condition.</p>

Reason for Conditions

1.	TIME01	To ensure compliance with Sections 91 to 94 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended.
2.	PLAN01	For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the details of the development comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3, which seek to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the NYM National Park.
3.	MATS01	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that building materials are of a high quality and compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
4. 13	MATS02	For the avoidance of doubt and in order to comply with the provisions of NYM Core Policy A and NYM Development Policy 3 which seek to ensure that the appearance of the development is compatible with the character of the locality and that the special qualities of the National Park are safeguarded.
14.	HWAY07	In accordance with NYM Development Policy 23 and to ensure a satisfactory means of access to the site from the public highway in the interests of vehicle and pedestrian safety and convenience.

A. Sanyal 13 December 2015

Application Number: NYM/2016/0404/FL

Background

Hallcliffe is a substantial and handsome property of Georgian design situated in the centre of Fylingthorpe village and conservation area. The 'rear' elevation faces Thorpe Lane with the formal principle elevation overlooking Kingston Field; freehold area of land, left in trust by Mr Pannett, as a village green recreation ground for public use. The property is constructed of natural local stone under a blue slate roof with white painted timber windows throughout. Windows in the front 'Kingston Field' elevation are mainly eight over eight pane vertical sash windows with plain two over two or modern casement windows in the side and Thorpe Bank facing elevation. Detached from the property and northern most part of the site in the lower garden is a single timber garage and parking area.

The property has recently changed hands and the current owners wish to carry out a programme of refurbishment, alterations and extensions. In general the proposal includes extensions to the north-east facing (side) elevation and north-west facing elevation fronting Thorpe Bank, together with the construction of a replacement double garage and alterations to the access and boundary treatment.

As originally submitted, the proposals were fairly extensive in scale and whilst they were proposed to be constructed of matching materials, the extension on the road facing elevation was considered to be of excessive size and proportion which would detract from the original character and represent over-development of what is currently a small courtyard elevated above the road. Although only single storey height, the proposed side extension was not considered to respect the scale of the host property and amendments were requested.

There has been a fairly lengthy but useful period of negotiation with the applicant's agent and the scheme has been amended taking into account Officer and Building Conservation Officer comments. The large double garage has been amended from a masonry structure to a single timber clad garage with open carport attached, constructed on the footprint of the existing single garage. The proposed side extension has been reduced from a 5.6 metre to approximately 4.1 metre projection, and will be set back from the Kingston Field elevation by approximately 0.3 metres. As part of the negotiations, the side extension has been lifted from a single storey structure to a 1 ½ storey extension with the ridge height, matching the eaves of the host property. The increase in height of the side extension has allowed for a reduced mass in the extension to the Thorpe Bank elevation which has been amended from a two storey extension which obscured much of the original 'rear' elevation to a single storey lean-to glazed structure which is more consistent with the utilitarian character of this part of the house. Finally, the applicant is proposing to revise the Thorpe Bank boundary treatment by rebuilding the wall to have a single level throughout (following the gradient of the road) with black painted iron railings above.

Main Issues

The relevant policies to consider with this application are Core Policy G (Landscape, Design and Historic Assets), Development Policy 3 (Design), Development Policy 4 (Conservation Areas) and Development Policy 19 (Householder Development).

CPG seeks to ensure that the landscape, historic assets and cultural heritage of the National Park are conserved and enhanced, with particular protection being given to those elements which contribute to the character and setting of Conservation Areas.

A. S. [Signature]
13 December 2016

Application Number: NYM/2016/0404/FL

DP3 seeks to maintain and enhance the distinctive character of the National Park by ensuring that the siting, layout and density of development preserves or enhances views into and out of the site; that the scale, height, massing, materials and design are compatible with surrounding buildings; that the standards of design details are high and complements that of the local vernacular; good quality sustainable design and construction techniques are incorporated; that there is satisfactory landscaping and that the design takes into account the safety, security and access needs for all potential users of the development.

DP4 seeks to ensure that development within or immediately adjacent to a Conservation Area either preserves or enhances the character and appearance or setting of the area and that the scale, proportions, design and materials respect the existing architectural and historic context with particular reference to traditional buildings, street patterns, the relationship between buildings and spaces and views into and out of the area.

DP19 states that proposals for extensions or alterations to dwellings, or other development within the domestic curtilage will only be supported where the scale, height, form, position and design does not detract from the character of the original dwelling and its setting; the development does not adversely affect the amenities of neighbouring occupiers, or that of the existing dwelling.

The Authority's Building Conservation Officer has identified Hailcliffe as an attractive historical house of Georgian design, probably dating from the early nineteenth century. Whilst its orientation is unusual insofar as the principle elevation is away from the general public view, it is nevertheless in the heart of the conservation area with the side and rear elevations prominent in the streetscene. It is a high quality build with near-ashlar coursed masonry. Together with its symmetry, its materials are typical of houses of its era in Fylingthorpe conservation area. The original scheme was not considered to be compatible in size, scale or character with the host property and its setting, leading to the impression of over-development of the site. In particular the two storey extension between the rear elevation and Thorpe Bank road was at risk of having an overbearing impact on the road and footpath below. Similarly the proposed double garage would have a dominating and suburbanising effect on an otherwise under developed part of the site.

Very positive discussions took place between the applicant's agent and Officers leading to the amended scheme now under consideration. The garage has been substantially reduced in size and the materials amended from stone to horizontal oak cladding. The amendments are considered to be a significant improvement and are much more compatible with the site and wider conservation area setting. The revisions ensure that the structure reads as a subservient element in connection with the main house and the lightweight appearance of the combined garage and carport follows the advice contained within Part Two of the Authority's adopted Design Guide. The replacement structure would not dominate or suburbanise the host property but will add variety and interest to the streetscene, consequently the amended garage is considered to accord with Development Policies 3, 4 and 19 of the NYM Core Strategy and Development Policy Document.

The proposed extensions which have been reduced in size and significantly amended in terms of design are now considered to be of a scale, size design and position which complement rather than detract from or dominate the host property. As a result of the alterations, the extensions will appear as subservient additions and allow the retention of attractive features such as the narrow stair landing window on the rear elevation.

Application Number: NYM/2016/0404/FL

The revised extension to the Thorpe Bank elevation which now proposed to have glazed elevations and roof, is supported by the Building Conservation Officer who has identified that the glazed roof will distinguish the extension from the traditional slate roofs and enhance the lightweight appearance.

The reduced length but increased height of the side extension is now considered to be in proportion with the host property and whilst the re-use of original windows in the Kingston Field elevation has attracted concern from the Parish Council, the window design is not considered to be unacceptably harmful to the appearance of the property. The windows help to evidence the evolution of the property whilst helping to define the extension as a later addition.

Finally, the proposed alterations to the boundary treatment create a clean and uniform character where there is currently steps in the wall height, following the sloping levels in this part of the village. Whilst the Building Conservation Officer has expressed a preference for intermittent drops, the applicant's agent has submitted photographic evidence to demonstrate that the site has previously been bounded by a straight wall of significant height. On balance, the revision to the wall design is considered to be acceptable when paired with improvements to the design of the railings.

No objections have been received in connection with the proposal and the condition recommended by the Highway Authority has been included in the recommended conditions. The revised scheme is considered to be compatible with the host property and its conservation area location, in general accordance with the local planning policies listed above. Approval is therefore recommended.

Explanation of how the Authority has Worked Positively with the Applicant/Agent

The Local Planning Authority has acted positively and proactively in determining this application by identifying matters of concern within the application (as originally submitted) and negotiating, with the Applicant, acceptable amendments to the proposal to address those concerns. As a result, the Local Planning Authority has been able to grant planning permission for an acceptable proposal, in accordance with the presumption in favour of sustainable development, as set out within the National Planning Policy Framework.

J. Sainsbury
13 December 2016